R9280-1

PUBLIC EMPLOYEE COMPENSATION

A Twelve City Comparison

Second Edition

Elizabeth Dickson
George E. Peterson

An Urban Institute Paperback

THE URBAN INSTITUTE PRESS · WASHINGTON, D.C.

First edition copyright © 1980

Second edition
Copyright © 1981
THE URBAN INSTITUTE
2100 M Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20037

Manufactured in the United States of America

LC 81-53060
ISBN 87766-310-6

Please refer to URI 32800 when ordering

A/81/2M

PUBLIC EMPLOYEE COMPENSATION

BOARD OF TRUSTEES
William D. Ruckelshaus
Chairman
Katharine Graham
Vice Chairman
William Gorham
President
William M. Agee
Warren E. Buffett
Joseph A. Califano, Jr.
William T. Coleman, Jr.
John M. Deutch
Anthony Downs
John H. Filer
Joel L. Fleishman
Aileen C. Hernandez
Carla A. Hills
Richard Llewelyn-Davies
Robert S. McNamara
William C. Norris
Lois D. Rice
Herbert E. Scarf
Henry B. Schacht
John G. Veneman

LIFE TRUSTEES
Eugene G. Fubini
Vernon E. Jordan, Jr.
Edward H. Levi
Bayless A. Manning
Stanley Marcus
Arjay Miller
J. Irwin Miller
Franklin D. Murphy
Charles L. Schultze
William W. Scranton
Cyrus R. Vance
James Vorenberg

THE URBAN INSTITUTE is a nonprofit policy research and educational organization established in Washington, D.C. in 1968. Its staff investigates interrelated social and economic problems of urban communities, and government policies affecting those communities and the people who live in them. The Institute disseminates significant findings of such research through the active publications program of its Press. The Institute has two goals for work in each of its research areas: to help shape thinking about societal problems and efforts to solve them, and to improve government decisions and performance by providing better information and analytic tools.

Through work that ranges from broad conceptual studies to administrative and technical assistance, Institute researchers contribute to the stock of knowledge available to public officials and to private individuals and groups concerned with formulating and implementing more efficient and effective government policy.

Conclusions or opinions expressed are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of other staff members, officers or trustees of the Institute, or of any organizations which provide financial support to the Institute.

The research for this report was supported by the Fund for the City of New York and the Revson Foundation.

CONTENTS

Chapter One
Introduction 1

Chapter Two
Highlights of Study 13

Chapter Three
Annual and Hourly Total Compensation 17

Chapter Four
Major Components of Total Compensation 27

Chapter Five
Impact of Longevity on Compensation Comparisons 41

Chapter Six
Hours Available for Work 45

Appendix A
Sample Selection 53

Appendix B
Definition of Compensation 59

Appendix C
Components of Compensation by City 67
Boston 69
Chicago 81
Dallas 93
Detroit 105
Houston 117
Los Angeles 129
New York City 141

Philadelphia 155
Pittsburgh 167
San Diego 179
San Francisco 191
Washington, D.C. 203

PUBLIC EMPLOYEE COMPENSATION

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

Few issues in state and local finance generate as much controversy as the wages paid to public employees. A common impression that public sector workers are paid too much seems to have contributed to recent taxpayer resistance to state and local spending. Public employee groups protest that their compensation levels are exaggerated by taxpayers, and that government workers are being asked to bear the brunt of the tax revolt. The big cities offer the greatest potential for conflict because their weakened financial position and new appreciation of the long run costs of pension plans have led many local governments to restrain the wages of government workers, making them increasingly vulnerable to the rising cost of living.

This report deals with one segment of the compensation picture for city governments. It compares the total compensation packages for workers in seven specific jobs in 12 large cities, as of January 1981. Compensation comparisons between cities can be used in a variety of ways. They are frequently cited by both employers and employee organizations in judging the adequacy of local pay scales. They are often introduced by one or both sides in local wage negotiations as a measure of pay equity. Where local governments must compete with one another for municipal workers, compensation comparisons can also reveal information about the economic efficiency of the local pay structure.

For the analytical observer, reliable information on compensation is equally necessary. The impact that federal grants-in-aid or state spending limitations have on wages is a matter of wide concern. Officials in several states have gone on record as determined to trim the cost of doing public sector business. How much of this trimming will be borne by government workers through wage adjustments, and whether these adjustments will close the geographic gap in tax rates, are important to the future of cities. A reliable comparative compensation data base should also make it possible to analyze such policy questions as the trade-off between public sector wages and pensions, the effect of pay structure on the recruitment

and retention of public sector workers, and the impact of public employee wage changes on big city financial conditions.

The perceived needs for comparative compensation data have led to an outpouring of compensation studies. Individual labor organizations and professional associations frequently publish salary comparisons by job titles. Some state and local governments have undertaken compensation surveys over limited geographic areas or have purchased comparisons from private consultants. The federal Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS) provides compensation information for public workers in major cities and for the private sector generally.

Despite the number of compensation comparisons, employer and employee organizations have expressed considerable dissatisfaction with the available data. The primary concerns have been:

- The data are often generated from sources considered to have a special interest in supporting labor or management positions;
- The data often fail to reflect compensation costs other than wages and salaries;
- When the data do measure compensation components other than wages and salaries, they often fail to give these consistent or comparable treatment;
- Pension costs, in particular, are handled inconsistently in most studies, or not recognized at all;
- The comparisons do not involve the particular job matches or jurisdictions of primary interest to potential users.

In recognition of these concerns, The Urban Institute for the past several years has carried out a project designed to improve municipal worker compensation comparisons between cities. This work was initiated at the request of management and labor leadership in New York City. It has involved close cooperation with management and employee groups in each of the other cities covered by the study. Funding for the study was provided by the Fund for the City of New York and the Revson Foundation.

This edition is the second of a series of reports to be issued by The Urban Institute on public sector compensation in U.S. cities. The first edition, which compared compensation for the same 12 cities as of January 1, 1979, was published in the winter of 1980.[1]

---

1. Elizabeth Dickson, Harold A. Hovey, and George E. Peterson, *Public Employee Compensation: A Twelve City Comparison* (Washington, D.C.: The Urban Institute, 1980).

PURPOSE OF THE REPORT

One objective of the present study is to develop and publish city compensation data that will be of immediate use in the cities covered. The basic data are being released now at the request of management and labor officials in several cities who feel that timeliness is crucial if data are to be used for wage negotiations. Much of the interpretation and analysis of the compensation data has been left for later publications.

Another objective of this report is to continue to improve upon and test the methodology for total compensation comparisons. In updating the study, we sought to demonstrate that such comparisons can be made acceptable to users and feasible to implement at reasonable cost. As a result, certain methodological changes were introduced, particularly in measuring pension costs. These changes are explained in detail below and in chapter 4. They limit the direct comparability between pension cost estimates in the earlier study with this study.

The usefulness of compensation comparisons depends, above all, on the accuracy of the compensation data collected. For the 1979 report, Urban Institute researchers visited each of the 12 cities in the study to match job descriptions (see Appendix A) and to secure information on salary levels, benefits, pensions, and hours worked. For the 1981 updates, nine of the 12 cities were revisited while the remaining three were contacted by phone. Consultation often took place with both management and labor groups. Subsequent correspondence with public officials and with employee representatives clarified salary and benefit details. Appendix C presents the detailed information collected for each city and each job title in the study for 1979 and 1981.

To guarantee accuracy, the local data summaries for both 1979 and 1981 were sent to local officials and employee representatives for confirmation. Beginning in the fall of 1979, after a draft report of the first edition had been completed, the study team presented the findings to management and labor groups in Boston, Los Angeles, New York, and Philadelphia. Copies of the draft report were circulated to all parties in all cities who had participated in the data collection, as well as to other public officials and public employee organizations. The report was also reviewed by a national advisory group. Although a report drawing upon as much information as this may still contain errors, the authors are confident that interested parties in each city have given it exhaustive review and that all questions of factual accuracy which have been raised have been resolved.

LIMITATIONS OF STUDY

The report adheres to certain perspectives throughout, which should be kept in mind when the study is used. These are discussed in more detail later, but deserve emphasis at the outset.

First, the compensation figures represent the *employer's cost* of providing salary and benefits. By and large, these employer costs also approximate the value to the employee of the compensation package, but the two are not identical. For any given employee, personal circumstances such as health and number of dependents will make benefits more or less valuable than they seem to other employees. In addition, part of the cost of providing some benefits, such as Social Security payments to be made in the future, may be spread over the population at large, rather than divided between the employer and the employee. These benefits of employment are included only to the extent they involve employer costs. Similarly, the tax status of pension benefits and employee contributions makes considerable difference in the value of the compensation package to the employee, but it does not directly affect the costs of the employer and is, therefore, not reflected in our compensation figures.

Second, local public compensation is compared only with that in other central cities. This report does not compare local wages with those prevailing in the private sector of the metropolitan area, with wages for the same public jobs in other jurisdictions within the metropolitan area, with queues of qualified applicants for public positions, or with local government ability to pay. Any or all of these comparisons might be judged appropriate in gauging the economic efficiency and fairness of compensation levels, and some of the comparisons will be made in future Institute publications. This study, however, deals with a single issue—the comparison of total compensation for selected job titles in different large central cities.

Third, although at many points in the report we have added wages, supplemental benefits, and necessary pension contributions to reach "total compensation," the pension element of this figure is conceptually different from other elements. It is the annual cost the employer *would* face under a uniform funding method to fund current pension obligations fully under certain assumptions about future economic performance, assuming that the local experience with withdrawal rates, disability, etc., is continuous. We have made uniform and reasonable assumptions about future economic events, and this makes the pension costs comparable from one city to the next. However, the future is unknown, and the absolute levels of employer cost necessary to fund pension obligations may therefore vary from those assumed.

Fourth, this study does not measure the costs of workers in relation to their output. A park maintenance worker could be twice as productive in one place as another without affecting our compensation numbers in any way. More expensive wage and benefit packages may be cost effective, if such packages succeed in attracting or retaining more productive employees or stimulating workers to greater output.

SUMMARY OF STUDY APPROACH

The jobs covered in this study are police officer, firefighter, typist B, general stenographer, refuse collector, janitor, and park worker. These jobs involve substantial numbers of workers in the cities studied and thus reflect the types of compensation decisions that have a major impact on municipal budgets. They represent both uniformed and nonuniformed services, as well as direct services and office functions. Although the positions were selected to be representative of city government labor forces at middle and lower salary levels, it is not known how well the compensation levels reported here can be generalized for other municipal positions. The jobs chosen do not represent the higher paid jobs or managerial positions in city labor forces.

Job definitions are uniform throughout the study. This made it possible to compare workers in similar positions in the 12 cities, regardless of the job titles used by each city. Standardized job descriptions, as well as the number of persons in each city in each job class, are spelled out in Appendix A.

The cities covered in the study are Boston, Chicago, Dallas, Detroit, Houston, Los Angeles, New York, Philadelphia, Pittsburgh, San Diego, San Francisco, and Washington, D.C. With the exception of San Diego, these are the central cities of the largest Standard Metropolitan Statistical Areas in the nation in 1977. San Diego was added to the study to provide one more Sunbelt city. St. Louis would have been included but was omitted because of difficulties in obtaining local data. The selection logic was based upon the interest many potential users of the data expressed in central city comparisons and in national coverage.

The basic compensation comparisons are for annual salaries and benefits as defined on January 1, 1981. Different cities operate on different fiscal years (January through December and July through June being the most common). For this reason, the next salary adjustment may be nearer for some cities than for others. A January date has the advantage of capturing the compensation totals in effect for fiscal 1981 in all cities and was recommended as the basis for comparison by the study's advisory group. A longer term perspective on compensation would look at local compensation trends as well as the compensation levels that exist as of a

certain date. Althought the study was unable to collect complete information on total compensation trends over time, local *wage* trends and changes in pension benefits are discussed in chapters 3 and 4.

Compensation comparisons were made for workers with three different periods of service—one year, five years, and 20 years. This range shows differences among cities in the treatment of seniority and how intercity comparisons would be affected by the worker's assumed length of service. Where payments are adjusted for the individual's educational or other characteristics, uniform "standard" employees were compared in all cities. That is to say, our standardized worker was endowed with the most common educational experience. (No B.A. was assumed for uniformed employees.) The employee was also assumed to have two children for the purpose of costing out health insurance.

One of the most original aspects of the study is the treatment of pension costs. Cities vary markedly in the amount which they pay into pension funds during an employee's career. Some put in almost nothing, opting to finance benefits when they are paid to the employee; others contribute enough to cover accruing liabilities; and some contribute enough to cover accruing liabilities and catch up on past accrued liabilities. As a result, the amounts paid in a given year for pensions by two cities are not likely to reflect the relative costs of pension benefits accrued in that year, and can provide quite misleading estimates of the relative costs of compensating current workers.

To avoid this problem, this report incorporates actuarial normal pension costs for each city using a consistent funding method and excluding any payments associated with past unfunded liabilities. This methodology uses each jurisdiction's retirement benefit structure and benefit use patterns while using nationally uniform assumptions about rates of future salary increases and interest on pension fund investments. Throughout the main portions of the study, local rates of withdrawal, retirement, etc., are used in estimating pension costs.

The pension cost estimates of the study are believed to provide the first comparable estimate of the cost to the employer of providing retirement benefits in each of the cities. They are actuarial costs representing what the city would pay into the pension fund in each year of the individual's employment to cover the city's share of the costs of pension benefits when the employee retires. Because of the special interest in incorporating the pensions into total compensation comparison, chapter 4 deals with the pension methodology at length.

A second contribution of the study is its identification of standard hours worked for each job in each city. Once standard work hours are identified,

total compensation costs can be converted to a cost per hour—perhaps the most useful form for comparing compensation costs between cities.

Because different types of compensation comparisons are appropriate for different purposes, many of the results are presented in alternative ways. For example, the report presents data on compensation adjusted and unadjusted for city cost-of-living differences, shows both hourly and annual compensation comparisons, and shows compensation comparisons at the entry, five year, and 20 year experience levels.

USE OF THE DATA

Some readers of this report will wish to make their own assessments of the reliability of the data for the uses they contemplate. Many readers, however, will probably wish to use the data without extensive review. For those users, the following paragraphs summarize the view of the Institute's staff on appropriate uses of the data and their general reliability for those uses.

Use of Data in Setting Compensation Levels. This report deals with what city governments *are* paying their workers, not what they *should* be paid. Many labor and management representatives engaged in the work of setting compensation levels believe that comparisons with other jurisdictions should influence local compensation decisions. Sometimes this view is incorporated in the legal basis for setting compensation levels. However, many other factors can go into compensation decisions. Wages and benefits might be selected for their efficiency in recruiting and retaining the desired public work force. Or compensation levels might be set to satisfy concepts of minimum living standards. We are confident that the data in this report, for the time periods, cities, and jobs covered, provide more accurate data than have heretofore been available on comparative compensation and that persons in the jurisdictions covered can use the data in the compensation setting process where such comparisons are judged desirable. Moreover, the methodology for costing out total compensation is equally applicable, whether the ultimate purpose is to compare big city pay or to compare central city pay with that of suburban jurisdictions or private employers.

To use the data in this report for compensation comparisons with jurisdictions not covered by this study is less simple. Persons wishing to compare their own data with those of the 12 cities should make very sure that their local data conform to the methodology used in this study, particularly in the measurement of hours and in the assumptions and funding methods for pensions. It should also be kept in mind that large cities generally have higher salary levels for both private sector and public sector workers

than do smaller jurisdictions. With these provisos, the data presented here may serve as a convenient reference point for more general public compensation comparisons.

The data on standard hours worked—and therefore the calculations of total compensation per hour—inherently possess some ambiguity. Annual costs are founded on actual financial transactions, such as payments to individuals and to insurance carriers. The data on such transactions are relatively good. Calculations of hourly costs require not only these data but also information on the number of hours actually worked. No methodology that we know of, short of covert observation over significant periods of time, will fully capture informal practices of reporting to work early or late, taking extended or shortened lunch periods, or enjoying informal breaks during the working day. A good part of the systematic variation between cities in work schedules, however, is formalized in labor contracts, departmental regulations, or state or local law. We found that standard work periods often varied more across cities than did annual pay levels. We therefore devoted special attention in field visits to clarifying work arrangements, where they have been incorporated into contracts or other formal arrangements. We believe that the study marks very substantial progress in identifying differences in work schedules and leave time and therefore in employer costs per standard hour of work.

Use of Data to Measure Total Employer Costs. There are certain factors in personnel administration which will affect the total labor bill of a jurisdiction that are not taken into account in compensation comparisons of selected individuals in selected jobs. One of these is the maturity of the work force. Two jurisdictions with identical salary scales and identical supplemental benefits can have different total compensation costs for their work forces if one jurisdiction has a larger proportion of older workers who have received longevity increases in compensation, and who are more likely to receive retirement pay. Total labor costs per worker obviously depend, too, on the number of employees in higher paid and lower paid job titles and on the frequency of promotion. Other studies have shown that these factors are at least as important as wage levels in influencing personnel costs and growth in these costs.[2]

Use of Data by Employees Comparing Jobs. There are two important caveats in the use of these data by employees comparing the advantages of different jobs. First, the data do not deal with the probabilities of promotion. All comparisons are made for specific positions. A comparison

2. See, for example, Jan M. Chaiken and Warren E. Walker, "Growth in Municipal Expenditures: A Case Study of Los Angeles," N-1200-RC (Santa Monica, Calif.: The Rand Corporation, June 1979).

of compensation for police officers having 20 years of experience is directly relevant to someone who expects to be a police officer 20 years after entering employment in that job. However, it provides no information on the probability that an entering police officer will, within 20 years, be promoted to another job, such as police sergeant. Promotion probabilities are important in assessing the lifetime attractiveness of a job.

Second, all of the costs of supplemental benefits are measured from the standpoint of cost to the employer—which is not necessarily the same as value to the employee. For example, an employee with a large family may value employer-financed health and life insurance benefits very highly, while another employee may be more oriented toward current cash compensation. Highly mobile workers place less value on pension benefits that can be earned only after 20 years of service than workers who foresee permanent employment. Employer costs of supplemental benefits depend, too, upon the frequency of local utilization. The same disability retirement provisions may cost twice as much in city A as in city B, if disability retirement rates are commensurately higher. Employee groups may or may not view the disability package in city A as being more valuable to them, depending upon whether the higher disability rates result from greater hazards of duty or less strict standards of eligibility for disability retirement. Adjustments of the reported compensation data therefore may be appropriate either for individual workers comparing compensation received, or for employee organizations seeking to compare the average value of the compensation package for a particular set of employees.

DIFFERENCES BETWEEN 1981 AND 1979 REPORTS

The overall methodology used to cost out the value of compensation elements has remained the same between 1979 and 1981 with two exceptions—pensions and retiree health benefits. Because of changes in the means of estimating the costs of these two elements, total compensation costs are not fully comparable between the 1979 and 1981 reports. In addition, individual cities have occasionally reported data elements differently between the two years. All cost elements which are not comparable between 1979 and 1981 have been identified by an asterisk in Appendix C, and explained in footnotes.

The pension methodology used in this study differs from the previous approach in two ways. First, it reports the normal pension cost associated with the actual employee population under a given local pension plan. This is in contrast to the previous methodology, where normal pension costs were reported for a hypothetical employee assumed to enter employment at age 21. The entry age 21 assumption was found to understate actual average entering ages and to understate pension costs for employ-

ees with later entering ages. Under the new methodology the reported pension costs reflect the actual entry-age mix of each local pension plan, eliminating the need to arbitrarily designate a "hypothetical" entry age. Local employee representatives and city officials who reviewed the first study were unanimous in recommending that normal pension costs for the actual local work force would be more valuable as the pension component for total compensation.

The second difference between the two pension methodologies is that the current methodology assigns the same normal cost (as a percent of salary) to all job titles falling under the same local pension plan. (For example, typist, stenographer, janitor, refuse collector, and park worker frequently are included under one "general member" pension plan.) The previous approach treated each job title separately and often attributed different probabilities of retirement, withdrawal, etc., to individual job titles, based in part upon the sex distribution of employees in different jobs. Local officials and local employee representatives recommended this change, as well.

The methodology for retiree health benefits has also been adjusted to reflect more typical entry age experience. More detailed descriptions of the methodological changes, the current pension methodology, and the impact of the changes on costs can be found in chapter 4.

The 1981 report also goes beyond the 1979 report in its coverage of salary trends. As of winter 1981, about half of the 12 cities had already established FY 1982 wage levels for at least some of their job titles. Appendix C of this report presents entry level salary trends as of January 1 of each year, from 1973 to 1982 (where data are available).

The 1979 data reported in Appendix C have been corrected for any errors or improved information uncovered in the updating process. Except for these changes,[3] which have minor cost impacts, the 1979 data are identical to the data published in the 1979 compensation study.

---

3. Changes for 1979 data are as follows: (1) sick leave for Boston park worker and janitor changed from 11.4 days to 10.1 days and 15 days respectively, (2) sick leave reimbursement for Detroit nonuniformed titles changed slightly for nonuniformed entry and five year employees, (3) Detroit fire line-of-duty absence days reduced from 25.24 to 13.98 days based upon improved local data, (4) Houston police/fire vacation days for 20 year employees reduced from 27 to 22 days for police and from 30 to 24.44 10.8-hour days for fire, (5) three-day increase in total days worked for Los Angeles police with 20 years of experience, (6) elimination of obnoxious pay differential for refuse collectors in Los Angeles, since this was already included in base salary, (7) New York City medical line-of-duty payments for civilian employees increased from $11 to $30, (8) San Diego daily hours worked for police increased from 8 to 8.33 to reflect 20 minute line-up and assignment period, (9) San Diego workmen's compensation retirement benefits are counted as zero for entry level employees, (10) San Francisco sick leave reimbursement eliminated for 1979, to reflect law passed in 1978, (11) San Francisco workmen's compensation retirement benefits were added to pensions rather than being considered as an offset.

All of the 12 cities cooperated in providing and verifying data for the 1979 report. For the 1981 updated version, San Diego chose not to review the data in this report. Los Angeles did not provide or confirm data. The updated Los Angeles data were obtained mainly through union officials, with verification in the form of written contracts. Finally, 1981 pension costs for Boston were estimated since the city did not provide pension information in the form requested. (See Appendix C, Boston footnotes.) Although these adjustments complicated the data collection process, we believe they do not create significant problems of accuracy.

The study underlying this report was performed under the direction of George Peterson, the director of public finance studies at the Institute. Elizabeth Dickson was the project manager and primary author of the report. Typing and research assistance were provided by Carolyn Estey.

CHAPTER TWO

HIGHLIGHTS OF STUDY

OVERALL COMPENSATION COMPARISONS

Most of the value of this report lies in its detail. Cities that rank near the top or bottom in compensation levels for one job do not always do so for other jobs. The relative importance of different elements of the total compensation package varies greatly from one city to another and from one job to the next. For these reasons, generalizations about comparative compensation need to be severely qualified.

Between cities, all of the jobs show major variations in annual total compensation, ranging from a low of 43.5 percent variation around the average compensation for general stenographers to a high of 57.3 percent variation around the average compensation for refuse collectors. All compensation comparisons are for five year workers as of January 1981. The reported figures measure the employer's cost of providing wages and supplemental benefits.

Some persistent compensation patterns do emerge. For all seven jobs covered in this study, Detroit has an annual total compensation well above the 12-city average and Los Angeles and San Francisco have compensation levels above average in each case. Boston and Dallas are below average for all jobs. Other cities display special compensation patterns. Thus, New York City's annual compensation for police officers and firefighters is above average, but is below average for typists, stenographers, janitors, and park workers. While Los Angeles and San Francisco have above average compensation for all jobs, the pay advantage is greatest for uniformed workers. On the other hand, in Pittsburgh, total annual compensation is relatively higher for nonuniformed workers than for police and fire employees.

When comparisons are converted to compensation per standard hour worked, New York City and Boston move up in the rankings. This occurs because there are fewer hours available for work in the standard work week of these cities.

PENSIONS

Pensions are the most important element of supplemental benefits. The study makes a careful effort to place city pension costs on a comparable basis. Some cities now make pension fund contributions which seek to cover the full costs of an employee's present service plus compensate for failures to fund pension obligations in the past. Other cities do little more than contribute enough to their pension funds to pay retirement benefits to those who already are retired. The result is a vast disparity in current cash contributions to pension funds.

Previous studies have sought to include pensions as part of the compensation package by simply adding current employer pension contributions to wages and salaries. Unfortunately, these current contributions bear virtually no relation to true normal cost. One of the main contributions of this study is to estimate city pension costs through actuarial projections for each pension system, using uniform assumptions about future economic events and local rates of utilization of pension benefits.

HOURS OF WORK

The hours for which an employee is available for work can be as critical as compensation in affecting the employer's cost per hour. Differences in scheduled work weeks, vacation and personal leave, holidays, sick and injury leave, and paid lunch periods result in major differences between cities in time actually worked. For firefighters, standard hours worked in a year, excluding overtime, ranged from a high of 2,552 in San Diego to a low of 1,700 in New York City. For refuse collectors, the difference ranged from a high of 1,940 in Chicago to a low of 1,568 in New York City.

Hourly compensation, which divides annual total compensation by the number of hours an employee is actually available for work, is suggested by the report to be the most useful single measure of employer costs. City differences in work periods, on balance, widen differences in compensation levels, but also alter significantly the relative standing of cities.

ADJUSTMENTS FOR COST OF LIVING

From the employee's perspective, the real purchasing power of the compensation package may be more meaningful than its nominal magnitude. Chapter 3 adjusts annual and hourly total compensation for local differences in the cost of living, as measured by the Bureau of Labor Statistics. For 1980, the last year for which data are available, the living costs for an intermediate budget family in Boston and New York City were, respectively, 17 percent and 16 percent above the all urban average, while those for the least expensive city, Dallas, were 10 percent below

that average. Adjusting compensation for differences in cost of living, which is advocated by some observers but not others, tends to reduce relative compensation in Boston, New York City, Washington, D.C., San Francisco, Philadelphia, and Chicago, and to increase relative compensation in Pittsburgh, Los Angeles, San Diego, Houston, and Dallas. Detroit's living costs are equal to the all urban average.

RECENT COMPENSATION TRENDS

It was beyond the resources of this project to create a consistent set of total compensation comparisons for past years. The report does provide information on trends over the last eight years in entry level salaries and employer pension costs.

Recent compensation growth rates differ markedly from relative compensation levels as of 1981. San Francisco and New York City—cities which rank second and fourth in 1981 total compensation for safety workers—rank tenth and eleventh in terms of recent salary growth. Dallas, in contrast, has below average police and fire compensation levels, but considerably above average growth rates. Although the data suggest a convergence between cities in compensation levels, they also highlight local differences in compensation trends that place the 1981 comparisons in better perspective.

LONGEVITY

Virtually all municipalities reward length of service with greater pay, but cities differ dramatically in the extent to which they compensate service experience. Twenty year police officers receive 24 percent more compensation than entry level workers of the same rank in Dallas, but 67 percent greater compensation in Washington, D.C.

The sensitivity of compensation rankings to experience level means that the period of service selected for compensation comparisons should be chosen with care. Preferably, comparisons should be made for several longevity levels to fully capture cities' compensation policies.

USES OF COMPARISONS

The Urban Institute does not maintain that compensation comparisons should provide the only basis for decisions about municipal compensation, or even that intercity comparisons are necessarily compelling evidence for appropriate compensation levels. However, extreme variations between cities in such elements of compensation as available hours and pension costs suggest the possibility that some benefits may be out of line with general practice, either on the low side or the high side. While these

comparisons do not provide answers, they raise questions that can only be answered locally. It is our impression that the true costs of certain elements of the compensation package are frequently not fully appreciated either by management or labor organizations, suggesting that in some cases it may be possible to restructure the compensation package to mutual benefit.

CHAPTER THREE

ANNUAL AND HOURLY TOTAL COMPENSATION

This chapter presents summary comparisons of total compensation for the jobs and cities covered in the study. Total compensation is measured on both an annual basis and an hourly basis, with and without adjustments for local cost of living differences. The final section provides some basic information on recent rates of growth in employee salaries.

Both annual and hourly compensation measures have appropriate uses, but for most purposes the hourly comparisons probably are more informative. They contain an important piece of information—the number of hours worked in a year—that is missing from the annual compensation data. Hourly comparisons thus standardize annual compensation over the period of time actually worked.

The last section of the chapter adjusts compensation totals for differences in the local cost of living. The adjusted numbers may provide a more appropriate comparison for readers interested in determining the value to the employee of city compensation. The tables in this chapter are all for employees with five years of experience. Total compensation for employees at other service levels is treated in chapter 5.

ANNUAL COMPENSATION

Table 1 provides an overview of city annual total compensation by job classification. Because these jobs represent different fractions of the total municipal labor force in each city, the combined ranking of cities for the seven jobs is not uniquely defined. In addition, it is not known how well compensation for the jobs that are covered in the study reflects compensation for other city positions not covered.

The table shows considerable variation from city to city, particularly for refuse collectors, where compensation in the highest paying city is almost twice as much as in the lowest paying city. It should be noted that the ranking of cities varies depending upon which job titles are examined. Cities ranking relatively high on compensation for uniformed employees,

TABLE 1

ANNUAL TOTAL COMPENSATION, FIVE-YEAR LEVEL, 1981[a]

City	Police Officer	Fire-fighter	Typist B	General Steno-grapher	Refuse Collector	Janitor	Park Worker
Boston	$27,101	$26,865	$12,061	$12,402	b	$13,746	$13,805
Chicago	27,346	28,006	13,922	15,308	22,832	17,457	18,127
Dallas	24,934	24,879	13,005	15,078	12,853	12,221	12,464
Detroit	34,443	34,715	18,997	19,221	22,926	20,415	22,012
Houston	31,104	30,042	13,134	16,331	19,601	13,925	17,503
Los Angeles	39,109	38,948	16,250	17,417	20,773	16,350	20,115
New York City[c]	33,216	34,324	14,536	14,536	d	14,310	15,605
Philadelphia	26,248	25,517	15,745	16,490	17,262	16,812	17,309
Pittsburgh	26,517	25,112	14,741	15,536	24,343	16,021	17,402
San Diego	26,629	24,789	14,956	15,983	d	14,930	15,497
San Francisco	37,893	37,959	15,018	15,618	b	17,840	22,251
Washington, D.C.	31,891	32,006	12,715	14,199	19,957	16,089	b

a. Total compensation includes costs for wages, shift differential, insurance benefits, retirement benefits, and miscellaneous benefits, buy does not include overtime or holiday pay.

b. Workers performing this function are not city employees.

c. Pay for holiday work is legally considered part of base wages in New York City. Holiday pay is not included in New York City's total compensation in the table, however, in order to maintain comparability across cities.

d. Refuse collectors in New York City and San Diego also drive trucks. Thus, the job match is not strictly comparable. Total annual compensation for refuse collectors in New York City in 1981 was $27,716 and for refuse collectors in San Diego, $20,559.

for example, do not necessarily rank high when nonuniformed titles are compared.

HOURLY COMPENSATION

Table 2 converts the total compensation comparisons to an hourly basis. The hourly rates give employer compensation costs per hour of standard time actually worked. They are produced by dividing annual total compensation, as given in table 1, by total annual hours available for work, as detailed in chapter 6.

From an overall perspective, perhaps the most interesting aspect of table 2 is that for most jobs the hourly compensation differentials between cities are greater than the annual compensation differentials reported in table 1. Differences in the hours assigned to work widen, rather than narrow, the compensation differences between top-ranked and low-ranked cities.

More importantly from the perspective of individual cities, introducing the hourly compensation measure significantly alters the ranking of cities in many instances. These differences are most dramatic for firefighters, where work schedules are not consistent across cities. For example, Los Angeles, the top-ranked city for firefighters in table 1, shows hourly compensation which is lower than that of New York City, San Francisco, and Detroit. Important disparities between total compensation and hourly compensation comparisons exist for other job titles as well.

TOTAL COMPENSATION ADJUSTED FOR LOCAL COST OF LIVING

For local public officials, municipal employees, and local taxpayers, the most natural way to express compensation totals is in ordinary dollars. Within the local market, a dollar figure for public worker compensation can be related to the total compensation of other workers. It is the local wage bill, in actual dollars, that must be financed from local tax collections.

From a national perspective, however, it may be appropriate to adjust compensation in different cities for differences between localities in the cost of living. The value of the compensation package to the local employee depends upon its real purchasing power. Two employees in different cities may be deemed to have equal real compensation only if they can purchase equivalent bundles of consumption goods. To the extent that big city compensation comparisons are intended to capture these differences in worker buying capacity, it is appropriate to adjust local compensation

TABLE 2

HOURLY TOTAL COMPENSATION, FIVE-YEAR LEVEL, 1981[a]

City	Police Officer	Fire-fighter	Typist B	General Steno-grapher	Refuse Collector	Janitor	Park Worker
Boston	$17.46	$15.57	$ 7.84	$ 8.06	b	$ 9.09	$ 7.80
Chicago	16.92	13.26	8.70	9.56	11.77	8.99	9.33
Dallas	13.33	9.95	6.92	8.02	7.04	6.49	6.66
Detroit	20.00	16.51	12.07	12.21	12.76	12.11	12.25
Houston	17.21	13.44	7.10	8.83	10.88	7.53	9.47
Los Angeles	21.76	15.82	9.12	9.78	12.10	9.24	11.19
New York City[c]	20.02	20.19	9.40	9.40	d	8.21	8.82
Philadelphia	16.47	13.60	9.82	10.28	10.14	9.88	10.15
Pittsburgh	15.53	14.27	8.54	9.00	14.34	9.05	9.83
San Diego	14.10	9.71	8.20	8.76	d	8.19	8.55
San Francisco	21.99	19.29	8.40	8.73	b	10.21	12.39
Washington, D.C.	19.92	15.25	7.30	8.15	11.59	9.28	b

a. Total compensation includes costs for wages, shift differential, insurance benefits, retirement benefits, and miscellaneous benefits, but does not include overtime or holiday pay. Hourly compensation is total compensation divided by the number of hours in the standard work year actually worked. (Overtime hours and time worked on holidays is excluded.) The denominator is standard yearly hours minus leave time for vacations, holidays, sick leave taken, line-of-duty injury leave taken, paid lunch periods, and other personal leave.

b. Workers performing this function are not city employees.

c. Pay for holiday work is legally considered part of base wages in New York City. Holiday pay is not included in New York City's total compensation in the table, however in order to maintain comparability across cities.

d. Refuse collectors in New York City and San Diego also drive trucks. Thus, the job match is not strictly comparable. Total hourly compensation for refuse collectors in New York City in 1981 was $17.68 and for refuse collectors in San Diego, $11.69.

levels for local cost of living differences. Where city governments recruit workers on a national or regional labor market, they must compete with one another in terms of real compensation. This provides a further reason for adjusting compensation totals for differences in the cost of living, at least in jobs where such markets exist.

The Bureau of Labor Statistics regularly publishes cost of living indices for major urban areas, including all of the urban areas covered in this study. These indices provide the basis for deflating local compensation totals. The base chosen for this study is the U.S. urban average price level, which is given a cost index of 100. (Note that the urban average price level is modestly lower than the average for the 12 urban areas in our study, which have somewhat higher than average costs of living.) The budget level used for indexing is the intermediate family budget. The indices refer to relative cost of living as of 1980, the latest date for which figures are available.

The use of metropolitan area cost deflators is not without its problems. The Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS) has long maintained that its indices are better used in adjusting for cost of living changes over time in a single metropolitan area than in correcting for cost differences between cities. Comparative use between cities encounters all of the standard index number problems. BLS establishes its indices by measuring the cost of purchasing a standard bundle of goods in each metropolitan area. Because of the different prices that prevail in different cities, however, consumers of the same budget level actually will purchase different consumption bundles, leading to ambiguities in the price deflator. This problem is most conspicuous in the case of housing consumption, where the assumption that households in different metropolitan areas (e.g., New York City and Dallas) buy the same type of housing accommodation is particularly implausible.

Despite these provisos, the BLS cost of living index provides by far the best deflator for adjusting local differences in compensation. Table 3 shows the cost of living factors for the 12 cities in our sample.

Tables 4 and 5 show the results of adjusting annual and hourly compensation, respectively, for differences in the local cost of living. As would be expected, cities with lower cost of living move up in rank, particularly Dallas and Houston. New York City and Boston fall most sharply in their relative standing when compensation is adjusted for cost of living differences.

Readers who believe that adjusted compensation comparisons are appropriate can create adjusted versions of all tables in this report by applying the relative cost of living indices presented in table 3 to the figures in a given table. (Unadjusted figure divided by index gives adjusted figure.)

TABLE 3

COST OF LIVING ADJUSTMENT FACTORS[a]

City	Comparative[b] Indices	City	Comparative[b] Indices
Boston	1.17	New York City	1.16
Chicago	1.01	Philadelphia	1.05
Dallas	.90	Pittsburgh	.97
Detroit	1.00	San Diego	.98
Houston	.93	San Francisco	1.07
Los Angeles	.97	Washington, D.C.	1.09

a. Bureau of Labor Statistics, Urban Family Budgets, 1980, based on costs for a family of four at the intermediate budget level.
b. U.S. Urban Average = 1.0.

COMPENSATION TRENDS

A comparison of city compensation as of a given date is necessarily static. It does not indicate whether one city's compensation level is part of a recent slowdown in compensatin growth, or another's is the result of a sharp jump in compensation levels. Reliance on a single year's compensation figures may be misleading even for comparative purposes. Cities that are on the last year of a two or three year wage contract may face pent-up demands for compensation increases that will make relative compensation standings quite different in the next year.

Ideally, comparisons over time would treat the full compensation package identified in this report. It was beyond the resources of this project, however, to create a consistent set of total compensation comparisons for past years. To provide some context for the 1981 compensation comparisons, this section examines growth rates in wages, but not total compensation, for the last eight years in each city. Information is provided only on entry level salaries.[1] We do not address adjustments in the longevity structure of compensation. Cities' pension benefit adjustments over the period are discussed in chapter 4.

Table 6 shows the average annual adjustment in entry level wages for the seven job titles during the period fiscal years 1973-1981. It is clear

1. Entry level salaries in some cities may not increase as rapidly as salaries for employees with more experience in the same job title. Salary increases are not given on a constant pecentage basis for each step level in some cities. Where this is true, it is not unusual to provide greater salary increases for, say, police officers at the five year level and lesser increases for entering workers. As long as there is no recruitment problem, it is possible that salary adjustments would be focused so as to maximize benefits for the current work force. This has been the case for Pittsburgh firefighters. (See table 6.)

TABLE 4

ANNUAL TOTAL COMPENSATION,[a] ADJUSTED FOR COST OF LIVING,[b] FIVE-YEAR LEVEL, 1981

City	Police Officer	Fire-fighter	Typist B	General Steno-grapher	Refuse Collector	Janitor	Park Worker
Boston	$23,163	$22,962	$10,309	$10,600	c	$11,749	$11,799
Chicago	27,075	27,729	13,784	15,156	22,606	17,284	17,948
Dallas	27,704	27,643	14,450	16,753	14,281	13,579	13,849
Detroit	34,443	34,715	18,997	19,221	22,926	20,415	22,012
Houston	33,445	32,303	14,123	17,560	21,076	14,973	18,820
Los Angeles	40,319	40,153	16,753	17,956	21,415	16,856	20,737
New York City[e]	28,634	29,590	12,531	12,531	d	12,336	13,453
Philadelphia	24,998	24,302	14,995	15,705	16,440	16,011	16,485
Pittsburgh	27,337	25,889	15,197	16,016	25,096	16,516	17,940
San Diego	27,172	25,295	15,261	16,309	d	15,235	15,813
San Francisco	35,414	35,476	14,036	14,596	c	16,673	20,795
Washington, D.C.	29,258	29,363	11,665	13,027	18,309	14,761	c

a. Total compensation includes costs for wages, shift differential, insurance benefits, retirement benefits, and miscellaneous benefits, but does not include overtime or holiday pay.

b. Adjusted by dividing total compensation by Bureau of Labor Statistics comparative indices for selected urban areas, 1980 intermediate budget level index.

c. Workers performing this function are not city employees.

d. Refuse collectors in New York City and San Diego also drive trucks. Thus, the job match is not strictly comparable. Adjusted annual compensation for New York City refuse collectors was $23,893 and for San Diego refuse collectors, $20,979.

e. Pay for holiday work is legally considered part of base wages in New York City. Holiday pay is not included in New York City's total compensation in the table, however, in order to maintain comparability across cities.

TABLE 5

HOURLY TOTAL COMPENSATION,[a] ADJUSTED FOR COST OF LIVING,[b] FIVE-YEAR LEVEL, 1981

City	Police Officer	Fire-fighter	Typist B	General Steno-grapher	Refuse Collector	Janitor	Park Worker
Boston	$14.92	$13.31	$ 6.70	6.89	c	$ 7.77	$ 6.67
Chicago	16.75	13.13	8.61	9.47	11.65	8.90	9.24
Dallas	14.81	11.06	7.69	8.91	7.82	7.21	7.40
Detroit	20.00	16.51	12.07	12.21	12.76	12.11	12.25
Houston	18.51	14.45	7.63	9.49	11.70	8.10	10.18
Los Angeles	22.43	16.31	9.40	10.08	12.47	9.53	11.54
New York City[c]	17.26	17.41	8.10	8.10	e	7.08	7.60
Philadelphia	15.69	12.95	9.35	9.79	9.66	9.41	9.67
Pittsburgh	16.01	14.71	8.80	9.28	14.78	9.33	10.13
San Diego	14.39	9.91	8.37	8.94	e	8.36	8.72
San Francisco	20.55	18.03	7.85	8.16	c	9.54	11.58
Washington, D.C.	18.28	13.99	6.70	7.48	10.63	8.51	c

a. Total compensation includes costs for wages, shift differential, insurance benefits, retirement benefits, and miscellaneous benefits, but does not include overtime or holiday pay. Hourly compensation is total compensation divided by the number of hours in the standard work year actually worked. (Overtime hours and time worked on holidays is excluded.) The denominator is standard yearly hours minus leave time for vacations, holidays, sick leave taken, line-of-duty injury leave taken, paid lunch periods, and other personal leave.

b. Adjusted by dividing total compensation by Bureau of Labor Statistics comparative indices for selected urban areas, 1980, intermediate budget level index.

c. Workers performing this function are not city employees.

d. Pay for holiday work is legally considered part of base wages in New York City. Holiday pay is not included in New York City's total compensation in the table, however, in order to maintain comparability across cities.

e. Refuse collectors in New York City and San Diego also drive trucks. Thus, the job match is not strictly comparable. Adjusted hourly compensation for New York City refuse collectors is $15.24 and for San Diego refuse collectors, $11.93.

TABLE 6

AVERAGE ANNUAL PERCENTAGE INCREASE IN ENTRY LEVEL SALARY,[a] FISCAL YEARS 1973-1981

City	Police Officer	Fire-fighter	Typist B	General Steno-grapher	Refuse Collector	Janitor	Park Worker
Boston[b]	6.84%	7.61%	4.53%	4.42%	c	3.99%	3.99%
Chicago	6.65	6.65	5.33	5.33	7.00	6.18	6.27
Dallas	9.21	9.21	6.71	6.58	7.30	5.79	7.30
Detroit	10.30	10.30	4.30	4.20	6.50	3.13	7.00
Houston	10.28	10.28	9.10	12.49	9.80	10.81	12.13
Los Angeles	8.06	7.96	7.10	7.11	6.30	5.53	6.32
New York City[d]	5.06	5.06	7.31	6.23	5.11	5.76	6.97
Philadelphia	6.10	5.77	5.78	6.59	5.62	4.10	6.20
Pittsburgh	6.62	2.85[e]	6.96	6.66	6.46[f]	9.93	8.45
San Diego	4.93	6.36	7.09	7.01	6.32	6.80	6.36
San Francisco	5.37	5.37	4.33	5.17	c	7.38	3.67
Washington, D.C.	6.34	6.34	6.60	6.16	7.83	6.80	c

a. Entry level salaries used for trend purposes are not always strictly comparable to salaries used in total compensation comparisons. For example, no weighting of first and second half-year salaries was undertaken for trend purposes.

b. Starting in 1974 shift differential was incorporated into base salary for firefighters. This explains the larger rate of increase for firefighters than police officers.

c. Workers performing this function are not city employees.

d. The typist B, general stenographer, and park worker titles were recently broadbanded to merge with several once separate titles. Hence, post-broadbanded titles are not strictly comparable to individual job titles prior to broadbanding.

e. Pittsburgh entry level firefighter salaries have not increased for the past six years. However, salary increases have consistently taken place for fire employees with over one year of experience. Thus, entry level trends in this case are not a good reflection of overall salary increases.

f. Salary trends for refuse collector are for the journeyman level, as the entry level is not readily available for past years.

that the cities experiencing the fastest wage growth are not necessarily the cities that rank highest when total compensation is compared in table 1. San Francisco and New York City—cities which rank relatively high in total compensation for safety employees—rank tenth and eleventh in terms of salary growth. Their relative growth in total compensation has been even less, as both cities have revised their pension plans to trim employer costs for new entrants. Dallas, in contrast, has below average police and fire compensation levels, but considerably above average growth rates. Although the table suggests a mild convergence between cities in police and fire compensation, the most interesting results are the individual cases it highlights. Detroit's safety compensation, for example, is above average and has grown at a rapid rate. (In the summer of 1981, the city and police renegotiated their labor contract to freeze wages over a three-year period.)

Backup data are provided in Appendix C showing the actual entry level wage for each year between 1973 and 1981. In addition, 1982 wages are provided for cities where the next year's wages have already been determined.

CHAPTER FOUR

MAJOR COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

The division of the total compensation package among its components is sometimes as important as the overall total. Retirement and health benefits, for example, may be bargained for or otherwise determined separately from the rest of the compensation package; comparisons of the costs of these benefits with those of other jurisdictions may then be directly relevant to decisions about benefit levels. Many policy issues likewise require separation of the compensation bundle. A good deal of policy discussion has centered around the question of whether retirement benefit promises are traded off against current wages, and if so at what rate. To answer questions like these requires specific information about the components of the compensation package.

COMPENSATION ELEMENTS

The major components for total compensation can be grouped as follows:

(1) *Wages:* Wages include all money payments made to a worker for normal working hours and thus include cost-of-living payments, longevity pay, step or merit increases, and retroactive salary adjustments resulting from wage negotiations.

(2) *Differential Pay:* This item reflects all shift and other differential pay. The numbers shown represent the average differential pay received by all persons in that job classification in the city. It is assumed that workers in the same job classification in different cities must in total work approximately the same shift distributions; therefore, additional pay for shift differentials in some cities adds to the average remuneration for a standard mix of work.

(3) *Insurance Benefits:* This category includes employer cost of health and life insurance for active employees, payments to union welfare funds, medical payments for line-of-duty injury, and group legal fees.

(4) *Retirement Benefits:* This category consists primarily of employer contributions to Social Security and the actuarially determined amount

that should be contributed to a pension fund based upon a year's service for the mix of local employees. It also includes permanent Worker's Compensation awards, health benefits for retired employees, annuity funds, sick leave reimbursements upon retirement, and welfare fund payments for retired employees.

(5) *Miscellaneous Benefits:* This category includes the employer costs of benefits not classified elsewhere. Entries consist primarily of uniform allowances.

For certain purposes it may be valuable to know the average cost of overtime and holiday pay that workers receive. Overtime and holiday pay have been excluded from our comparisons of total annual compensation on the grounds that such pay compensates the worker for time worked beyond the standard work year. Inclusion of overtime pay in annual salary comparisons would involve serious deviation from the concept of a standard work period. To the employee interested in evaluating his prospects for total income from the municipal employer, however, average overtime pay may be highly relevant. For those who want to examine the strategy of personnel management, local differences in reliance on overtime are interesting in themselves. Accordingly, Appendix C spells out average overtime and holiday pay in our 12 jurisdictions for selected job titles—even though these figures are not part of "total compensation" as used elsewhere in this report. Overtime and holiday pay are reported together as "premium pay."

No attempt is made in this section to show cross-city comparisons for each of the non-wage benefit items. The interested reader is encouraged to use the tables in Appendix C to assess the makeup of the total compensation package for a particular city or to compare costs across cities for one or more compensation elements. However, the most important elements of the compensation package—wages, retirement benefits, and pensions—are discussed more fully below.

WAGES

Table 7 shows wages only (no shift differential, overtime, or other supplemental benefits) for employees with five years of experience in the seven job titles. The table demonstrates that, for uniformed employees, wage comparisons alone can produce quite different rankings from total compensation. The city of Detroit, which is characterized by high salary relative to supplemental benefits, ranks first on police officer wages. Yet when total compensation is compared in table 1, Detroit falls below Los Angeles and San Francisco. New York City and Washington, D.C., illustrate the opposite situation, since inclusion of supplemental benefits

TABLE 7

WAGES,[a] FIVE-YEAR LEVEL, 1981

City	Police Officer	Fire-fighter	Typist B	General Steno-grapher	Refuse Collector	Janitor	Park Worker
Boston	$19,981	$21,089	$ 9,672	$ 9,983	b	$11,050	$11,050
Chicago	22,920	22,920	11,033	12,348	19,302	14,322	14,955
Dallas	20,388	20,388	11,567	13,474	11,269	10,831	11,064
Detroit	26,296	26,296	14,045	14,236	16,901	14,616	16,577
Houston	23,517	23,517	10,252	12,987	15,542	10,929	13,916
Los Angeles	25,996	25,891	12,695	13,718	16,433	12,319	16,057
New York City	21,932	21,932	11,241	11,241	c	10,921	11,891
Philadelphia	20,048	19,546	11,966	12,591	13,170	12,460	13,170
Pittsburgh	20,157	19,110	11,591	12,286	19,319	12,744	13,929
San Diego	21,564	20,532	12,228	13,104	c	11,808	12,296
San Francisco	23,640	23,640	13,011	13,559	c	15,007	19,627
Washington, D.C.	19,789	19,789	9,452	10,651	15,100	11,482	b

a. Wages include base pay plus step increments, longevity pay, and any relevant retroactive salary payments or cost-of-living adjustments. Shift differential payments, overtime, and holiday pay are not included.

b. Workers performing this function are not city employees.

c. Refuse collectors in New York City and San Diego also drive trucks. Thus, the job match is not strictly comparable. Wages for refuse collectors in New York City in 1981 were $19,796 and $16,692 for refuse collectors in San Diego.

brings their total compensation to higher levels than would be expected from looking at wages alone.

Wages tend to be better predictors of total compensation ranking for nonuniformed titles than for uniformed titles, due to the lesser importance of supplemental benefits for these workers. However, there are still differences in ranking for nonuniformed employees between table 1 and table 7.

RETIREMENT BENEFITS

The most significant factor in determining the cost of supplemental benefits is retirement costs, which consist primarily of pensions. Any effort to assign retirement benefit costs to the current year for an active employee is inherently an estimation procedure. The cost of future entitlements, like pension payments, depends upon future events whose probability can only be estimated in the current year. Ultimate costs will depend, inter alia, on the number of years that a retiree lives, future asset earning experience in the pension fund, future cost-of-living adjustments, etc. The current cost equivalent of these future benefits can only be estimated and then only through use of an actuarial model.

The employer's cost of pensions has been calculated in this study by applying actuarial techniques to the local benefit structure. Besides pensions, other retirement costs include employer contributions to Social Security, other items such as health care provided to retirees, and "cashing out" of unused sick leave upon retirement. The employer's Social Security costs have been calculated using the actual contributions required by law in 1981.[1] The post-retirement costs of paying for employee's health and medical care and for retiree welfare fund benefits have been estimated through an actuarial shorthand method which approximates the full actuarial modeling used for pensions.[2]

The costs of the various retirement benefits have been broken out in tables 8 and 9 for police officers and general stenographers at the five year level. Calculated in this fashion, retirement costs vary considerably from city to city and job to job. For police officers, the highest estimated retirement cost was $13,034 for San Francisco and the lowest was $2,057 in Chicago. Retirement costs are substantially reduced for nonuniformed employees, as illustrated by costs in table 9. Retirement costs for general stenographers range from a high of $2,729 in Detroit to $990 in Chicago.

---

1. As of January 1, 1981, this comes to 6.65 percent of gross wages (including shift differential, overtime, and holiday pay) up to a maximum gross wage base of $29,700.

2. Appendix B provides a description of calculations used for all compensation elements including health costs for retired employees.

TABLE 8

RETIREMENT COSTS, POLICE OFFICER, FIVE-YEAR LEVEL, 1981

City	Total Retirement Costs[a]	Pensions[b]	Social Security[c]	Other[d]
Boston	$ 3,739	$ 3,477[e]	$ 0	$ 262
Chicago	2,057	2,015	$ 0	42
Dallas	3,915	3,563	0	352
Detroit	5,566	4,996	0	570
Houston	6,303	5,582	0	721
Los Angeles	11,206	10,684	0	522
New York City	8,486	5,486	1,674	1,326
Philadelphia	4,048	4,010	0	38
Pittsburgh	3,797	2,873	0	924
San Diego	4,063	3,748	0	315
San Francisco	13,034	12,503	0	531
Washington, D.C.	10,896	10,896	0	0

a. Retirement benefit costs are the sum of pension costs, Social Security costs and "other."

b. Pension costs are actuarial costs using the entry age normal method. Entry age normal costs represent the amount that the city would pay into the pension funds in each year of employment in order to cover the expected costs of the city's share of pension benefits when the employee retires. (Costs in each year are defined as a constant percent of salary.) These costs do not reflect actual expenditures made and do not include extra costs associated with past unfunded liabilities.

c. Social Security contribution actually made by the city for an employee at the given salary level.

d. "Other" includes costs for permanent Workmen's Compensation awards, health benefits for retired employees, annuity funds, welfare fund benefits for retired employees, and reimbursement for unused sick leave upon retirement. In cases where employees cannot receive both pensions and permanent Workmen's Compensation awards, Workmen's Compensation is counted as zero.

e. The Boston pension figure is an approximation. See footnote 5, this chapter.

TABLE 9

RETIREMENT COSTS, GENERAL STENOGRAPHER, FIVE-YEAR LEVEL, 1981

City	Total Retirement Costs[a]	Pensions[b]	Social Security[c]	Other[d]
Boston	$1,054	$ 968[e]	$ 0	$ 86
Chicago	990	661	0	329
Dallas	1,180	1,064	0	116
Detroit	2,729	1,466	947	316
Houston	2,198	961	864	373
Los Angeles	2,018	1,893	0	125
New York City	2,131	2,245	748	138
Philadelphia	2,429	1,549	837	43
Pittsburgh	1,709	679	817	213
San Diego	2,301	1,379	871	51
San Francisco	1,307	362	902	43
Washington, D.C.	2,638	2,480	0	158

a. Retirement benefit costs are the sum of pension costs, Social Security costs and "other."

b. Pension costs are actuarial costs using the entry age normal method. Entry age normal costs represent the amount that the city would pay into the pension funds in each year of employment in order to cover the expected costs of the city's share of pension benefits when the employee retires. (Costs in each year are defined as a constant percent of salary.) These costs do not reflect actual expenditures made and do not include extra costs associated with past unfunded liabilities.

c. Social Security contribution actually made by the city for an employee at the given salary level.

d. "Other" includes costs for permanent Workmen's Compensation awards, health benefits for retired employees, annuity funds, welfare fund benefits for retired employees, and reimbursement for unused sick leave upon retirement. In cases where employees cannot receive both pensions and permanent Workmen's Compensation awards, Workmen's Compensation is counted as zero.

e. The Boston pension figure is an approximation. See footnote 5, this chapter.

The lesser cost for general employees is due both to a less generous benefit structure and to higher withdrawal rates, which reduce the probability that a person will receive retirement pay.

It should be clear from the tables that while pensions constitute the bulk of retirement costs, other factors such as Social Security contributions and Workmen's Compensation awards can have a significant impact on totals. This is even more pertinent when retirement benefits are being compared for nonuniformed job titles, since pension costs tend to be lower and Social Security contributions more frequent for these positions. Thus, it is a mistake to evaluate pension costs as if they were the only retirement benefit component. New York City police officers, for example, have pension costs which are at least $5,000 less than pension costs for five year police officers in San Francisco, Washington, D.C., and Los Angeles. Yet Social Security and other retirement benefits in New York City add an extra $3,000 to total retirement costs.

PENSIONS

The pension costs reported in this study for 1981 are the entry age normal costs for the mix of employees and entry ages found in each retirement system. It measures the cost of accruing the benefit entitlements associated with one year of work and does *not* include any contribution toward amortizing unfunded liabilities in the pension system. The employer's normal cost of pensions can differ greatly from the actual contribution made by the employer to the pension system. Actual contributions sometimes are much higher—when the employer is paying off past underfunding—and sometimes much lower than normal costs—when the employer is failing to fully fund current pension costs.[3]

Pension cost estimates incorporate the same actuarial methodology (entry age normal) for each city and the same assumptions about future wage and price increases and future investment earnings. Yet calculations rely on each city's local experience tables to determine the probability of withdrawal, service retirement, and disability retirement. The procedures used by our actuarial subcontractors to arrive at normal pension costs can be summarized as follows:

---

3. When pensions have been included in other total compensation studies, the most common procedure has been to use the actual employer contribution to the pension fund, per active worker, as the measure of pension costs. Yet a pay-as-you-go system would be spending less than the current normal costs, while another system may be amortizing past service costs in addition to paying current normal costs. Since differences in employer contributions often bear no relationship to current normal pension costs being incurred, they should not be used for compensation comparisons.

(1) *Determine the benefits:* This step consists of gathering a complete description of the benefits that are available. For example, in the case of age and service retirement, it would include information on when an employee may retire and how his benefit is calculated at different retirement points. This information comes from the benefit plans of each city. In compensation comparisons among cities, it is the cost of the differences in benefits which is the primary object of study.

(2) *Estimate probabilities of receiving benefits:* Certain events affecting an employee may cause benefits to become due (e.g., disability in line of duty after a stipulated period of service), whereas certain other events (e.g., separation from service before benefits become vested) ensure that benefits will not be paid at all. Some of these probabilities involve events that are outside the control of the jurisdiction to any significant degree, as well as events (e.g., the probability of being allowed to retire on disability) that are heavily influenced by local administrative standards. The pension cost estimates in this study are all based upon actual local probability tables of service retirement, disability retirement, and withdrawal for the population of employees under each separate pension plan.

When the probabilities of various events are applied, whether to a single employee or a group of 10,000 employees, the result is a prediction of the frequency with which these events will take place at various stages. For example, starting with 10,000 employees, it might be calculated that there will be two duty-connected disability retirements at attained age 40 and 500 service retirements at age 62.

(3) *Calculate costs of benefits:* The next step is to calculate the costs of the various benefits in the years after the benefits are earned. The cost of a benefit will generally be related to the person's salary at the time of the event (and often the salary for past years), which means that an assumption regarding future salary increases is necessary. The Urban Institute chose a 6 percent annual increase factor for salaries, plus a local "career ladder factor" which represents step and longevity increases as well as possible promotions.[4] This assumption was applied to all cities and all jobs.

City contributions for benefit costs will also depend upon the rate of return earned by the pension system's invested assets. A return of 7 percent was assumed in this study. Where benefits are indexed to the cost of living, an assumption about future cost-of-living changes is also required. An annual increase of 5 percent was used for this purpose.

---

4. Such career ladders are often available in local actuarial reports in the form of yearly rates of increase in salary, by age, attributable to steps, longevity factors, and promotion factors. The resulting assumption regarding salary increase is the sum of the career ladder plus the 6 percent yearly rate representing inflation and any real salary increases.

Taken together, the three assumptions imply a real rate of return on investment of 2 percent per year and a real rate of wage growth of 1 percent per year. These assumptions appear reasonable and are in line with those made in actuarial valuations. But considerable uncertainty attaches to any prediction of the future. A pension system (like the old Los Angeles system for safety employees) that automatically adjusts pension benefits annually for the full rate of inflation becomes much more expensive in relation to other cities as the inflation rate rises.

(4) *Apply actuarial technique for assigning costs to the current year:* Actuarial approaches to pension funding all require them to produce sufficient income for the fund so that when a cohort of hypothetical employees is dead, all their benefits will have been paid with nothing left owing to them. Actuarial approaches differ, however, in the contribution patterns by which this result is reached. Some funding methods call for very small contributions during an employee's early years, and much larger ones as the employee grows older. Some call for equal dollar contributions over each year of active service. Another approach, called the entry age normal level percentage method, establishes pension contributions of the employer as a uniform percentage of base payroll over the employee's entire working life. This method is more commonly used than any other by state and local governments and is the method adopted for use in this study.

Table 10 presents the results of applying the costing procedures described above to all seven job titles for employees with five years of experience. The table shows that pension costs in all cities are significantly higher for police officers and firefighters than for general employees. This reflects the lower withdrawal rates of uniformed workers, their greater probabilities of early retirement and disability retirement, as well as more generous pension benefit structures.

Police pension costs are very close to firefighter pension costs in most jurisdictions. Where police and fire employees fall under the same pension plan, pension costs are identical as a percent of salary. In cities with separate police and fire plans, discrepancies in pension costs can be attributable to differences in plan benefit structure as well as differences in probabilities of retirement and withdrawal.

In the cities studied, refuse collectors, janitors, park workers, stenographers, and typists usually participate in the same pension plan, typically labeled the "general employee" plan. As a result, pension costs as a percentage of payroll are frequently identical for these employees.

The Institute has also calculated normal pension costs for entry level and 20 year employees in addition to the calculations for employees with five years of experience as shown in table 10. Those calculations generally

TABLE 10

EMPLOYER NORMAL PENSION COSTS,[a] FIVE-YEAR LEVEL, 1981

City	Police Officer	Fire-fighter	Typist B	General Steno-grather	Refuse Collector	Janitor	Park Worker
Boston[b]	$3,477	$3,669	$ 938	$ 968	c	$1,072	$1,072
Chicago	2,015	2,558	590	661	1,137	844	881
Dallas	3,563	3,446	914	1,064	930	873	883
Detroit	4,996	4,996	1,447	1,466	2,051	1,559	1,705
Houston	5,582	4,139	759	961	1,150	809	1,030
Los Angeles	10,684	10,641	1,752	1,893	2,268	1,765	2,217
New York City	5,486	6,475	1,245	1,245	3,319	1,227	1,357
Philadelphia	4,010	3,479	1,472	1,549	1,620	1,533	1,620
Pittsburgh	2,873	2,841	641	679	1,068	705	770
San Diego	3,748	3,123	1,286	1,379	1,756	1,287	1,304
San Francisco	12,503	12,503	347	362	c	416	524
Washington, D.C.	10,869	10,896	2,200	2,480	3,515	2,673	b

a. Pension costs are estimated actuarial costs using the entry age normal method and assumptions identified in the text. Entry age normal costs represent the amount (as a percent of salary) that the city would pay into the pension fund in each year in order to cover the expected costs of the city's share of pension benefits when the employee retires. These costs do not reflect actual employer contributions to the pension fund and do not include extra costs associated with paying for past unfunded liabilities. Employee contributions are not included in this table.

b. The Boston pension figures are approximations. See footnote 5, this chapter.

c. Workers performing this function are not city employees.

show that the pension cost is the same percentage of payroll over the employee's lifetime—a result that the constant percentage funding method is designed to achieve. However, different normal cost percentages may occur when employees of five or 20 years of experience are covered by benefit provisions different from those of new workers.

Table 11 presents the employer's normal pension costs for all three longevity levels for two job positions. The table shows some marked differences in pension costs. For example, in San Francisco employees hired prior to November 2, 1976 are covered under an old, liberal pension plan and are entitled to receive greater retirement benefits than are employees who were hired after that date. The entry age normal pension costs of newly entering police officers in San Francisco come to $3,476, while police officers with five years of experience (under the old plan) have annual entry age normal pension costs calculated at $12,503.

Other cities show similar types of adjustments. New York City uniformed employees with no experience and five years of experience fall under new plans, while employees hired prior to July 1, 1973 (20 year level) are covered under old plans. New York City's general member employees at the entry, five year, and 20 year level are covered under three separate plans—an old, a new, and an intermediate plan. In Detroit uniformed employees with zero and five years of experience fall under different plans than do employees with 20 years of experience, while entry level safety employees in Los Angeles and Washington, D.C. are covered by new pension plans.

DIFFERENCES BETWEEN 1981 AND 1979 PENSION METHODOLOGIES

The pension methodology used in this report is based upon actuarial projections for the entire local plan population under each local pension system. For five of the 12 cities, entry age normal costs were calculated by Howard Winklevoss and Associates using local benefit descriptions, local population data, and Urban Institute economic assumptions. For the remaining cities (with the exception of Boston[5]), the Urban Institute subcontracted with each city's actuarial firm to develop normal pension costs under the common entry age normal funding method. This also required that the local actuaries recalculate normal pension costs using the Urban Institute economic assumptions for growth in salary, interest, and inflation. Thus, both approaches apply the same methodology for determining pension costs.

---

5. The procedure used for 1981 Boston pension costs is an estimation, not a full actuarial valuation, since we were unable to obtain approval to subcontract with Boston's actuaries to obtain the necessary calculations. Instead, 1981 normal pension cost percentages for

TABLE 11

EMPLOYER NORMAL PENSION COSTS, ENTRY, FIVE, AND TWENTY YEAR LEVELS,[a] POLICE OFFICER AND GENERAL STENOGRAPHER, 1981

City	Police Officer			General Stenographer		
	Entry	5-Year	20-Year	Entry	5-Year	20-Year
Boston[b]	$2,753	$3,477	$3,590	$ 837	$ 968	$1,019
Chicago	1,595	2,015	2,233	511	661	802
Dallas	3,090	3,563	3,689	804	1,064	1,393
Detroit	4,025	4,996	7,713	1,151	1,466	1,729
Houston	4,060	5,582	5,582	908	961	1,121
Los Angeles	5,866	10,684	11,585	1,677	1,893	1,893
New York City	4,157	5,496	6,112	813	1,245	1,552
Philadelphia	3,500	4,010	4,098	1,426	1,549	1,604
Pittsburgh	2,322	2,873	2,873	651	679	1,019
San Diego	2,607	3,748	3,748	976	1,379	1,379
San Francisco	3,476	12,503	12,503	416[c]	362	370
Washington, D.C.	7,538	10,896	12,968	2,188	2,480	2,844

a. In cities where no new plans have been introduced, employees at the three levels of experience have the same entry age normal pension cost as a percent of wages. Thus, the dollar value of pension costs would be expected to increase since employees with more experience tend to have a higher wage base. It should also be noted that each city has a different definition of what is included in the wage base for the purpose of calculating pension costs. (I.e., sometimes the entry age normal pension cost percentage would apply to base salary, longevity, and shift differential payments. In other cases, it would apply to base salary only.) The pension costs in this table are calculated using the appropriate wage base definition for each city.

b. The Boston pension figures are approximations. See footnote 5, this chapter.

c. In San Francisco, the new miscellaneous system pension costs for entry level employees came out somewhat higher than the old system costs, even though the old system provides more generous benefits. This is because employee contribution rates end up being higher under the old system using our set of economic assumptions.

The 1979 pension costs, in contrast, were calculated by Peat, Marwick, Mitchell and Company using a hypothetical employee of entry age 21 for each job class. The main difference between the 1979 and 1981 approach is that 1981 costs reflect the actual entry age distribution for the employee population in each city under a given plan, thereby eliminating the use of a hypothetical employee with an arbitrary entry age.

The most noticeable difference between the pension cost numbers generated by the two methodologies is the increased magnitude of pension costs under the 1981 method. The 1981 pension costs in most of the cities are higher as a percent of salary than the 1979 costs because the entry age 21 assumption was found to understate actual average entering ages, thereby understating costs. Because young employees are especially likely to leave municipal jobs after brief periods of employment, their annual pension costs tend to be lower—for the simple reason that they are less likely to continue in employment long enough to qualify for pension benefit payments.[6]

The greatest dollar differences between the two pension methodologies occur for plans with uncapped cost-of-living increases, since these plans start out with higher pension costs. San Francisco, for example, shows pension costs for five year police officers of $7,011 under the 1979 methodology compared to $12,503 under the 1981 methodology. Washington, D.C. shows similar changes, from $6,454 under the 1979 methodology to $10,896 under the 1981 methodology.

The rate of increase is even higher for Washington, D.C. nonuniformed employees between the two pension methodologies, even though the dollar totals involved are much lower. (A Washington, D.C. typist with five years

---

Boston are assumed to have the same relationship to pension costs in other cities as they did using the 1979 methodology. For example, Boston's uniformed pension cost percentage in 1979 was 18 percent below the average of the other cities. The 1981 percentage was chosen so that the 1981 pension cost percentage continues to be 18 percent below the 1981 average for the other cities.

This procedure produces results which appear to be reasonable in light of the findings of Boston's most recent actuarial valuation. This local valuation (using economic assumptions very close to those used in our study) produces an employer entry age normal cost percentage of 12 percent of payroll for the entire Boston system (combined police, fire, and other employees). Our estimation technique produced employer normal costs of 17.4 percent for uniformed and 9.7 percent for nonuniformed employees. This appears reasonable, since police and fire costs would be expected to be somewhat above 12 percent, and nonuniformed costs would be expected to be somewhat below 12 percent.

6. Sensitivity of pension cost to changes in entry age depends not only on the withdrawal rates of a given population, but also on the retirement behavior and plan benefit structure. A higher entry age will be considerably more costly in cases where younger employees have high withdrawal rates, *and* where most employees retire at some minimum retirement age.

If younger entrants also retire earlier and receive pension benefits longer than older entrants, sensitivity to changes in entry age may not be so great.

of experience shows pension costs of $613 under the 1979 methodology compared to $2,200 under the 1981 methodology.) This special sensitivity for nonuniformed employees is to be expected, since the average entry age for nonuniformed employees is about 32, much higher than the assumed entry age of 21. (The average entry age for safety employees tends to be about 25.)

Another difference between the two pension methodologies is that the 1981 approach assigns the same normal cost (as a percent of salary) to all jobs falling under the same local pension plan. The previous approach treated each job title separately and often attributed different probabilities of retirement, withdrawal, etc., to individual job titles, based in part upon the sex distribution of employees in different jobs. As a result, the variation in pension costs between some of the nonuniformed job titles for 1979 does not show up for 1981. Appendix C provides a breakdown of pension costs for all cities, all job titles, and all three longevity levels using the 1979 and 1981 methodologies.

CHAPTER FIVE

IMPACT OF LONGEVITY ON COMPENSATION COMPARISONS

Virtually all municipalities reward length of service with greater pay. As part of this study, compensation costs were computed for entry level workers, workers with five years of experience, and workers with 20 years of experience under the same job title. The preceding chapters focused on the pay of five year workers as the most significant of the three comparisons. Compensation comparisons that refer to entry level workers have the disadvantage that they completely ignore the rewards for longevity, which can be important components of a city's compensation structure. Comparisons at the 20 year level have the drawback of applying to fewer and sometimes unrepresentative workers. For several job titles—e.g., typist—the typical worker is promoted to another position before 20 years have elapsed. Hence comparison of the salary for a given job title, such as "Typist B," at the 20 year step level is not always apposite; few workers may remain in the same position at this experience level, and those that do are presumably below-average performers.

Nonetheless, explicit compensation comparisons across varying experience levels are necessary if we are to understand how cities reward length of service in different jobs. They also can help determine how sensitive compensation comparisons are to the service period chosen for study.

Experience customarily results in different forms of improved compensation. First, workers receive higher pay through step increases and longevity payments, with corresponding adjustments in the costs of such supplemental benefits as pensions, which are tied to wages. Second, workers gain more time off, primarily through longer vacation entitlements. Since hourly compensation rates capture both salary and time-off differences, the discussion below will rely strongly on those compensation rates.

Tables 12 and 13 provide a picture of longevity rewards by showing hourly and annual compensation for three different service levels for three

TABLE 12

LONGEVITY STRUCTURE OF POLICE OFFICER COMPENSATION, 1981

City	Hourly			Annual		
	Entry	5-Year	20-Year	Entry	5-Year	20-Year
Boston	$13.59 (7)	$17.46 (6)	$18.39 (7)	$21,607 (9)	$27,101 (8)	$27,864 (8)
Chicago	13.27 (9)	16.92 (8)	18.77 (6)	21.756 (8)	27,346 (7)	30,048 (7)
Dallas	11.51 (11)	13.33 (12)	14.28 (12)	21,533 (12)	24,934 (12)	25,792 (12)
Detroit	16.38 (1)	20.00 (4)	21.76 (4)	28,205 (2)	34,443 (3)	37,466 (4)
Houston	13.40 (8)	17.21 (7)	18.22 (8)	24,214 (6)	31,104 (6)	31,908 (6)
Los Angeles	15.90 (2)	21.76 (2)	24.26 (2)	28,577 (1)	39,109 (1)	42,236 (1)
New York City	14.82 (4)	20.02 (3)	20.61 (5)	25,476 (4)	33,216 (4)	34,184 (5)
Philadelphia	14.44 (6)	16.47 (9)	17.63 (9)	23,010 (7)	26,248 (11)	26,779 (11)
Pittsburgh	12.15 (10)	15.53 (10)	16.67 (10)	21,233 (11)	26,517 (10)	27,128 (9)
San Diego	9.51 (12)	14.10 (11)	14.54 (11)	18,357 (12)	26,629 (9)	26,856 (10)
San Francisco	14.53 (5)	21.99 (1)	22.52 (3)	25,618 (3)	37,893 (2)	37,893 (3)
Washington, D.C.	15.14 (3)	19.92 (5)	25.32 (1)	25,042 (5)	31,891 (5)	39,391 (2)

TABLE 13

LONGEVITY STRUCTURE OF TYPIST B COMPENSATION, 1981

City	Hourly			Annual		
	Entry	5-Year	20-Year	Entry	5-Year	20-Year
Boston	$6.77	$7.84	$8.59	$10,656	$12,061	$12,622
	(7)	(9)	(9)	(11)	(12)	(12)
Chicago	7.59	8.70	10.72	12,152	13,922	16,407
	(6)	(5)	(3)	(6)	(8)	(2)
Dallas	5.31	6.92	8.02	9,992	13,005	14,438
	(12)	(12)	(12)	(12)	(10)	(10)
Detroit	9.83	12.07	14.69	15,472	18,997	22,089
	(1)	(1)	(1)	(1)	(1)	(1)
Houston	6.71	7.10	8.74	12,407	13,134	15,313
	(8)	(11)	(8)	(5)	(9)	(7)
Los Angeles	8.03	9.12	9.36	14,624	16,250	16,290
	(3)	(4)	(5)	(3)	(2)	(5)
New York City	7.64	9.40	10.96	11,808	14,536	16,401
	(5)	(3)	(2)	(7)	(7)	(3)
Philadelphia	8.93	9.82	10.68	14,653	15,745	16,326
	(2)	(2)	(4)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Pittsburgh	8.03	8.54	9.20	14,180	14,741	15,186
	(4)	(6)	(6)	(4)	(6)	(8)
San Diego	5.75	8.20	8.44	10,723	14,956	15,068
	(11)	(3)	(11)	(10)	(5)	(9)
San Francisco	6.28	8.40	8.78	11,481	15,018	15,346
	(10)	(7)	(7)	(9)	(4)	(6)
Washington, D.C.	6.50	7.30	8.52	11,680	12,715	14,434
	(9)	(10)	(10)	(8)	(11)	(11)

job titles. The numbers in parentheses indicate a city's rank in the 12-city list.

The figures in these tables show the annual compensation as defined on January 1, 1981 for beginning employees, employees who have had five years of experience as of January 1981, and employees who have had 20 years of experience as of January 1981. Thus, compensation differentials in these tables are those defined in the current period and are not necessarily ones that today's employee can anticipate in the future. For example, some cities have changed their pension plans or other retirement benefits in recent years. Most often these changes have involved cutbacks in the level of employer-provided pension benefits. Where five year or 20 year workers qualify for one pension plan, and entry workers qualify only for a new (and less generous) pension plan, the pension component of compensation will reflect the lower cost for the entry level employee. As the entry level employee ages, he/she will still be under the less generous pension plan.

These tables illustrate how sensitive conclusions about relative compensation can be to the lengths of service chosen for examination. In hourly remuneration, San Francisco police officers fall from first to fifth in our 12-city list when one shifts from a five year level comparison to a comparison of entry level workers. Washington, D.C., which stands fifth at the five year level, has the highest hourly remuneration for 20 year police officers. Detroit police officers provide another example, ranking fourth at the five year level but first when entry level employees are compared.

In some cities, such as San Francisco, the bulk of longevity pay is compressed into the first five years. In other cities, more substantial rewards are paid for later years of service.

Such sensitivity of compensation rankings to choice of longevity period suggests that the experience level selected for comparison should be chosen with care. Preferably, comparisons should be made for several longevity levels in order to fully capture city compensation policy. These findings also underline the point that the experience makeup of the workforce can dramatically influence comparisons of "average" compensation for, say, all police officers in each city. Average compensation in a city which has an older group of police officers could surpass average compensation for a city with younger officers even if the second city offered higher compensation at each level of experience.

CHAPTER SIX

HOURS AVAILABLE FOR WORK

At various points throughout the text, total compensation has been presented on an hourly as well as an annual basis. This chapter deals in more detail with how many hours the employee is available for work. Time and leave benefits may or may not result in employer costs, depending upon the employer's practices in covering or not covering assignments of workers who are absent through a larger workforce than otherwise would be necessary, or through overtime and holiday pay. In every case, however, time and leave benefits raise the employer's cost per hour of labor available for any given level of annual compensation.

Employer costs per hour of work were calculated by dividing total annual compensation by the number of standard annual hours that the employee is available for work. "Hours worked" was defined as the number of hours in the standard work year (excluding overtime) minus vacation days, holidays, utilizied sick and line-of-duty injury leave, personal leave days, and paid lunch periods.

A comparison of hours available for work is inherently more difficult than a comparison of supplemental benefits because informal practices affect hours much more than they affect paid benefits. Such practices may result in the stated work week being less or more than the hours customarily worked by employees. In practice, employees may take more or less time for lunch than stated policy allows, and the incidence of such differences may be different for different jobs in the same city and even for different work units for the same job.

Notwithstanding these problems, some comparison of hours available for work is fundamental if we are to understand comparative compensation. The variation between cities in work schedules is large, and compensation per hour differs more between cities than does compensation per year.

Tables 14 through 17 show the total annual hours worked (excluding overtime) for police officers, firefighters, refuse collectors, and janitors in the 12 cities. Time and leave benefits are broken down in the right-hand

columns, and are expressed for all job titles on the basis of a 261-day work year. Subtracting the total time and leave days from 261 gives the total days worked. Total days worked times hours worked per day equals total annual hours. Hours worked per day represents the scheduled work week hours (usually 40 for all jobs except firefighter) divided by five, minus any paid daily lunch period. (See Appendix C for a complete breakdown of annual hours for entry, five, and 20 year employees for 1981 and 1979.)

The most striking aspect of the tables is the significant disparity among cities in the total annual hours available for work. For police officers, refuse collectors, and janitors, the bulk of the variation is attributable to differences in time and leave days and paid lunch periods. For firefighters, however, major differences in standard work week schedules show up in the second column, "hours worked per day."

Overall, the differences in holiday time tend to account for a relatively small portion of the variation among cities. Vacation time generally accounts for more time off than holidays and can show variation of more than 15 days between the highest and lowest cities.

Sick and injury leave time is a significant source of differences in work hours between cities and a major source of lost time in many cities. Sick and injury leave is measured by average actual hours used during the most recent year for which data are available, either fiscal 1979-80 or fiscal 1980-81. Some provisos must be kept in mind in interpreting sick and injury leave. First, the number of hours lost need not be stable characteristics of the different cities, although the limited checking we were able to do did reveal general stability from one year to the next. Second, greater sick and injury leave time may or may not represent a "benefit" to the employee—depending upon whether more lengthy leave time means more severe sickness or injury, or is due to different administrative standards for allowing time off. Finally, a comparison of sick and injury leave time overlooks other differences in the local approach to sick leave (e.g., how long an employee is carried as an injury leave recipient before being shifted onto disability rolls).

Despite these ambiguities, most of the large differences in sick and injury leave shown in tables 14 through 17 undoubtedly reflect major differences in how sick leave provisions are administered by employers and used by employees. Sick and injury time accounted for more leave time hours than vacations in Philadelphia, Pittsburgh, San Francisco, and Boston. Boston's average reported sick and injury time of 27 days for police officers was more than three times the eight days reported in Dallas.

Looking first at police officer data, table 14 shows Boston with the least annual hours worked (1,552) compared with 1,888 annual hours worked in San Diego. The 7.5-hour days in Boston, Chicago, Philadelphia, and

TABLE 14

POLICE OFFICER, LEAVE TIME HOURS, FIVE-YEAR LEVEL, 1981

City	Total Annual Hours[a]	Hours Worked Per Day[b]	Total Days Worked[c]	Time and Leave Days			
				Vacations & Personal Leave[d]	Holidays[e]	Sick Leave[f]	Line-of-Duty Leave[g]
Boston	1,552	7.5	207	15	13	12	15
Chicago	1,616	7.5	216	18	12	12	3
Dallas	1,870	8	234	12	8	6	2
Detroit	1,722	7.9	218	20	9	11	3
Houston	1,807	8	226	15	11	7	3
Los Angeles	1,797	8	225	14	12	4	6
New York City	1,659	8	207	30	11	7	6
Philadelphia	1,594	7.5	213	13	14	19	2
Pittsburgh	1,707	8	213	15	13	10	10
San Diego	1,888	8.33	227	15	9	8	3
San Francisco	1,723	8	215	15	13	8	10
Washington, D.C.	1,601	7.5	214	20	10	10	7

a. 261 days minus time and leave days times hours worked per day. Time and leave days and total days worked have been rounded off for the purpose of this table. Thus, calculations may differ somewhat due to rounding error.

b. Scheduled work week hours divided by five, minus paid lunch periods.

c. 261 days minus time and leave days.

d. Days of assigned vacation and personal leave, standardized on the basis of a 261-day work year. (Does not include funeral leave.)

e. Annual holidays assigned, standardized on the basis of a 261-day work year. Employee may be required to work on some or all holidays. Payments for this work are classified as part of premium pay.

f. and g. Average days actually utilized for sick leave and for temporary line-of-duty leave (at full pay), standardized on the basis of a 261-day year.

TABLE 15

FIREFIGHTER, LEAVE TIME HOURS, FIVE-YEAR LEVEL, 1981

City	Total Annual Hours[a]	Hours Worked Per Day[b]	Total Days Worked[c]	Time and Leave Days			
				Vacations & Personal Leave[d]	Holidays[e]	Sick Leave[f]	Line-of-Duty Leave[g]
Boston	1,725	8.4	205	15	19	7	15
Chicago	2,112	9.38	225	31	0	3	2
Dallas	2,501	10.8	232	11	9	6	3
Detroit	2,103	10.8	209	19	11	9	14
Houston	2,236	10	224	18	13	4	3
Los Angeles	2,462	11.2	220	15	13	4	9
New York City	1,700	8	212	27	11	7	4
Philadelphia	1,876	8.4	223	14	15	7	2
Pittsburgh	1,760	8.4	210	15	17	11	8
San Diego	2,552	11.2	228	15	9	7	3
San Francisco	1,968	9.74	202	18	16	9	15
Washington, D.C.	2,099	9.6	219	20	13	3	7

a. 261 days minus time and leave days times hours worked per day. Time and leave days and total days worked have been rounded off for the purpose of this table. Thus, calculations may differ somewhat due to rounding error.

b. Scheduled work week hours divided by five, minus paid lunch periods.

c. 261 days minus time and leave days.

d. Days of assigned vacation and personal leave, standardized on the basis of a 261-day work year. (Does not include funeral leave.)

e. Annual holidays assigned, standardized on the basis of a 261-day work year. Employee may be required to work on some or all holidays. Payments for this work are classified as part of premium pay.

f. and g. Average days actually utilized for sick leave and for temporary line-of-duty leave (at full pay), standardized on the basis of a 261-day year.

TABLE 16

REFUSE COLLECTOR, LEAVE TIME HOURS, FIVE-YEAR LEVEL, 1981

City	Total Annual Hours[a]	Hours Worked Per Day[b]	Total Days Worked[c]	Time and Leave Days: Vacations & Personal Leave[d]	Holidays[e]	Sick Leave[f]	Line-of-Duty Leave[g]
Boston	None	—	—	—	—	—	—
Chicago	1,940	8	243	10	7	0	2
Dallas	1,826	8	228	10	8	7	7
Detroit	1,797	8	225	10	10	12	5
Houston	1,802	8	225	10	11	8	8
Los Angeles	1,717	8	215	15	12	15	5
New York City	1,568	7.5	209	25	11	12	4
Philadelphia	1,703	8	213	18	14	15	1
Pittsburgh	1,698	8	212	15	13	9	12
San Diego	1,759	8	220	15	9	10	7
San Francisco	None	—	—	—	—	—	—
Washington, D.C.	1,722	8	215	20	10	13	3

a. 261 days minus time and leave days times hours worked per day. Time and leave days and total days worked have been rounded off for the purpose of this table. Thus, calculations may differ somewhat due to rounding error.

b. Scheduled work week hours divided by five, minus paid lunch periods.

c. 261 days minus time and leave days.

d. Days of assigned vacation and personal leave, standardized on the basis of a 261-day work year. (Does not include funeral leave.)

e. Annual holidays assigned, standardized on the basis of a 261-day work year. Employee may be required to work on some or all holidays. Payments for this work are classified as part of premium pay.

f. and g. Average days actually utilized for sick leave and for temporary line-of-duty leave (at full pay), standardized on the basis of a 261-day year.

TABLE 17

JANITOR, LEAVE TIME HOURS, FIVE-YEAR LEVEL, 1981

City	Total Annual Hours[a]	Hours Worked Per Day[b]	Total Days Worked[c]	Time and Leave Days			
				Vacations & Personal Leave[d]	Holidays[e]	Sick Leave[f]	Line-of-Duty Leave[g]
Boston	1,513	7	216	15	13	15	2
Chicago	1,942	8	243	10	7	0	1
Dallas	1,882	8	235	10	8	6	2
Detroit	1,686	7.5	225	10	10	11	5
Houston	1,849	8	231	10	11	8	2
Los Angeles	1,770	8	221	15	12	12	2
New York City	1,744	8	218	20	11	12	0
Philadelphia	1,701	8	213	18	14	15	1
Pittsburgh	1,770	8	221	15	13	10	2
San Diego	1,823	8	228	15	9	8	1
San Francisco	1,748	8	219	15	13	12	3
Washington, D.C.	1,734	8	217	20	10	13	1

a. 261 days minus time and leave days times hours worked per day. Time and leave days and total days worked have been rounded off for the purpose of this table. Thus, calculations may differ somewhat due to rounding error.

b. Scheduled work week hours divided by five, minus paid lunch periods.

c. 261 days minus time and leave days.

d. Days of assigned vacation and personal leave, standardized on the basis of a 261-day work year. (Does not include funeral leave.)

e. Annual holidays assigned, standardized on the basis of a 261-day work year. Employee may be required to work on some or all holidays. Payments for this work are classified as part of premium pay.

f. and g. Average days actually utilizied for sick leave and for temporary line-of-duty leave (at full pay), standardized on the basis of a 261-day year.

Washington, D.C., reflect either a shorter standard work week (Boston), or a half hour paid lunch period (Chicago, Philadelphia, Washington, D.C.).[1] Time and leave days range from 207 in Boston and New York City to a high of 227 in San Diego—or 20 extra days worked per year.

Firefighters, in table 15, show the greatest variation in annual hours worked, from 1,700 hours in New York City to over 2,450 hours in Los Angeles, San Diego, and Dallas. That is, firefighters in some cities work as much as 50 percent more annual hours than firefighters in other cities. Much of this variation is associated with work schedules. New York City firefighters, for example, have 40-hour standard work weeks compared with 56-hour work weeks in Los Angeles and San Diego. This shows up as an eight-hour day for New York City firefighters compared to an 11.2-hour day in Los Angeles and San Diego. (All firefighters are assumed to be on call during lunch and are not assigned any paid lunch periods.)

1. Police officers are judged to have time off for lunch when they are not required to listen to the radio or respond to emergency calls during a designated lunch period. This definition is necessarily somewhat arbitrary. In New York City, for example, employees eat lunch "on call" for a designated one hour period and are required to listen to the radio and respond to emergency calls. In this case the lunch period is considered to be part of hours available for work. In Washington, D.C., however, employees are not required to listen to the radio during lunch breaks, and lunch period is not considered to be part of hours available for work. Such distinctions can make a significant difference in hourly compensation costs, even though the probabilities of having to respond to emergency calls during lunch period for cities such as New York may be low.

APPENDIX A

SAMPLE SELECTION

Note: This appendix provides background information on the cities and municipal labor forces covered in the study.

SMSA AND CITY SIZE

The study was designed, at the request of the sponsors, to provide a comparison of municipal compensation in large central cities. There are two criteria that could have been used for selecting cities: (1) population of the city and (2) population of the metropolitan area.

Because it is the size of the metropolitan population rather than that of the city that defines the relevant labor market and determines key characteristics of the city public service workload, metropolitan population was chosen as the basis for city selection. Cities were chosen for the iniital study to cover the central cities of the 12 largest standard metropolitan statistical areas of 1977, as defined by the Bureau of Census. San Diego was added to represent a growing city, and St. Louis was omitted due to data collection problems. For purposes of continuity, this update covers the same 12 cities as the original study. Table A-1, using the most recent available data, shows how the 12 cities rank in terms of SMSA and city population size.

EMPLOYEES PER JOB TITLE

The seven titles represent a large portion of total employment, ranging from 14 percent in Washington, D.C., to 40 percent in Philadelphia and Pittsburgh. The variation in coverage depends largely upon whether teachers, transit workers, hospital employees, and other workers are employed by the city government or by independent bodies. Where these workers are employed by independent bodies, the proportion of city government work force covered by the study is highest. The job titles which cover the largest number of employees are police officer, firefighter, and

TABLE A-1

CITY AND SMSA SIZE,[a] ESTIMATED AS OF 1980 IN THOUSANDS

City	SMSA	Rank[b]	City	Rank
Boston	2,763	10	563	20
Chicago	7,102	3	3,005	2
Dallas	2,975	8	904	7
Detroit	4,353	5	1,203	6
Houston	2,905	9	1,594	5
Los Angeles	7,478	2	2,967	3
New York City	9,120	1	7,071	1
Philadelphia	4,717	4	1,688	4
Pittsburgh	2,264	12	424	30
San Diego	1,862	18	876	8
San Francisco	3,253	6	679	13
Washington, D.C.	3,060	7	638	15

a. Source: U.S. Department of Commerce, Bureau of the Census, 1980 census advance reports by state, Series PHC80-V.
b. Rankings consider only SMSAs with central cities; hence Nassau-Suffolk and Anaheim-Santa Ana-Garden Grove are omitted.

refuse collector. With the exception of Los Angeles, the two clerical titles employ the smallest number.

The size of the work force in the different cities varies widely. New York City (which includes educational employees in the total) employs more than four times as many workers as Chicago, the city with the next largest work force. Pittsburgh and San Diego have the smallest work forces, approximately 3 percent of the size of New York City's work force. Table A-2 shows the number of employees per job title per city, as of 1978.

JOB DESCRIPTIONS

The seven job titles chosen for examination were developed with attention to the following criteria: (1) the functions are generally performed by cities rather than other governments serving urban populations, (2) the functions either represent a major source of expense to city governments or are typical of functions that do, and (3) functions are clearly defined so as to avoid difficulty in finding comparable positions from city to city. Bureau of Labor Statistics job descriptions were used because the descriptions had been tested in actual surveys, insuring their familiarity to and acceptance by the cities included in this survey. The following descriptions were taken verbatim from the Bureau of Labor Statistics *Municipal Government Wage Surveys.*[1]

Police Officer. A member of the police force, usually in uniform, in a nonsupervisory position and with no promotional rank. Carries out general and specific assignments from superior officers in accordance with established rules and procedures. Maintains order, enforces laws and ordinances, and protects life and property in an assigned patrol district or beat by performing a combination of such duties as patrolling a specific area on foot or in a vehicle; directing traffic; issuing traffic summonses; investigating accidents; apprehending, arresting, and processing prisoners; acting as a witness in court. *Exclude* police officers in specialty categories *if additional compensation is paid* (e.g., criminal investigation, ambulance drivers, specialized staff or technical positions).

Firefighter. A full time paid member of the fire department in a nonsupervisory position and with no promotional rank. Duties consist of combatting, extinguishing, and preventing fires, and performing maintenance on own equipment and quarters. *Exclude* firefighters in specialty categories *if additional compensation is paid* (e.g., vehicle drivers and

1. *Municipal Government Wage Surveys,* U.S. Bureau of Labor, Bureau of Labor Statistics, Regional Reports.

TABLE A-2

NUMBER OF EMPLOYEES PER JOB TITLE BY CITY

City	Date of Report	Police Officer	Fire Fighter	Typist B	General Stenographer	Refuse Collector	Janitor	Park Worker	Total, ALL City Employment
Boston	10/78	1,369	1,417	60	4	—	208	187	10,800
Chicago	6/78	9,401	2,627	116	15	1,450	557	108	41,800
Dallas	4/79	1,383	326	43	n.a.	293	213	108	12,301
Detroit	1/79	4,300	680	640	151	768	499	97	24,775
Houston	9/78	2,074	962	304	57	628	273	191	14,090
Los Angeles	10/78	2,529	1,136	1,500	183	454	727	679	35,745
New York City	6/78	18,142 (patrol)	8,629	3,284	1,122	8,235	1,376	127[a]	194,000
Philadelphia	9/78	6,609	2,284	321	73	1,202	359	214	27,000
Pittsburgh	2/79	1,145	784	16	16	299	58	165	6,100
San Diego	11/78	893	345	32	1	190	69	129	5,775
San Francisco	3/79	1,252	1,150	668	184	—	970	148	18,657
Washington, D.C.	10/78	2,593	601	30	8	200	325	—	26,000

a. 1,703 additional workers in this category are employed through federal funding under the Comprehensive Employment and Training Act (CETA).

Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics, Municipal Government Wage Surveys. (With the exception of New York City, where data were provided directly by the city.)

aides of departmental officers, firefighting or rescue apparatus operators and drivers, communications specialists, etc.).

Stenographer. Primary duty is to take dictation using shorthand, and to transcribe the dictation. May also type from written copy. May operate from a stenographic pool. May occasionally transcribe from voice recordings if primary duty is transcribing from recordings. (*Note:* This job is distinguished from that of a secretary in that a secretary normally works in a confidential relationship with only one manager or executive and performs more responsible and discretionary tasks as described in the secretary job definition.)

Stenographer, General. Dictation involves a normal routine vocabulary. May maintain files, keep simple records, or perform other relatively routine clerical tasks.

Typist. Uses a typewriter to make copies of various materials or to make out bills after calculations have been made by another person. May include typing of stencils, mats, or similar materials for use in duplicating processes. May do clerical work involving little special training, such as keeping simple records, filing records and reports, or sorting and distributing incoming mail.

Typist Class B. Performs *one or more of the following:* Copy typing from rough or clear drafts; routine typing of forms, insurance policies, etc.; and setting up simple standard tabulations, or copying more complex tables already set up and spaced properly.

Refuse Collector. Picks up garbage, trash, or refuse from homes and businesses and deposits it in truck.

Refuse Truckdriver. Drives a truck on a designated route for the coillection of garbage, trash, or refuse. May act as work leader of refuse collectors assigned to a truck.

Janitor, Porter, or Cleaner. Cleans and keeps in an orderly condition working areas, washrooms and premises of an office or building. Duties involve a combination of the following: Sweeping, mopping, or scrubbing and polishing floors; removing trash and refuse; dusting equipment, furniture, or fixtures; polishing metal fixtures or trimmings; providing supplies and minor maintenance services; cleaning lavoratories, showers, and restrooms. *Workers who specialize in window washing are excluded.*

Park Worker (BLS Park Laborer: Groundskeeper). Performs a variety of tasks involving cleaning and maintaining the appearance of parks, recreation centers, and other public grounds. Duties typically include mowing lawn and trimming grass and hedges; watering lawn, trees, and flowers; picking up paper and rubbish; and repairing and painting benches, tables, and guardrails.

APPENDIX B

DEFINITION OF COMPENSATION ELEMENTS

PAYROLL

- *Wages.* This is a discrete figure representing the yearly base pay defined as of January 1, plus step increments received by workers in the given job class with the given years of experience. (Step increases include merit increases which are automatically awarded to practically every employee based upon time served.) Wages are recorded on a yearly basis, so that if step increases are at six month intervals, yearly salary is defined as the average of the first and second six month salaries. Longevity payments beyond base salary and step increases are also included at the appropriate rate for the given years of experience.

  In rare cases, other cash payments are made which are included as part of wages. New York City provides a nonpensionable cash payment which is considered part of wages for our purposes. For 1979 figures, New York City COLAs (cost of living adjustments) were considered part of wages. Educational incentive pay is not included, since our employees are assumed not to have a B.A. degree.

- *Shift Differential.* Additional yearly pay above regular day shift rates for work on unusual shifts. (Typists and general stenographers are assumed to have no shift differential.) This is sometimes a discrete figure, when all employees in the given job title receive a set differential payment such as an additional $.20 per hour or an additional 5 percent per hour. If all employees do not receive the differential it is the average payment received, or the average payment received as a percent of salary. (For example, if the shift differential is valued as an additional percent of salary, this is calculated by dividing the annual shift differential payments for the job class by the total base payroll of the job class. In other

cases, the average percent of salary can be measured by knowing, say, that one-third of all police officers receive a 3 percent shift differential. This would be, on the average, a 1 percent differential per police officer.)

INSURANCE BENEFITS

- *Health Insurance.* City contribution for premiums for hospital, surgical, medical, major medical, short-term disability, dental, drug, laboratory, vision care, etc., covering all aspects of the health plan. In health insurance, the cost of coverage varies with the family status of the employee. We assume that the "representative employee" has a spouse and two dependents. Where there is more than one family plan option, the cost of health insurance is the average of the family plan premiums, weighted by the number of employees participating in each plan.
- *Life Insurance.* City contribution for yearly premium for life insurance and/or accidental death and dismemberment insurance.
- *Medical Payments for Line-of-Duty Injury.* The average yearly city expenditure per employee for medical costs which are due to line-of-duty injury and which are in addition to health insurance costs. (Cities have different approaches to such payments. Sometimes Workmen's Compensation provides medical costs for line-of-duty injury for all employees. In other cities, Workmen's Compensation may cover all but police and fire control employees, who are covered directly by general city revenues.) Costs tend to be available by department, and are averaged for the police department, fire department, and sanitation department (refuse collectors). Average expenditures for the other job classes represent the average expenditure for the remainder of city employees and are not broken out by department since these costs tend to be small and data are often difficult to obtain. For police and fire control employees, annual costs of operating special city-run clinics are also included in order to make expenditures comparable from city to city.
- *Union Welfare Funds.* Yearly contributions per active employee made by the city for the purpose of maintaining union-run insurance programs.

RETIREMENT BENEFITS

- *Pension Costs.* The employer contribution in the current year necessary to fully fund the given employee's expected pension

benefits attributable to that year under the entry age normal funding approach. This involves an actuarial calculation using standard economic assumptions (7 percent interest, 5 percent inflation, 6 percent salary scale plus local merit increases) and local decrement rates (rates of withdrawal, service, and disability retirement). Employee contributions and payments for past unfunded liabilities are intentionally excluded.

The methodology used for 1981 costs differs from the 1979 methodology. In 1979, costs were calculated by Peat, Marwick, Mitchell and Company using a hypothetical employee of entry age 21 for each job class. In 1981, costs reflect entry age normal costs for the actual employee population in each city under a given plan, thereby eliminating the use of a hypothetical employee with an arbitrary entry age. This change in methodology was made at the suggestion of management and employee representatives who reviewed the first study. Pension cost calculations for 1981 were made by Howard Winklevoss and Associates, or by the local actuaries responsible for valuing each pension plan.

- *Social Security.* Yearly employer payments as defined on January 1. For 1981, this represents 6.65 percent of gross payroll up to $29,700 (including overtime, etc.) for each eligible employee.

- *Workmen's Compensation.* Average expenditure per active employee for Workmen's Compensation awards for disability retirement which are provided in addition to pension benefits. In cases where an employee cannot receive both a pension and Workmen's Compensation benefits, the latter is counted as 0. These costs are generally broken out for the police, fire, and sanitation departments. The remaining job titles represent the average payment for all remaining city departments.

- *Health Benefits, Retirees.* An abbreviated actuarial technique was used to calculate the city costs associated with a current year of service for retiree health insurance. The basic approach is to take an employee for each job title with an assigned entry age and local withdrawal and retirement probabilities. The city cost for the employee is the contribution required in the current year to create a fund to cover expected payments for health insurance when the employee retires. The 1981 methodology differs from the 1979 methodology in the assignment of entry age to employees. For 1981, the assumed entry age was 25 for uniformed employees and 32 for nonuniformed employees as opposed to 21 for all employees

for 1979. This better approximates actual entry ages as shown in local actuarial studies.

The steps in the calculation are (1) to determine the city costs for retiree health insurance if the hypothetical employee retires at an expected age and lives until 70; (2) to divide these costs by the number of years of active service for this employee: and (3) to multiply the above cost by the probability that the employee will actually reach retirement. Decrement rates from each city are used to figure the probabilities of retirement and withdrawal, with uniformed employee costs figured separately from civilian employee costs.

- *Annuity Funds.* Yearly city contribution per employee for special annuity funds.
- *Sick Leave Reimbursement.* Expected city payments for sick leave reimbursement attributable to the current year. This is calculated by multiplying the probability of reaching retirement (if sick leave is only reimbursed upon retirement) times the value of *unused* sick leave for the given employee in the current year. (If only 50 percent of unused sick leave is reimbursed, the above figure would be multiplied by 1/2.) It is assumed that the interest earned on such payments would be enough to cover salary increases upon retirement. It is also assumed that all police officers and firefighters will reach retirement, that 25 percent of other entry-level workers reach retirement, and that 50 percent of other five-year-level workers reach retirement. In no case does the cost of sick leave reimbursement exceed the stated city maximum.
- *Union Welfare Funds, Retirees.* City costs for union welfare funds for retirees are calculated using the same technique as for retired health insurance costs. The payment to union welfare funds per retiree was multiplied by the number of years of retirement and divided by the number of years of active service. This cost is then multiplied by the probability of the employee reaching retirement.

MISCELLANEOUS BENEFITS

- *Uniform Allowance.* This represents the average allowance (or city cost) per police officer, per firefighter, and per refuse collector (where applicable) for the purpose of replacing or maintaining uniforms. This does not include an allowance or cost attributable to initial issuance of the uniform. (If a city provides a yearly uniform allowance, but requires employees to pay for the initial uniform in the first year, the uniform allowance is counted as zero

in the first year.) In cases where cities assume the cost of uniform replacement but do not issue an allowance, the average cost per employee is still counted.

TIME AND LEAVE BENEFITS

- *Vacation Days.* Vacation days times hours worked per day equals the annual number of hours of vacation time allocated to an employee by job title and years of experience. Thus, vacation days are stated in terms of a 261-day work year.
- *Holidays.* Holidays times hours worked per day equals the annual number of hours of stated holidays. All assigned holidays are counted, and any payment for work done on holidays is counted as part of premium pay.
- *Sick Leave.* Number of full paid sick leave days *utilized* per man year, specific by job class (or more commonly by relevant department). Typists and general stenographers are assigned the city-wide average (or some other generalized measure) since these job titles are spread across all departments. Sick days are stated in terms of a 261-day work year.
- *Line-of-Duty Leave.* Average yearly line-of-duty absence days taken, broken down by police officers, firefighters, sanitation employees (refuse collectors), and all other categories. Where time off is not provided at full pay, this must be translated into the full-pay-equivalent time. (Frequently data on expenditures for line-of-duty absence are available, but the data are not converted to average time lost per worker-year.) Line-of-duty days are stated in terms of a 261-day work year.
- *Other.* Refers to full paid personal leave days. (Funeral leave or coffee break time is not included.) Days are stated in terms of a 261-day work year.

TOTAL NUMBER OF DAYS WORKED

Total number of days worked is 261 minus the sum of time and leave benefit days. (Time and leave benefit days are all stated as if employees worked a 261-day year.)

HOURS WORKED PER DAY

Hours worked per day is a function of scheduled work period and paid lunch time. This is calculated by dividing standard work week hours by

five, and then subtracting any paid lunch period. (Police officers have been assigned a paid lunch in cases where they eat "on call" only if they do not have to listen and respond to radio calls while eating. Firefighters are not credited with a lunch period, because they must respond to calls any time during their duty shift.)

TOTAL NUMBER OF HOURS ANNUALLY

Total number of days worked times hours worked per day equals total number of annual hours. This is hours actually worked based upon the standard work week schedule, minus all paid leave time and paid lunch breaks.

PREMIUM PAY

Includes overtime and holiday pay. Overtime represents annual earnings for time worked beyond the standard work week. Because the overtime rate is always based on salary level, overtime is the average payment received as a percent of salary. This percentage is generally calculated by dividing total annual overtime payments by total base payroll for the job class in question. For example, if $100,000 was spent on overtime for a police force whose base payroll totals $1,000,000, overtime represents 10 percent of salary. For an officer making $10,000, overtime represents $100. (Frequently overtime is only available by department. It is assumed that typists and general stenographers receive no overtime.) No provisions for compensatory time off or overtime are considered, only *payments* for overtime.

Holiday pay represents earnings for time worked on assigned holidays. This is sometimes a discrete number in cases where all employees in a given job class work on holidays. (For 10 holidays, they may all automatically be assigned 10 days at the daily rate.) Where not all employees work on holidays, holiday pay is calculated as a percent of *base* salary in the same manner as overtime.

Several qualifications need to be kept in mind in interpreting premium pay. First, cities differ in their use of compensatory time off, rather than cash payments, in remunerating overtime work. Several of the cities showing zero cash payments for overtime work have policies of compensating overtime work with other time off. Second, overtime pay is not necessarily stable from one year to the next. Finally, cities differ both in their rates of pay for overtime and in their personnel policies toward overtime. To take an extreme example, the City of Los Angeles has a policy of required overtime for firefighters. Straight-time hourly rates are paid for overtime work, and the fire department has the right to require

overtime work at designated periods by designated firefighters. Thus, although the average premium pay in Los Angeles exceeds $5,000 for firefighters, workers may not view the overtime arrangements as having the same value they would have if overtime were paid at a premium rate or if the decision to work were fully voluntary on the part of the worker. Overtime work may also be viewed by the employer as a less expensive way to obtain an hour of employee time than would be the case if more workers were hired, since many nonwage benefits associated with the standard work periods do not need to be paid for overtime hours.

APPENDIX C

COMPONENTS OF COMPENSATION BY CITY

BOSTON[1]

POLICE OFFICER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$13,711	$17,365	$17,915	$15,819	$19,981	$20,631
Differential Pay[4]	512	512	512	1,279	1,587	1,587
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,327	1,327	1,327	1,327	1,327	1,327
Life Insurance[6]	15	15	15	15	15	15
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	144	144	144	152	152	152
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	1,939	2,810	3,157	2,753	3,477	3,590
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Health Benefits[10]	235	235	235	262	262	262
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	300	300	0	300	300
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	15	20	10	15	20
Holidays[14]	13	13	13	13	13	13
Sick Leave[15]	9.2	9.2	9.2	11.52	11.52	11.52
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	17.2	17.2	17.2	14.5	14.5	14.5
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	211.6	206.6	201.6	211.98	206.98	201.98
Hours Worked per Day[18]	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,587	1,550	1,512	1,590	1,552	1,515
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	3,685	4,668	4,815	6,015	7,587	7,817

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

BOSTON[1]

FIREFIGHTER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$14,093	$17,791	$18,293	$16,751	$21,089	$21,789
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,327	1,327	1,327	1,327	1,327	1,327
Life Insurance[6]	15	15	15	15	15	15
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	195	195	195	203	203	203
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	1,966	2,801	3,046	2,914	3,669	3,791
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Health Benefits[10]	235	235	235	262	262	262
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	250	250	0	300	300
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	15	20	10	15	20
Holidays[14]	18.6	18.6	18.6	18.6	18.6	18.6
Sick Leave[15]	7.4	7.4	7.4	7.4	7.4	7.4
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	14.7	14.7	14.7	14.7	14.7	14.7
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	210.3	205.3	200.3	210.3	205.3	200.3
Hours Worked per Day[18]	8.4	8.4	8.4	8.4	8.4	8.4
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,767	1,725	1,683	1,767	1,725	1,683
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	1,050	1,325	1,363	1,248	1,571	1,623

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

BOSTON[1]

TYPIST[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$7,389	$8,670	$8,981	$8,391	$9,672	$10,183
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,327	1,327	1,327	1,327	1,327	1,327
Life Insurance[6]	15	15	15	15	15	15
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	14	14	14	23	23	23
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	436	655	752	814	938	988
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Health Benefits[10]	41	41	41	86	86	86
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	15	25	10	15	25
Holidays[14]	13	13	13	13	13	13
Sick Leave[15]	11.4	11.4	11.4	11.4	11.4	11.4
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	2	2	2	1.8	1.8	1.8
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	224.6	219.6	209.6	224.8	219.8	209.8
Hours Worked per Day[18]	7	7	7	7	7	7
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,572	1,537	1,467	1,574	1,539	1,469
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

BOSTON[1]

STENOGRAPHER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$7,629	$8,981	$9,305	$8,631	$9,983	$10,506
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,327	1,327	1,327	1,327	1,327	1,327
Life Insurance[6]	15	15	15	15	15	15
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	14	14	14	837	968	1,019
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	451	678	777	837	968	1,019
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Health Benefits[10]	41	41	41	86	86	86
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	15	25	10	15	25
Holidays[14]	13	13	13	13	13	13
Sick Leave[15]	11.4	11.4	11.4	11.4	11.4	11.4
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	2	2	2	1.8	1.8	1.8
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	224.6	219.6	209.6	224.8	219.8	209.8
Hours Worked per Day[18]	7	7	7	7	7	7
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,572	1,537	1,467	1,574	1,539	1,469
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

BOSTON[1]

JANITOR[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$8,670	$10,028	$10,028	$9,672	$11,050	$11,250
Differential Pay[4]	173	173	173	173	173	173
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,327	1,327	1,327	1,327	1,327	1,327
Life Insurance[6]	15	15	15	15	15	15
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	14	14	14	23	23	23
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	413	641	715	938	1,072	1,091
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Health Benefits[10]	41	41	41	86	86	86
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	15	25	10	15	25
Holidays[14]	13	13	13	13	13	13
Sick Leave[15]	15	15	15	15	15	15
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	2	2	2	1.8	1.8	1.8
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	221	216	206	221.2	216.2	206.2
Hours Worked per Day[18]	7	7	7	7	7	7
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,547	1,512	1,442	1,548	1,513	1,443
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

BOSTON[1]

PARK WORKER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$8,670	$10,028	$10,028	$9,672	$11,050	$11,250
Differential Pay[4]	186	186	186	232	232	232
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,327	1,327	1,327	1,327	1,327	1,327
Life Insurance[6]	15	15	15	15	15	15
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	14	14	14	23	23	23
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	413	641	715	938	1,072	1,091
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Health Benefits[10]	41	41	41	86	86	86
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	15	25	10	15	25
Holidays[14]	13	13	13	13	13	13
Sick Leave[15]	10.1	10.1	10.1	10.1	10.1	10.1
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	2	2	2	1.8	1.8	1.8
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	225.9	220.9	210.9	226.1	221.1	211.1
Hours Worked per Day[18]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,807	1,767	1,687	1,809	1,769	1,689
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	536	620	620	598	683	695

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

TRENDS IN ENTRY LEVEL SALARY[20]
BOSTON
1973–1982

Job Title	1973	1974	1975	1976	1977	1978	1979	1980	1981	1982
Police Officer	$9,318	$9,831	$10,372	$11,202	$10,986	$12,705	$13,711	$14,741	$15,819	NA
Firefighter	9,318	10,031	10,729	11,495	12,300	13,421	14,093	15,612	16,751	NA
Typist B	5,886	5,886	6,285	6,789	6,789	7,089	7,389	7,683	8,391	$9,091
General Stenographer	6,107	6,107	6,507	7,029	7,029	7,329	7,629	7,929	8,631	9,331
Janitors, Porters, and Cleaners	7,073	7,013	7,472	8,070	8,070	8,370	8,670	8,970	9,672	10,372
Park Worker	7,073	7,073	7,472	8,070	8,070	8,370	8,670	8,970	9,672	10,372

NOTES

Boston

1. The fiscal year begins July 1 and ends June 30.

2. There is no refuse collector category because the city contracts this job out. The following Boston job classifications are comparable to the Urban Institute selected titles:

Urban Institute Class	*Equivalent Boston Classification*
Police Officer	Police Officer, ungraded
Firefighter	Firefighter, ungraded
Typist, Class B	Clerk and Typist, R-2 (Senior Library Assistant LA-2)
General Stenographer	Clerk and Stenographer, R-3
Janitors, Porters, Cleaners	R(3), 5: (M2, 4)
Park Worker	Park Laborer, R-5L

For typists and janitors we have dropped the library workers (M series) since this represents a small portion of the totals. Similarly, janitors are actually comprised of junior building custodians (males) at R-5 and janitresses at R-3. There are only six janitresses (in Police Department) compared to 120 junior building custodians, so we are just considering junior building custodians. (Supposedly, janitresses perform fewer minor repair functions than junior building custodians, yet they receive two steps less in salary and work 40 hours per week as opposed to 35 for junior building custodians.) Finally, there are very few general stenographers in Boston (only four compared to 23 senior stenographers). However, job descriptions of general stenographers correspond more closely to the BLS definition which we have chosen. The Personnel Department verified that stenographers with no previous experience are hired in at this level.

3. Salaries represent annual rates in effect as of January 1, 1979 and January 1, 1981. Base salaries for police officers do not include the built-in night shift differential for night workers. These elements are added in as part of differential pay. For firefighters, a 5.3 percent night shift differential and a 4.75 percent hazardous duty differential are included as part of base salary since all employees receive these differentials.

For FY 1979 and previous years, Boston had a tradition of retroactive pay increases for police officers and firefighters. This is not the case for FY 1980 or FY 1981.

Police officers and firefighters are the only job classes out of our sample which receive longevity payments after five years. Longevity payments have recently been initiated for civilian employees with 10 years of experience, and show up for our employees with 20 years of experience as of 1981. (These were not in effect in 1979.)

4. Shift Differential:

- *Police.* For FY 1981, the Police Department reports that approximately two-thirds of police officers work nights and receive a night shift differential and one-third work days and receive a special lunch differential. For entry level employees, the night differential is $27.27 per week and the lunch differential is $18.95 per week. This averages to an additional $1,279 for entry level officers. Police officers who have worked five or more years receive night differential of $33.85 per week and lunch differential of $23.50 per week. This averages to $1,587 per year for the five and 20 year employees. The 1979 figures represent the total shift differential payments for the uniformed police force, divided by the number of uniformed employees.
- *Firefighters.* For 1981, shift differential for firefighters is 5.3 percent of base salary and is included in regular salary schedule. All firefighters receive this payment automatically. In addition, firefighters receive a special hazardous pay differential of 4.75 percent, which is also included in base salary figures. For 1979, firefighter shift differential represents 2 percent of base salary and is also included in the regular salary schedule.
- *Park Workers.* In 1981, approximately 20 of the 90 park workers receive $20 extra per week for working night shift. In 1979, this same group received an extra $16 per week for working night shift.
- *Janitors.* Shift differential for janitors has not changed since FY 1979. This comes to $173 per person.

5. Health insurance payments represent the average premium paid for family plans for all city employees. This is determined by taking the weighted average of current premium costs (in effect January 1, 1979) for all the family plan options offered to municipal employees in Boston. These costs are the same for FY 1981 since the city has mandated that there be no increase in insurance costs over the past two years.

6. City life insurance contributions come to $1.23 per month per employee for the $2,000 insurance option. Any further coverage is picked up entirely by the employee at no cost to the city. (This has not changed since FY 1979.)

7. Medical coverage for work-related injury for job classes not covered by Workmen's Compensation (police officers and firefighters) is paid for directly by the city:

- *Police.* The Police Department spent $316,000 for line-of-duty injury medical expenses in FY 1980, covering 2,090 sworn personnel. The average payment per person is $152. The figures for 1979 represent the same methodology applied to FY 1979 data.
- *Firefighters.* For FY 1980, the Fire Department spent $395,149 for medical payments for line-of-duty injury. Since there were approximately $1,950 sworn personnel in 1980, the average payment is $203 per person. The figures for 1979 represent the same methodology applied to FY 1979 data.

- *Civilian Employees.* Workmen's Compensation medical coverage applies to all job classes except police and fire. For FY 1980, $486,540 was spent for such coverage, covering 20,750 employees and averaging $23 per person. 1979 figures are based upon the same data for FY 1978.

8. Pension costs are the employer normal cost contributions for the State Boston Retirement System (Group IV for police and fire and Group I for the remaining five job titles). The procedure used for 1981 is an estimation technique, not a full actuarial valuation as is the case for the other 11 cities. (Boston did not provide the necessary actuarial information.) Instead, 1981 normal pension cost percentages for Boston are assumed to have the same relationship to pension costs in other cities as they did using the 1979 methodology. For example, Boston's uniformed pension cost percentage in 1979 was 18 percent below the average of the other cities. The 1981 percentage was chosen so that the 1981 pension cost percentage continues to be 18 percent below the 1981 average for the other cities.

This procedure produces results which appear to be reasonable in light of the findings of Boston's most recent actuarial valuation. This local valuation (using economic assumptions very close to those used in our study) produces an employer entry age normal cost percentage of 12 percent of payroll for the entire Boston system (combined police, fire, and other employees). Our estimation technique produced employer normal costs of 17.4 percent for uniformed and 9.7 percent for nonuniformed employees. This appears reasonable, since police and fire costs would be expected to be somewhat above 12 percent, and nonuniformed costs would be expected to be somewhat below 12 percent.

9. Workmen's Compensation permanent disability awards are counted as zero since pensions are reduced by the amount received.

10. Retiree health costs are calculated using an actuarial approximation which reflects costs per active employee, broken down for uniformed employees and all other employees. Costs are not strickly comparable between 1979 and 1981 since different entry age assumptions are used by hypothetical employees in the two periods.

11. Job classes have the option of being reimbursed for unused sick leave if they have less than five sick days in a given year. For example, if an employee has taken no sick leave, he is reimbursed at the daily rate he is currently earning for five sick days at the end of the year. (The remaining 10 of the 15 allowed days will be carried over.) If he has taken one day, he is reimbursed for four days, and so on. Since our hypothetical employee uses more than five sick days per year, we are assuming no cost for sick leave reimbursed.

12. Uniform allowances are $300 per year for police and $300 per year for fire for FY 1981. (Fire allowance has been increased since 1979.) This goes to pay for the initial purchase in the first year, and for any replacement and maintenance expenses thereafter.

13. Vacation days have not changed between 1979 and 1981.

14. Holidays refer to the number of paid holidays assigned. If an employee is required to come in and work on an assigned holiday, payments for this work would be classified as overtime. Police officers and firefighters work on holidays when they are part of normally scheduled duty. Because they work on holidays, police officers and firefighters are reimbursed for 13 extra days in addition to normal salary. This is counted as part of premium pay.

15. All employees are assigned 15 sick days. (For firefighters, 15 full tours.) Sick leave utilization days for nonuniformed employees represent average days taken for FY 1978. (The city is in the process of collecting more recent data, but results are not yet available.) Data are reported for the Real Property Department (janitors), the Parks Department (estimated for park worker), and the city-wide average for typist and stenographer. Figures for police represent utilization in the Police Department for FY 1978 and FY 1980. The Fire Department reports that FY 1978 data are still valid for approximating 1981 experience.

16. Paid line-of-duty days lost for police are based upon utilization by police officers in the Police Department for FY 1978 and FY 1980. Firefighters in the Fire Department are reported to have the same estimated utilization as FY 1978.

Other employees are covered under Workmen's Compensation. Total spent for disability for FY 1980 was $2,243,512 for 20,750 employees (all but police and fire), or an average of 1.8 days per person (assuming average salary of $60 per day). The same methodology was used for 1979 (using FY 1978 data).

17. Total number of days worked reflects a 261-day work year minus paid time and leave benefits.

18. Hours worked per day is a function of work schedule and lunch policy. Standard work week hours reflect the average work week for which employees receive regular, straight-time earnings.

- *Police Officers.* Police officers work four days and are off two days. This involves 18 extra days off per year. Considering different shifts, this comes to an average of 37.5 hours per week.
- *Firefighters.* "The average work week for firemen is 42 hours, based on an eight-week cycle. The cycle is composed of four 48-hour work weeks, two 38-hour work weeks, and two 34-hour work weeks. A 48-hour work week consists of two 10-hour day shifts and two 14-hour night shifts; a 38-hour week consists of two 14-hour shifts and one 10-hour day shift; and a 34-hour work week consists of two 10-hour day shifts and one 14-hour night shift. Cycles are continuous."
- *Other.* Typists, stenographers, and janitors average a 35-hour week, with 40 hours for park worker.

None of the job titles have been assigned paid lunch, since police officers and firefighters are considered to be on call during lunch.

19. Premium pay stands for all payments for time worked in addition to the scheduled work week. This includes payments for working beyond the normal day

schedule or for coming in on holidays when holidays have been assigned to the job class as a whole.

Premium pay for police officers is the sum of overtime payments for the Police Department (FY 1978 and FY 1980) plus holiday pay (daily rate times 13 holidays). Firefighter premium pay is the average overtime and holiday pay for the Department for FY 1979, since overtime usage has not changed significantly since then. Park worker overtime reflects FY 1978 experience for the park workers in the Parks Department for FY 1978. (FY 1980 data have not yet been compiled.)

20. Salary trends reflect base salary. Shift differential payments are included for firefighters when this became a part of salary. 1978 and 1979 figures for police and fire include expected retroactive increases. Salaries for nonuniformed employees have been determined for FY 1982. As of July 1, 1981 these employees will receive a 7 percent salary increase or an additional $700, whichever is greater.

CHICAGO[1]

POLICE OFFICER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$16,074	$20,304	$22,500	$18,150	$22,920	$25,404
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,620	1,620	1,620	1,892	1,892	1,892
Life Insurance[6]	20	20	20	9	9	9
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	59	59	59	68	68	68
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	1,822	2,304	2,564	1,595	2,015	2,233
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	42	42	42
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	300	300	0	400	400
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	15	18	20	15	18	20
Holidays[14]	12	12	12	12	12	12
Sick Leave[15]	12.1	12.1	12.1	12.1	12.1	12.1
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	3.4	3.4	3.4	3.4	3.4	3.4
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	218.5	215.5	213.5	218.5	215.5	213.5
Hours Worked per Day[18]	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,639	1,616	1,601	1,639	1,616	1,601
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

CHICAGO[1]

FIREFIGHTER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$16,074	$20,304	$22,500	$18,150	$22,920	$25,404
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,620	1,620	1,620	1,892	1,892	1,892
Life Insurance[6]	20	20	20	9	9	9
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	82	82	82	68	68	68
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	1,649	2,085	2,316	2,026	2,558	2,835
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	159	159	159
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	300	300	0	400	400
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	26	26	26	30.7	30.7	30.7
Holidays[14]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave[15]	3.16	3.16	3.16	3.16	3.16	3.16
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	1.96	1.96	1.96	1.96	1.96	1.96
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	229.88	229.88	229.88	225.18	225.18	225.18
Hours Worked per Day[18]	9.38	9.38	9.38	9.38	9.38	9.38
Total Number of Hours Annually	2,156	2,156	2,156	2,112	2,112	2,112
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

CHICAGO[1]

TYPIST[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$7,392	$8,772	$10,596	$9,353	$11,033	$13,392
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,620	1,620	1,620	1,892	1,892	1,892
Life Insurance[6]	20	20	20	9	9	9
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	60	60	60	69	69	69
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	245	286	306	500	590	716
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	81	81	81	317	317	317
*Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	12	12	12
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	10	20	10	10	20
Holidays[14]	12	12	12	12	12	12
Sick Leave[15]	9	9	9	9	9	9
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	4.44	4.44	4.44	1.3	1.3	1.3
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	225.56	225.56	215.56	228.7	228.7	218.7
Hours Worked per Day[18]	7	7	7	7	7	7
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,579	1,579	1,509	1,601	1,601	1,531
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

CHICAGO[1]

STENOGRAPHER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$7,392	$8,772	$10,596	$9,553	$12,348	$14,995
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,620	1,620	1,620	1,892	1,892	1,892
Life Insurance[6]	20	20	20	9	9	9
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	60	60	60	69	69	69
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	245	286	306	511	661	802
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	81	81	81	317	317	317
*Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	12	12	12
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	10	20	10	10	20
Holidays[14]	12	12	12	12	12	12
Sick Leave[15]	9	9	9	9	9	9
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	4.44	4.44	4.44	1.3	1.3	1.3
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	225.56	225.56	215.56	228.7	228.7	218.7
Hours Worked per Day[18]	7	7	7	7	7	7
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,579	1,579	1,509	1,601	1,601	1,531
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

CHICAGO[1]

REFUSE COLLECTOR[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$16,910	$16,910	$16,910	$19,302	$19,302	$19,302
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,620	1,620	1,620	1,892	1,892	1,892
Life Insurance[6]	20	20	20	9	9	9
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	60	60	60	86	86	86
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	797	797	797	1,137	1,137	1,137
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Workmen's Compensation[9]	414	414	414	402	402	402
*Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	4	4	4
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	10	20	10	10	20
Holidays[14]	7	7	7	7	7	7
Sick Leave[15]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	20.43	20.43	20.43	1.53	1.53	1.53
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	223.57	223.57	213.57	242.47	242.47	232.47
Hours Worked per Day[18]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,789	1,789	1,709	1,940	1,940	1,860
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	683	683	683	557	557	557

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

CHICAGO[1]

JANITOR[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$12,744	$12,744	$12,744	$14,322	$14,322	$14,322
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,620	1,620	1,620	1,892	1,892	1,892
Life Insurance[6]	20	20	20	9	9	9
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	60	60	60	69	69	69
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	618	618	618	844	844	844
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	81	81	81	317	317	317
*Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	4	4	4
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	10	20	10	10	20
Holidays[14]	7	7	7	7	7	7
Sick Leave[15]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	4.44	4.44	4.44	1.3	1.3	1.3
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	239.56	239.56	229.56	242.7	242.7	232.7
Hours Worked per Day[18]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,916	1,916	1,836	1,942	1,942	1,862
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

CHICAGO[1]

PARK WORKER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$13,291	$13,291	$13,291	$14,955	$14,955	$14,955
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,620	1,620	1,620	1,892	1,892	1,892
Life Insurance[6]	20	20	20	9	9	9
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	60	60	60	69	69	69
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	626	626	626	881	881	881
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	81	81	81	317	317	317
*Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	4	4	4
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	10	20	10	10	20
Holidays[14]	7	7	7	7	7	7
Sick Leave[15]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	4.44	4.44	4.44	1.3	1.3	1.3
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	239.56	239.56	229.56	242.7	242.7	232.7
Hours Worked per Day[18]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,916	1,916	1,836	1,942	1,942	1,862
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

TRENDS IN ENTRY LEVEL SALARY[20]
CHICAGO
1973–1981

Job Title	1973	1974	1975	1976	1977	1978	1979	1980	1981	1982
Police Officer	$10,842	$11,484	$12,420	$13,110	$13,632	$14,340	$16,074	$17,040	$18,150	NA
Fire-fighter	10,842	11,484	12,420	13,110	13,632	14,340	16,074	17,040	18,150	NA
Typist B	5,496	5,796	6,246	6,594	6,792	7,068	7,392	7,812	8,328	NA
General Stenographer	5,496	5,796	6,246	6,594	6,792	7,068	7,392	7,812	8,328	NA
Refuse Collector	11,232	11,960	13,104	14,165	14,893	15,870	16,910	17,950	19,302	NA
Janitors, Porters, and Cleaners	8,862	9,390	10,188	10,800	11,340	11,964	12,744	13,446	14,322	NA
Park Worker	9,194	9,734	10,566	11,253	11,814	12,480	13,291	14,040	14,955	NA

NOTES

Chicago

1. The fiscal year begins January 1 and ends December 31.

2. The following municipal job classifications match our selected job titles:

Urban Institute Class	*Equivalent Chicago Classification*
Police Officer	Police Officer, FP Grade 1
Firefighter	Firefighter, FP Grade 1
Typist, Class B	Typist, Class B, BSS Grade 2, Senior Typist, 0836, Grade 5
General Stenographer	Junior Stenographer, BSS Grade 2, Senior Stenographer, Grade 6
Refuse Collector	Sanitation Laborer, PR
Janitors, Porters, Cleaners	Custodial Worker, PR
Park Worker	Park Laborer, PR

There has been a redefinition of job match for typist and general stenographer between 1979 and 1981. The city is gradually moving to a policy of hiring senior typists and stenographers rather than the junior levels. Because these senior levels require no experience and are performing the same function as the junior level, salaries reported for 1981 are the weighted average of the two levels. (In FY 1979 only the junior level salaries were reported.) Now it is quite rare to hire a junior person.

3. Salaries represent annual rates in effect as of January 1, 1979 and January 1, 1981. Entry level salaries for police officers and firefighters represent the average of the entry rate and the six-month rate. Longevity payments are included in the salary schedules, except for prevailing rate positions (refuse collector, janitor, and park worker) which do not have built-in increases.

For FY 1981 there are 103 typists (Grade 2) in contrast to 373 senior typists, and seven junior stenographers in contrast to 103 senior stenographers. Salaries presented are the weighted averages at the appropriate experience levels.

Salaries for firefighter and police officer may be subject to retroactive increases as a result of upcoming arbitration proceedings. As of now, the salaries reported apply for January 1, 1981.

4. There is no shift differential for any of the job classes studied.

5. Figures represent city costs per employee for family plan health insurance coverage.

6. As of FY 1981, Chicago pays 77.5 cents per month toward life insurance, or $9.00 per year per employee. For FY 1979 this came to $20 per year.

7. Data represent average city medical payments for injury incurred in the line of duty for sworn personnel (combined police and fire), the Sanitation Depart-

ment (refuse collectors) and other employees. Figures are based upon experiences in 1980 and 1978.

8. Pension costs are the employer normal cost contributions for the Policemen's Annuity and Benefit Fund, the Firemen's Annuity and Benefit Fund, the Laborers' and Retirement Board Employees' Annuity and Benefit Fund (refuse collectors, park workers, and janitors), and the Municipal Employees' Annuity and Benefit Fund (typists and stenographers). Pension methodologies for 1979 and 1981 are not comparable. (See text of main report.)

9. Police and fire receive no special disability awards, aside from pensions. Other employees receive permanent disability awards through Workmen's Compensation.

- *Refuse Collectors.* For FY 1978, $1,181,912 was spent for 2,853 sanitation workers, averaging $414 per person. Data for FY 1980 were not available for the group of sanitation workers, but were available for the entire Sanitation Department. For FY 1980 the Sanitation Department spent $2,611,415 for permanent disability awards. With 6,500 employees, this averages $402 per person.
- *Other.* For FY 1980, $4,597,708 was spent on permanent disability awards for 14,500 other employees (excluding police, fire, and sanitation). For FY 1978, $1,181,912 was spent for 22,647 employees, averaging $81.

10. The city's policy is to deduct a portion of retiree health costs from annuitants' pension checks. The remainder is paid by the city and is independent of pension benefits. Average health benefits for retired employees for 1981 are calculated for the current year of an active employee's life using an actuarial approach. Average expenditures are based upon experience in 1980 for uniformed police, uniformed fire, labor, and municipal employees. These costs were not calculated for 1979.

11. There is no sick leave reimbursement for the job titles studied.

12. For 1981, police officers and firefighters receive a uniform allowance of $400 per year to purchase, maintain, and replace their uniforms. Since employees pay for the initial uniform in the first year, the uniform allowance is considered as zero for entry employees. As of January 1979 this allowance was $300.

13. Vacation days were increased for firefighters since FY 1979. Firefighters now receive two furloughs of 20 consecutive days each. This gives them a total of 12 24-hour tours off, or a vacation period of 288 hours. This comes to 30.7 9.38-hour days. Furlough days include recognition of specific holidays.

14. Holidays stand for the number of paid holidays assigned. If an employee is required to work on an assigned holiday, payment for this work is classified as overtime. Police required to work on a holiday receive straight time compensatory leave. The uniformed firefighter's paid furlough (vacation) includes eight calendar days in lieu of paid holidays.

15. Sick leave taken:

- *Police.* Data are used for FY 1978 since this is the latest information available.
- *Firefighters.* Uniformed firefighters are eligible for 365 calendar days of sick leave, at full pay, upon entering duty. There is no accumulation of sick leave. The Fire Department used 16,772 days in FY 1978. Dividing by the total number in the Department (4,500) yields an average of 3.6 eight-hour (not tour) days per firefighter. There is no major expected change in sick leave utilization for FY 1981.
- *Typists and General Stenographers.* White collar employees are eligible for 12 days of paid sick leave per year. Because sick leave figures are unavailable for typists and since other cities with similar sick leave provisions average nine days per employee per year, we assume nine days' sick leave.
- *Janitors, Park Workers, and Refuse Collectors.* These prevailing rate positions do not receive and cannot accumulate paid sick leave.

16. Absence resulting from line-of-duty injury is paid directly by the city for police and fire employees. Data for police are for FY 1978, since this is the latest information available. Data for firefighters are also for FY 1978, since there is no major expected change in utilization between FY 1978 and FY 1981.

For refuse collectors and other employees, line-of-duty injury days are calculated by dividing the sum spent on Workmen's Compensation for temporary absence by the number of workers and the daily wage rate. Data represent experience in 1980 and 1978 for the Sanitation Department (refuse collectors) and other employees.

17. Total number of days worked reflects a 261-day work year minus paid time and leave benefits.

18. Hours worked per day is a function of work schedule and lunch policy. Standard work week hours represent the average work week for which employees receive regular, straight-time earnings.

Police work five day shifts (8:00 a.m. to 4:00 p.m.) per week for four weeks, rotate to five night shifts (4:00 p.m. to midnight) per week for four weeks, then rotate to five morning shifts (midnight to 8:00 a.m.) per week for four weeks, thus completing the cycle. Police officers are off duty for 72 hours between rotation. Police, on the average, work 40 hours a week.

Firefighters work 24 hours on duty followed by 48 hours off duty. Each sixth duty shift is given as a day off. The average work week is 46.9 hours. Typists and stenographers work a 35-hour week.

Paid lunch refers to a block of time set aside for lunch each day which is included in paid work week hours. Police officers are allowed 30 minutes for lunch. The police dispatcher does not contact officers on lunch, and although most officers monitor the radio during lunch, they are not required to respond to calls. The other job classes are not assigned paid lunch. (Firefighters are on call.)

19. Premium pay stands for all payments for time worked in addition to the scheduled work week, or for working holidays when holidays have been assigned to the job class as a whole.

Refuse collectors are the only title studied to receive premium pay. The Bureau of Sanitation estimates that for 1981, the average refuse collector receives five overtime days at time and a half. For 1979 the estimate was seven overtime days at time and a half.

20. Salary trends reflect base salary of entry level employees as of January 1 of each calendar year. Salaries in 1980 for Typist B and General Stenographer are for the junior positions (not weighted with the senior positions). FY 1982 salaries have not yet been determined for any of the seven job classifications.

DALLAS[1]

POLICE OFFICER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$15,109	$17,407	$18,127	$17,682	$20,388	$21,108
Differential Pay	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[4]	320	320	320	351	351	351
Life Insurance[5]	17	17	17	17	17	17
Medical, Line-of-Duty[6]	88	88	88	88	88	88
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[7]	2,088	2,406	1,961	3,090	3,563	3,689
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[8]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Health Benefits[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[10]	260	296	296	305	352	364
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[11]	0	135	135	0	175	175
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[12]	12	12	20	12	12	20
Holidays[13]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Sick Leave[14]	4.7	4.7	4.7	5.53	5.53	5.53
Line-of-Duty Leave[15]	2	2	2	1.7	1.7	1.7
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[16]	234.3	234.3	226.3	233.77	233.77	225.77
Hours Worked per Day[17]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,874	1,874	1,810	1,870	1,870	1,806
Premium Pay[18] (not part of total compensation)	271	308	308	601	693	718

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

DALLAS[1]

FIREFIGHTER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$15,067	$17,407	$18,127	$17,682	$20,388	$21,108
Differential Pay	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[4]	320	320	320	351	351	351
Life Insurance[5]	17	17	17	17	17	17
Medical, Line-of-Duty[6]	87	87	87	109	109	109
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[7]	2,425	2,801	1,870	2,988	3,446	3,567
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[8]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Health Benefits[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[10]	289	329	329	339	391	404
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[11]	0	95	95	0	177	177
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[12]	11.1	11.1	22.2	11.1	11.1	22.2
Holidays[13]	8.9	8.9	8.9	8.9	8.9	8.9
Sick Leave[14]	7.2	7.2	7.2	6.1	6.1	6.1
Line-of-Duty Leave[15]	4.6	4.6	4.6	3.3	3.3	3.3
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[16]	229.2	229.2	218.1	231.6	231.6	220.5
Hours Worked per Day[17]	10.8	10.8	10.8	10.8	10.8	10.8
Total Number of Hours Annually	2,475	2,475	2,355	2,501	2,501	2,381
Premium Pay[18] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

DALLAS[1]

TYPIST[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$7,200	$9,629	$10,219	$8,832	$11,567	$12,600
Differential Pay	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[4]	320	320	320	351	351	351
Life Insurance[5]	17	17	17	17	17	17
Medical, Line-of-Duty[6]	52	52	52	56	56	56
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[7]	725	969	927	698	914	1,197
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[8]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Health Benefits[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[10]	29	77	157	38	100	217
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[12]	10	10	20	10	10	20
Holidays[13]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Sick Leave[14]	7.8	7.8	7.8	6.5	6.5	6.5
Line-of-Duty Leave[15]	1.3	1.3	1.3	1.5	1.5	1.5
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[16]	233.9	233.9	223.9	235	235	225
Hours Worked per Day[17]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,871	1,871	1,791	1,880	1,880	1,800
Premium Pay[18] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

DALLAS[1]

STENOGRAPHER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$8,280	$11,221	$11,907	$10,176	$13,474	$14,666
Differential Pay	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[4]	320	320	320	351	351	351
Life Insurance[5]	17	17	17	17	17	17
Medical, Line-of-Duty[6]	52	52	52	56	56	56
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[7]	834	1,130	1,080	804	1,064	1,393
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[8]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Health Benefits[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[10]	33	89	182	44	116	253
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[12]	10	10	20	10	10	20
Holidays[13]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Sick Leave[14]	7.8	7.8	7.8	6.5	6.5	6.5
Line-of-Duty Leave[15]	1.3	1.3	1.3	1.5	1.5	1.5
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[16]	233.9	233.9	223.9	235	235	225
Hours Worked per Day[17]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,871	1,871	1,791	1,880	1,880	1,800
Premium Pay[18] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

DALLAS[1]

REFUSE COLLECTOR[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$8,100	$9,155	$9,549	$9,504	$11,269	$11,705
Differential Pay	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[4]	320	320	320	351	351	351
Life Insurance[5]	17	17	17	17	17	17
Medical, Line-of-Duty[6]	108	108	108	189	189	189
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[7]	128	145	127	785	930	1,159
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[8]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Health Benefits[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[10]	20	45	90	41	97	202
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[12]	10	10	20	10	10	20
Holidays[13]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Sick Leave[14]	8.4	8.4	8.4	7.3	7.3	7.3
Line-of-Duty Leave[15]	6.4	6.4	6.4	7.4	7.4	7.4
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[16]	228.2	228.2	218.2	228.3	228.3	218.3
Hours Worked per Day[17]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,826	1,826	1,746	1,826	1,826	1,746
Premium Pay[18] (not part of total compensation)	1,317	1,467	1,467	428	500	500

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

DALLAS[1]

JANITOR[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$6,799	$9,006	$9,563	$8,332	$10,831	$11,802
Differential Pay	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[4]	320	320	320	351	351	351
Life Insurance[5]	17	17	17	17	17	17
Medical, Line-of-Duty[6]	52	52	52	56	56	56
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[7]	92	123	111	671	873	1,143
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[8]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Health Benefits[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[10]	29	77	157	36	93	203
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[12]	10	10	20	10	10	20
Holidays[13]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Sick Leave[14]	6.8	6.8	6.8	6.28	6.28	6.28
Line-of-Duty Leave[15]	1.3	1.3	1.3	1.5	1.5	1.5
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[16]	234.9	234.9	224.9	235.22	235.22	225.22
Hours Worked per Day[17]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,879	1,879	1,799	1,882	1,882	1,802
Premium Pay[18] (not part of total compensation)	18	23	24	167	214	225

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

DALLAS[1]

PARK WORKER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$7,784	$8,762	$9,090	$9,349	$11,064	$11,478
Differential Pay	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[4]	320	320	320	351	351	351
Life Insurance[5]	17	17	17	17	17	17
Medical, Line-of-Duty[6]	52	52	52	56	56	56
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[7]	108	121	105	746	883	1,101
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[8]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Health Benefits[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[10]	34	75	149	39	93	193
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[12]	10	10	20	10	10	20
Holidays[13]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Sick Leave[14]	4.1	4.1	4.1	7.57	7.57	7.57
Line-of-Duty Leave[15]	1.3	1.3	1.3	1.5	1.5	1.5
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[16]	237.6	237.6	227.6	233.93	233.93	223.93
Hours Worked per Day[17]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,901	1,901	1,821	1,871	1,871	1,791
Premium Pay[18] (not part of total compensation)	87	87	87	93	109	109

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

TRENDS IN ENTRY LEVEL SALARY[19]
DALLAS
1973–1981

Job Title	1973	1974	1975	1976	1977	1978	1979	1980	1981	1982
Police Officer	$8,976	$9,612	$10,752	$11,508	$12,312	$13,236	$15,475	$16,560	$18,162	NA
Fire-fighter	8,976	9,612	10,752	11,508	12,312	13,236	15,475	16,560	18,162	NA
Typist B	5,376	5,592	6,192	6,492	6,816	7,188	7,356	8,244	9,036	NA
General Stenographer	6,264	6,516	7,140	7,488	7,860	8,292	8,496	9,504	10,428	NA
Refuse Collector	5,472	5,700	6,468	6,780	7,116	7,512	8,196	8,772	9,612	NA
Janitors, Porters and Cleaners	5,376	5,592	6,192	6,492	6,816	7,188	7,356	7,692	8,436	NA
Park Worker	5,472	5,700	6,468	6,780	7,116	7,512	8,196	8,772	9,612	NA

NOTES

Dallas

1. The fiscal year begins October 1 and ends September 30.

2. The following Dallas municipal job classifications were verified by the Dallas City Personnel Department as matching our selected BLS job titles:

Urban Institute Class	*Equivalent Dallas Classification*
Police Officer	Police Officer, 46004, ungraded
Firefighter	Fire & Rescue Officer, 44002, ungraded
Typist, Class B	Clerk-Typist, 32008, Grade 3
General Stenographer	Stenographer/Secretary, Grade 5, (32202)
Refuse Collector	Sanitation Worker, (72001), Grade 56
Janitors, Porters, Cleaners	Building Maintenance Attendant, Grades 2, 3
Park Worker	Groundskeeper, Grades 54, 55, 56

3. The following procedures were used to determine wages:

- *Fire.* Normal progression is to advance from Apprentice to Probationary Fire and Rescue Officer after four months in the academy and two months of on-the-job training. To determine the entry level salary for the first 12 months of employment, the average is taken of the Apprentice and Probationary rates.
- *Police.* Apprentices receive six months of on-the-job training before progressing to Probationary Police Officer. Probationary period lasts six months before progression to fully qualified Police Officer. To determine the entry level salary for the first 12 months of employment, the average is taken of the Apprentice and Probationary Police Officer rates.
- *Typist, Stenographer and Refuse Collector.* The average is taken of the first and second six-month periods to determine entry level salary.
- *Park Worker and Janitor.* Salaries for each longevity period represent the weighted average based upon the number of employees in each grade. For groundskeepers in FY 1981 there are 21 employees in Grade 54, 20 in Grade 55, and 93 in Grade 56. For building maintenance attendants in 1981 there are 197 in Grade 2 and 30 in Grade 3.

Longevity payments are added to base salary. This amounts to $4.00 per month for each year of service for police officers and firefighters, up to a maximum of $100 per month for 25 years of service. For other employees, longevity pay is 1¼ percent of gross wages (including overtime) for the five year employee and 5 percent of gross wages for the 20 year employee. (No longevity payments in the first year.)

4. Health insurance premiums represent the average premium paid for family plans for the vast majority of city employees. The City of Dallas pays the full

cost only for the individual's coverage. Any additional family coverage must be paid for by the employee.

5. The city contributes $1.40 per month per employee for $5,000 basic coverage for life insurance premiums for FY 1981, or $17 per year.

6. Workmen's Compensation medical coverage is the average payment per employee for medical coverage for line-of-duty injury or illness covered under Workmen's Compensation. Expenditures are considered separately for the Police Department, Fire Department, Sanitation Department, and all other civilian employees.

7. Pension costs are employer normal cost contributions for the Employee's Retirement Fund (separated for employees hired before 1972) and the Police and Fire Alarm Operators' Pension Fund. Pension methodologies for 1979 and 1981 are not comparable. (See text of main report.) For uniformed employees, the old system is less costly than the new system under the 1979 methodology. In addition, the 1979 methodology uses different utilization rates for clerical and blue collar employees, while the 1981 methodology assigns one normal cost figure for the entire plan.

8. There is no permanent disability Workmen's Compensation payment. Disability retirement is paid for only through the Retirement System.

9. There are no additional city costs for health benefits for retired employees.

10. All employees who retire or have 20 years or more of experience receive full payment for up to *90 days* of unused sick leave. (For police and fire, an employee receives payment for unused sick leave upon disability retirement, regardless of age or length of service.) Firefighters receive reimbursements based upon hourly rates.

11. Uniformed police officers and firefighters are provided uniforms and replacements at no charge. No additional compensation is provided to the employee for cleaning or maintenance. Figures cited represent the average cost per uniformed employee for uniform replacement in the Police and Fire Departments for FY 1979 and FY 1981.

12. Vacation leave begins to accrue at the time of an employee's entry on duty; however, it can not be used during the first six months of service, and is forfeited if the employee terminates during that time.

13. Employees are assigned eight holidays (or four 24-hour periods for firefighters). Firefighters receive four 24-hour shifts off during the year in lieu of specific holidays. Other employees required to work on a holiday receive a substitute day off within a reasonably short period.

14. All employees accrue 12 days of paid sick leave a year, accumulated to a maximum of 150 days. (A sick leave day is equal to 12 hours for firefighters, eight hours for all others.) Sick leave utilization for FY 1979 and FY 1981 is determined

by dividing the total number of paid sick leave days lost by the number of employees in the relevant department. Data are taken for the Police Department, Fire Department, Streets and Sanitation Department, Building Service Department, and Parks Department. Sick leave utilization for typist and stenographer represents the city-wide average. Annual sick leave utilization for FY 1981 and FY 1979 is based upon experience in FY 1980 and FY 1978, respectively.

15. Workmen's Compensation (as mandated by the state) pays a minimum per week for absence due to line-of-duty injury. Then for 13 weeks the city supplements this payment to full salary as part of the "salary continuance" program. Expenditures for the minimum payments and the "continuance" payments are obtained for the Police, Fire, and Sanitation Departments and for all other employees. The sum of these expenditures is divided by the number of employees in the relevant groups and converted to average full paid days lost. Data for FY 1981 and FY 1979 represent expenditures in FY 1980 and FY 1978.

16. Total number of days worked reflects a 261-day work year minus paid time and leave benefits.

17. Hours worked per day is a function of work schedule and lunch policy. Standard work week hours represent the average work week for which employees receive regular, straight-time earnings. All employees except firefighters and refuse collectors work a five-day, 40-hour week:

- *Firefighters.* Work according to the following schedule: 24 hours on duty followed by 48 hours off. There is an additional 24 hours off every 12 weeks. This averages 54 hours per week.
- *Refuse Collectors.* Work a 40-hour week but it is scheduled in four 10-hour days. Vacations, holidays, and sick days are all in terms of eight-hour days.

No paid lunch period is assigned for the seven job classifications. Police officers and firefighters eat on duty. (On-call situations are not credited as paid lunch.)

18. Premium pay stands for all payments for time worked in addition to the scheduled work week. Figures reflect average overtime expenditures (as a percent of payroll) for the Police Department, Fire Department, the Sanitation Division of the Streets and Sanitation Department, and the Park Maintenance Division of the Parks Department. Data for FY 1981 and FY 1979 represent expenditures for FY 1980 and FY 1978.

19. Trends in entry level salaries reflect salaries as of January 1 of each year. For police and fire, salaries represent beginning salaries after the completion of the apprentice and probationary periods. For other job titles, salaries represent payments for the last six months of the first year. Salaries for janitors and park workers are for the grade that contains the majority of employees (Grade 2 for janitors and Grade 56 for park workers). FY 1982 salaries have not yet been established for any of the seven job classifications.

DETROIT[1]

POLICE OFFICER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$17,271	$22,210	$22,510	$21,184	$26,296	$26,596
Differential Pay[4]	173	222	225	169	210	213
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,704	1,704	1,704	2,068	2,068	2,068
Life Insurance[6]	58	58	58	53	53	53
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	148	148	148	180	180	180
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	1,938	2,491	3,627	4,025	4,996	7,713
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Health Benefits[10]	208	208	208	341	341	341
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	164	213	216	185	229	232
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	74	74	0	70	70
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	20	20	20	20	20	20
Holidays[14]	9	9	9	9	9	9
Sick Leave[15]	10	10	10	10.89	10.89	10.89
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	4.7	4.7	4.7	3.1	3.1	3.1
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	217.3	217.3	217.3	218.01	218.01	218.01
Hours Worked per Day[18]	7.9	7.9	7.9	7.9	7.9	7.9
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,717	1,717	1,717	1,722	1,722	1,722
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	898	1,155	1,171	1,123	1,394	1,410

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

DETROIT[1]

FIREFIGHTER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$17,271	$22,210	$22,510	$21,184	$26,296	$26,596
Differential Pay[4]	328	422	428	390	390	390
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,704	1,704	1,704	2,068	2,068	2,068
Life Insurance[6]	58	58	58	53	53	53
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	148	148	148	185	185	185
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	1,996	2,569	3,654	4,025	4,996	7,713
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Health Benefits[10]	208	208	208	341	341	341
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	116	149	151	231	286	289
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	100	100	0	100	100
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	19	19	19	19	19	23.8
Holidays[14]	10.71	10.71	10.71	10.71	10.71	10.71
Sick Leave[15]	8.69	8.69	8.69	8.69	8.69	8.69
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	13.98	13.98	13.98	13.98	13.98	13.98
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	197.36	197.36	197.36	208.62	208.62	203.82
Hours Worked per Day[18]	10.08	10.08	10.08	10.08	10.08	10.08
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,989	1,989	1,989	2,103	2,103	2,055
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	484	622	630	847	1,052	1,064

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

DETROIT[1]

TYPIST[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$10,075	$12,523	$15,077	$11,052	$14,045	$16,641
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,704	1,704	1,704	2,068	2,068	2,068
Life Insurance[6]	58	58	58	53	53	53
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	125	125	125	135	135	135
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	672	837	1,020	1,138	1,447	1,714
Social Security	618	768	924	735	934	1,107
*Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	230	230	230
*Health Benefits[10]	41	41	41	45	45	45
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	14	36	87	16	40	96
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	10	20	10	10	20
Holidays[14]	9	9	9	10	10	10
Sick Leave[15]	10.8	10.8	10.8	11.31	11.31	11.31
*Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	5.44	5.44	5.44	4.87	4.87	4.87
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	225.76	225.76	215.76	224.82	224.82	214.82
Hours Worked per Day[18]	7	7	7	7	7	7
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,580	1,580	1,510	1,574	1,574	1,504
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

DETROIT[1]

STENOGRAPHER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$10,194	$12,409	$15,213	$11,171	$14,236	$16,782
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,704	1,704	1,704	2,068	2,068	2,068
Life Insurance[6]	58	58	58	53	53	53
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	125	125	125	135	135	135
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	679	830	1,030	1,151	1,466	1,729
Social Security	625	761	933	743	947	1,116
*Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	230	230	230
*Health Benefits[10]	41	41	41	45	45	45
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	14	36	87	16	41	96
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	10	20	10	10	20
Holidays[14]	9	9	9	10	10	10
Sick Leave[15]	10.8	10.8	10.8	11.31	11.31	11.31
*Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	5.44	5.44	5.44	4.87	4.87	4.87
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	225.76	225.76	215.76	224.82	224.82	214.82
Hours Worked per Day[18]	7	7	7	7	7	7
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,580	1,580	1,510	1,574	1,574	1,504
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

DETROIT[1]

REFUSE COLLECTOR[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$13,947	$14,987	$15,609	$14,924	$16,901	$17,201
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,704	1,704	1,704	2,068	2,068	2,068
Life Insurance[6]	58	58	58	53	53	53
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	125	125	125	135	135	135
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	887	941	980	1,811	2,051	2,087
Social Security	1,028	1,104	1,150	1,169	1,324	1,348
*Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	230	230	230
*Health Benefits[10]	41	41	41	45	45	45
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	20	43	90	21	49	99
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	80	80	0	70	70
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	10	20	10	10	20
Holidays[14]	9	9	9	10	10	10
Sick Leave[15]	11.14	11.14	11.14	11.54	11.54	11.54
*Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	5.44	5.44	5.44	4.87	4.87	4.87
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	225.42	225.42	215.42	224.59	224.59	214.59
Hours Worked per Day[18]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,803	1,803	1,723	1,797	1,797	1,717
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	2,815	3,025	3,151	2,659	3,011	3,065

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

DETROIT[1]

JANITOR[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$10,565	$12,905	$14,997	$11,542	$14,616	$16,560
Differential Pay[4]	502	502	502	520	520	520
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,704	1,704	1,704	2,068	2,068	2,068
Life Insurance[6]	58	58	58	53	53	53
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	125	125	125	135	135	135
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	655	801	940	1,242	1,559	1,759
Social Security	678	822	950	802	1,007	1,136
*Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	230	230	230
*Health Benefits[10]	41	41	41	45	45	45
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	15	37	86	17	42	95
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	100	100	0	140	140
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	10	20	10	10	20
Holidays[14]	9	9	9	10	10	10
Sick Leave[15]	10.8	10.8	10.8	11.31	11.31	11.31
*Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	5.44	5.44	5.44	4.87	4.87	4.87
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	225.76	225.76	215.76	224.82	224.82	214.82
Hours Worked per Day[18]	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,693	1,693	1,618	1,686	1,686	1,611
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

DETROIT[1]

PARK WORKER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$13,634	$14,675	$15,276	$14,612	$16,557	$16,757
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,704	1,704	1,704	2,068	2,068	2,068
Life Insurance[6]	58	58	58	53	53	53
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	125	125	125	135	135	135
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	865	920	958	1,505	1,705	1,726
Social Security	836	900	936	972	1,101	1,114
*Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	230	230	230
*Health Benefits[10]	41	41	41	45	45	45
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	20	42	88	21	48	96
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	80	80	0	70	70
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	10	20	10	10	20
Holidays[14]	9	9	9	10	10	10
Sick Leave[15]	11.14	11.14	11.14	11.54	11.54	11.54
*Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	5.44	5.44	5.44	4.87	4.87	4.87
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	225.42	225.42	215.42	224.59	224.59	214.59
Hours Worked per Day[18]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,803	1,803	1,723	1,797	1,797	1,717
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

TRENDS IN ENTRY LEVEL SALARY[20]
DETROIT
1973–1982

Job Title	1973	1974	1975	1976	1977	1978	1979	1980	1981	1982
Police Officer	$9,666	$10,666	$12,382	$13,340	$14,519	$15,806	$17,271	$19,457	$21,184	$21,184
Fire-fighter	9,666	10,666	12,382	13,340	14,519	15,806	17,271	19,457	21,184	NA
Typist B	7,891	8,598	9,850	10,983	12,046	10,012	10,075	10,220	11,052	11,052
General Stenographer	8,040	8,797	9,999	11,132	12,195	10,131	10,194	10,339	11,171	11,171
Refuse Collector	9,017	9,724	11,284	12,449	13,468	13,884	13,947	14,092	14,924	14,924
Janitors, Porters, and Cleaners	9,017	9,724	10,972	12,095	13,156	13,572	13,634	10,710	11,542	11,542
Park Worker	8,504	9,211	10,463	11,596	12,659	10,502	10,565	13,780	14,612	14,612

NOTES

Detroit

1. The fiscal year begins on July 1 and ends June 30.

2. The following Detroit job classifications are comparable to the Urban Institute selected titles:

Urban Institute Class	*Equivalent Detroit Classification*
Police Officer	Police Officer
Firefighter	Firefighter
Typist, Class B	Junior typist for entry, then regular typist at 4 and 20 year levels
General Stenographer	Junior stenographer for entry, then regular stenographer at 4 and 20 year levels
Refuse Collector	Refuse collector—loads, but does not drive
Janitors, Porters, Cleaners	Building Attendant A
Park Worker	Laborer A

3. Wages are as of January 1, 1981 and January 1, 1979 and include longevity payments for 20 year employees. Wages reflect across-the-board increases taking place in January 1981. The Typist B at entry level is a junior typist in Detroit. The junior typist normally becomes a typist within five years, hence the salaries shown are junior typist at entry year and regular typist at four and 20 years. The same situation exists for stenographers.

4. Total shift differential costs for police for FY 1980 are $947,112. Total base salary for sworn personnel is $112,909,770. Average differential payment as a percent of salary equals .8 percent. Total shift differential costs for police for FY 1979 are $1,153,370. Total base salary for sworn personnel is $118,509,370. Average differential payment as a percent of salary equals 1 percent.

For FY 1980 the average firefighter received shift differential payments of $390. The flat rate was 25 cents per hour for afternoon shift and 30 cents per hour for midnight shift. For FY 1978, firefighters on a 24-hour schedule received 25 cents extra per hour after 8:00 p.m. Figures reflect FY 1978 payments as a percent of base salary.

Total shift differential for building attendants (janitors) for FY 1980 was $49,400. With 95 building attendants this averages $520 per employee. The total cost for shift differential payments to building attendants in the Detroit-Wayne Joint Building Authority in FY 1979 was $56,178. With 112 building attendants, the average payment per employee is $502. Shift differential is paid on a flat rate basis.

5. Yearly city cost per employee for family health insurance is $2,067.52 for FY 1980 and $1,704.00 for FY 1979. (The family premium is the same for all three of Detroit's health plans.)

6. Life insurance costs for over $10,000 salary come to $53.04 per year for the city for FY 1980 and $58.31 for FY 1979.

7. Total costs for medical payments for police in FY 1980 are $721,568, which cover both short-term and permanent duty-related injuries. The total number of personnel covered is 4,000; the average medical payment is $180. For FY 1979, total costs are $813,925, total number of personnel covered is 5,517, and average medical payment is $148.15.

The Fire Department calculates that average medical payments for line-of-duty injury for FY 1980 came to $185 per sworn fire personnel. In FY 1978 the average was $148.15.

Civilian employees' duty-related injuries are covered by Workmen's Compensation. In addition, police and fire medical costs are picked up by Workmen's Compensation after the first year (the two departments pay medical expenses for the first year). Police and fire coverage was only a small part of the total medical payments. Therefore, police and fire were not included in the average medical payment calculations. In FY 1980, $2,517,425.56 (total medical payments) divided by 18,593 (total number of civilian employees) equals $135 (average medical cost). In FY 1979, $2,099,853.14 (total medical payments) divided by 16,810 (total number of civilian employees) equals $142.92 (average medical cost).

8. Pension costs are the employer normal cost contributions for the Policemen and Firemen Retirement System and General Retirement System. For both 1979 and 1981, entry and five year uniformed employees are covered under the new version of the Policemen and Firemen Retirement System for employees hired after 1969. Pension methodologies for 1979 and 1981 are not comparable. (See text of main report.)

9. For calendar year 1980, $4,285,167 was spent for permanent disability claims for civilian employees under Workmen's Compensation. With 18,593 employees, this averages $230 per employee. The Workmen's Compensation allowance for retired employees is not offset by the pensions in the majority of cases. For FY 1979 it was not possible to separate out Workmen's Compensation payments for temporary disability absence versus permanent disability awards. For this reason, permanent disability is included in the line-of-duty days figure. See Footnote 16.

10. Health costs for retired employees are calculated using an actuarial approximation which reflects costs per active employee, broken down for police, fire, and other employees. Costs are not comparable between 1979 and 1981 since different entry age assumptions are used for hypothetical employees in the two periods.

11. Employees are paid for accumulated sick leave upon retirement as follows:

- *Police and Fire.* Sworn personnel receive one-half pay for the first 60 days accumulated and one-fourth pay for the next 120 days. The total is not to exceed 60 full paid days. The above days all refer to 10-hour days for firefighters. Firefighters are then reimbursed on an hourly basis.

- *Others.* Civilians receive full pay for half of their accumulated days with a limit of 30 days. For each year of service past 25, the 30 days accumulation limit is raised by five days.

12. In FY 1980 total uniform costs for police came to $279,298, or an average of $70 per uniformed employee (sworn personnel = 4,000). In FY 1979 total costs were $410,618, an average of $74.42 per uniformed employee (sworn personnel = 5,517).

Uniform costs for firefighters in both FY 1979 and FY 1981 were $100 per firefighter.

Refuse collectors and park workers received an allowance of $70 in both FY 1980 and FY 1979.

Janitors, porters, and cleaners received an allowance of $140 in FY 1980, $100 in FY 1979.

13. Vacation days for firefighters with 20 years of experience have increased since 1979, from eight 24-hour tours to 10 24-hour tours.

14. Police and fire employees receive nine paid holidays. Other employees receive 10 in 1981. (They received nine in 1979.)

15. Employees are entitled to a maximum of 17 sick days. (This represents 17 10-hour days for firefighters.) Utilization data are provided separately for the Police Department and Fire Department for 1978 and 1980. Since utilization data are not available for other departments, typists, stenographers, and janitors were assumed to take the same number of sick days as the average salaried employee in Detroit. Refuse collectors and park workers were assumed to take the same number of sick days as the average hourly employee in Detroit.

16. Police and fire line-of-duty absence days are paid directly by the city and represent experience for sworn employees in the police and fire departments. Police data are for 1978 and 1980, while fire data are only available for 1978.

Line-of-duty absence payments for other employees are covered under Workmen's Compensation. 1981 line-of-duty days are based upon 1980 experience for civilian employees and do not include payments for permanent disability awards. In contrast, 1979 data include long-term disability awards, since it was impossible to separate out the temporary absence days. Thus, the 1979 figures overestimate days lost by the amount paid for long-term disability coverage.

17. Total number of days worked reflects a 261-day work year minus paid time and leave benefits.

18. Hours worked per day is a function of work schedule and lunch policy. Standard work week hours represent the average work week for which employees receive regular, straight-time earnings.

- *Police.* "Most police are scheduled to work a five-day week and receive eight hours' pay for a work day of seven hours and 55 minutes."
- *Fire.* "Most firefighters work two 24-hour tours of duty in each six calendar day cycle (24 hours on duty, 24 off, 24 on, followed by 72 hours off duty). In

addition, they receive 12 24-hour duty tours off with pay in every 360 calendar days, resulting in an average work week of 50.4 hours."

- *Refuse Collectors.* Refuse employees are on a "finish-go-home" basis so that actual hours worked depend upon daily workload, weather, equipment downtime and other variables.

Typists and stenographers are the only two job titles studied to receive a paid lunch period. (Clerical employees have eight hours between the time they report to work and the time they are normally free to go home and are given one hour for lunch.) For police, a one-half hour lunch period is not included in the 39.5-hour work week. The firefighters eat on call and are not credited with paid lunch. Refuse collectors are free to eat while working routes, but normally do so while waiting for trucks to be emptied. Park workers report to work eight and one-half hours before leaving with half an hour off for lunch.

19. Premium pay stands for all payments for time worked in addition to the scheduled work week. This includes payments for working beyond the normal day schedule, or coming in on weekends or on assigned holidays. Premium pay for police, firefighters, and refuse collectors is expressed as a percent of base salary, reflecting experience in 1978 and 1980. Premium pay for firefighters includes only holiday pay, no overtime.

20. Salaries for FY 1982 for firefighters are not known at this point. Civilian employees and police had previously negotiated a significant annual pay increase for FY 1982, but the city reopened negotiations due to fiscal problems. Wages have now been frozen for police and civilian employees between 1981 and 1982.

HOUSTON[1]

POLICE OFFICER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$14,618	$18,702	$19,482	$18,454	$23,517	$24,297
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	713	713	713	972	972	972
Life Insurance[6]	81	81	81	72	72	72
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	58	58	58	90	90	90
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	2,217	2,796	2,795	4,060	5,582	5,582
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	448	573	597	566	721	745
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	150	150	0	150	150
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	15	15	22	15	15	22
Holidays[14]	10.5	10.5	10.5	10.5	10.5	10.5
Sick Leave[15]	7	7	7	7	7	7
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	2.6	2.6	2.6	2.6	2.6	2.6
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	225.9	225.9	218.9	225.9	225.9	218.9
Hours Worked per Day[18]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,807	1,807	1,751	1,807	1,807	1,751
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	813	1,040	1,083	1,126	1,435	1,482

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

HOUSTON[1]

FIREFIGHTER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$14,618	$18,702	$19,482	$18,454	$23,517	$24,297
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	713	713	713	972	972	972
Life Insurance[6]	81	81	81	72	72	72
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	210	210	210	142	142	142
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	2,602	3,294	3,385	3,248	4,139	4,276
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	532	681	709	824	1,050	1,085
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	150	150	0	150	150
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	16.67	16.67	24.44	18	18	26.4
Holidays[14]	11.67	11.67	11.67	12.6	12.6	12.6
Sick Leave[15]	7.17	7.17	7.17	4.02	4.02	4.02
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	2.56	2.56	2.56	2.76	2.76	2.76
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	222.93	222.93	215.16	223.62	223.62	215.22
Hours Worked per Day[18]	10.8	10.8	10.8	10	10	10
Total Number of Hours Annually	2,408	2,408	2,324	2,236	2,236	2,152
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comaprable for 1979 and 1981.

HOUSTON[1]

TYPIST[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$7,488	$7,862	$9,264	$9,631	$10,252	$12,116
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	713	713	713	972	972	972
Life Insurance[6]	81	81	81	72	72	72
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	85	85	85	102	102	102
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	358	375	481	713	759	897
Social Security	459	482	568	640	682	806
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	215	226	266	277	295	348
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	10	22	10	10	22
Holidays[14]	10.5	10.5	10.5	10.5	10.5	10.5
Sick Leave[15]	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	1.9	1.9	1.9	1.9	1.9	1.9
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	231.1	231.1	219.1	231.1	231.1	219.1
Hours Worked per Day[18]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,849	1,849	1,753	1,849	1,849	1,753
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

HOUSTON[1]

STENOGRAPHER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$10,010	$10,510	$12,385	$12,267	$12,987	$15,147
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	713	713	713	972	972	972
Life Insurance[6]	81	81	81	72	72	72
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	85	85	85	102	102	102
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	478	502	600	908	961	1,121
Social Security	613	644	759	816	864	1,007
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	288	302	356	353	373	435
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	10	22	10	10	22
Holidays[14]	10.5	10.5	10.5	10.5	10.5	10.5
Sick Leave[15]	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	1.9	1.9	1.9	1.9	1.9	1.9
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	231.1	231.1	219.1	231.1	231.1	219.1
Hours Worked per Day[18]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,849	1,849	1,753	1,849	1,849	1,753
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

HOUSTON[1]

REFUSE COLLECTOR[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$11,363	$12,378	$13,158	$14,330	$15,542	$16,322
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	713	713	713	972	972	972
Life Insurance[6]	81	81	81	72	72	72
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	259	259	259	364	364	364
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	40	43	50	1,060	1,150	1,208
Social Security	710	774	822	971	1,054	1,107
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	327	354	378	412	447	469
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	10	22	10	10	22
Holidays[14]	10.5	10.5	10.5	10.5	10.5	10.5
Sick Leave[15]	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	6.7	6.7	6.7	7.7	7.7	7.7
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	226.3	226.3	214.3	225.3	225.3	213.3
Hours Worked per Day[18]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,810	1,810	1,714	1,802	1,802	1,706
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	223	243	258	281	305	320

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

HOUSTON[1]

JANITOR[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$6,708	$7,043	$8,299	$10,283	$10,929	$12,865
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	713	713	713	972	972	972
Life Insurance[6]	81	81	81	72	72	72
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	85	85	85	102	102	102
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	23	25	59	761	809	952
Social Security	411	432	509	684	727	856
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	193	202	238	295	314	370
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	10	22	10	10	22
Holidays[14]	10.5	10.5	10.5	10.5	10.5	10.5
Sick Leave[15]	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	1.9	1.9	1.9	1.9	1.9	1.9
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	231.1	231.1	219.1	231.1	231.1	219.1
Hours Worked per Day[18]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,849	1,849	1,753	1,849	1,849	1,753
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

HOUSTON[1]

PARK WORKER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$10,192	$10,826	$11,606	$12,852	$13,916	$14,696
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	713	713	713	972	972	972
Life Insurance[6]	81	81	81	72	72	72
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	85	85	85	102	102	102
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	35	37	55	951	1,030	1,088
Social Security	683	725	778	934	1,011	1,068
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	292	311	334	369	400	422
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	10	22	10	10	22
Holidays[14]	10.5	10.5	10.5	10.5	10.5	10.5
Sick Leave[15]	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	1.9	1.9	1.9	1.9	1.9	1.9
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	231.1	231.1	219.1	231.1	231.1	219.1
Hours Worked per Day[18]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,849	1,849	1,753	1,849	1,849	1,753
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	948	1,007	1,079	1,195	1,294	1,367

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

TRENDS IN ENTRY LEVEL SALARY[20]
HOUSTON
1973-1981

Job Title	1973	1974	1975	1976	1977	1978	1979	1980	1981	1982
Police Officer	$8,169					12,269	14,170	15,909	17,865	NA
Firefighter	8,169					12,269	14,170	15,909	17,865	NA
Typist B	4,420					5,850	7,332	7,360	9,474	NA
General Stenographer	4,784					7,800	10,010	10,048	12,267	NA
Refuse Collector	6,713					10,508	11,244	12,627	14,180	NA
Janitors, Porters, & Cleaners	4,524					6,292	6,708	6,734	10,283	NA
Park Worker	5,093					9,433	10,093	11,335	12,729	NA

NOTES

Houston

1. The fiscal year begins January 1 and ends December 31.

2. The following Houston municipal job titles were verified as matching our selected job classifications. Police and fire trainee positions are counted as the first step for police officer and firefighter for comparability purposes in this study. This is the case, even though the trainee positions are considered civilian titles in Houston and have no officer authority.

Urban Institute Class	*Equivalent Houston Classification*
Police Officer	Trainee (108.8) for 18 weeks, Police Officer Grade II (108.6) for 34 weeks, and Police Officer Grade III (108.0)
Firefighter	Trainee for 18 weeks, Grade II for 34 weeks, and Pipeman Ladderman (103.3) Grade III
Typist B	Clerk-Typist I, 9.0 C
General Stenographer	Stenographer I, D, 10.1
Janitors, Porters, Cleaners	Building Attendant, C, 117.3
Refuse Collector	Refuse Laborer, Ungraded
Park Worker	Laborer, 132.0 (Personnel confirmed that Laborer, Semi-skilled, does not perform the functions of our park worker)

3. Police officers and firefighters go through an 18-week trainee program and a 34-week period in Grade II (probation) before becoming police officers Grade III. Salary in the first year was valued as the weighted average of time served at each of these levels. Salary for the five and 20 year level is the maximum for Grade III.

Typists receive $12 extra dollars in the second six months, and this is averaged with the first six months' salary to arrive at the yearly rate. General stenographers and janitors receive one salary rate for the first year. Refuse collectors' and park workers' first year salaries are determined by averaging the first and second six month salaries.

Salaries for police, fire, refuse collectors, and park workers move up in step, with the employee after five years at the highest step. For typist, general stenographer, and janitor, however, there are no designated step increases, but merit awards are provided to some employees. We have assumed that for FY 1981 15 percent of employees receive a 5 percent merit increase each year for these job classifications. This is an assumption by The Urban Institute for merit increases for the three job titles based upon conversations with Houston officials. This has changed since FY 1979, when it was assumed that 25 percent of employees receive a 5 percent merit increase each year for these job classifications.

In addition, all employees receive longevity pay at the rate of $2.00 biweekly for each year of service not to exceed a maximum of 25 years. This has not changed since 1974.

4. None of the job titles examined receive shift differential, with the exception of park workers. The amount is minimal.

5. The city pays health insurance costs for individual employees. Any additional family coverage must be paid for by the employee.

6. As of January 1, 1981, the city pays $6 per month for life insurance in contrast to $6.75 per month for FY 1979.

7. Breakdowns for medical payments for line-of-duty injury under Workmen's Compensation were not available for FY 1980, but they were available for FY 1978. We have assumed the same 1978 cost distribution of Workmen's Compensation payments for temporary, continuance, permanent and medical payments using the FY 1980 total Workmen's Compensation expenditure figures. These are broken down for the Police Department, Fire Department, Solid Waste Department, and all others.

8. Pension costs are the employer normal cost contributions for the Fireman's Relief and Retirement Fund, the Municipal Employees' Pension System, and the Police Officers' Pension Fund. Entry level employees fall under an amended version of the Police Officers' Pension Fund. Pension methodologies for 1979 and 1981 are not comparable. (See text of main report.) The 1979 methodology used different utilization rates for clerical and blue collar employees, while the 1981 methodology assigned one normal cost figure for the entire plan.

9. Permanent disability awards under Workmen's Compensation are included under line-of-duty absence days, since costs could not be broken out. See Footnote 7.

10. The city makes no health insurance payments for retired employees.

11. At termination, all employees receive 100 percent of unused vacation time if the employee has been with the city a minimum of six months. Unlimited accrued sick leave is refunded at termination after two years of continuous service. For firefighters, unused 12-hour sick days are reimbursed at the daily rate. Daily rate is determined by dividing annual salary by 261.

12. The city provides uniforms and replacements at the estimated cost of $150 per employee per year for uniformed police and fire employees. No special payments are made to the employee for cleaning or maintenance.

13. Vacation days vary for firefighters due to a redefinition of hours per day. Total vacation hours for firefighters have not changed between FY 1979 and FY 1981.

14. If an employee is required to work on an assigned holiday, payment for this work is classified as premium pay.

15. All municipal employees accrue 15 days of sick leave, unlimited accumulation. Firefighters accrue 15 12-hour days. Police sick leave utilization is based upon estimates, since no records are available. Firefighter utilization rep-

resents average paid sick days for uniformed Fire Department employees for FY 1977 and FY 1979. It is assumed that other employees take 7.5 days since no better information is available. This is acceptable since they receive 100 percent reimbursement for unused sick leave anyway if employed by the city at least two years.

16. Under the Texas Worker's Compensation Law, Houston provides Workmen's Compensation payments for line-of-duty injury absence at the rate of two-thirds of salary up to a designated maximum. The city then provides a special continuation payment to bring coverage up to full salary for up to one year. See Footnote 7.

17. Total number of days worked reflects a 261-day work year minus paid time and leave benefits.

18. Hours worked per day is a function of work schedule and lunch policy. Standard work week hours represent the average work week for which employees receive their regular straight time salaries.

- *Firefighters.* For FY 1981, the work schedule consists of two periods of 24 hours on duty followed by 24 hours off, then 24 hours on duty followed by 96 hours off. In addition, every two weeks there is one 12-hour period off. This cycle averages 50 hours per week. For FY 1979 the cycle averaged 54 hours per week.
- *Refuse Collectors.* Work in sessions. They work until the job is finished, but generally average a 40-hour week.

Paid lunch time refers to a paid lunch period included in the standard work week hours. Police officers eat on call and are not credited with paid lunch.

19. Premium pay for police officers represents the average overtime and holiday pay (as a percent of base salary) for sworn personnel in the Police Department for Fy 1980 and FY 1978. Firefighters receive comp time instead of premium pay. Premium pay for park workers represents 1978 expenditures, since utilization has not changed significantly between FY 1978 and FY 1980.

20. Salary trends represent *starting* salaries for entering employees and therefore are different from the salaries reported for comparison purposes which have been averaged for the first and second six months. Police and fire salaries for trend purposes represent the trainee rate. FY 1982 salaries have not yet been determined for the seven job classifications. Salary history is not available for years 1974–1977.

LOS ANGELES[1]

POLICE OFFICER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$17,268	$22,070	$23,960	$20,368	$25,996	$28,188
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	964	964	964	1,428	1,428	1,428
Life Insurance[6]	0	0	0	48	48	48
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	386	386	386	386	386	386
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	4,737	6,063	6,687	5,866	10,684	11,585
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Health Benefits[10]	60	60	60	124	124	124
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	265	338	367	312	398	432
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	45	45	45
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	14	14	21	14	14	21
Holidays[14]	12	12	12	12	12	12
Sick Leave[15]	4.1	4.1	4.1	4.1	4.1	4.1
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	6.26	6.26	6.26	6.26	6.26	6.26
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	224.64	224.64	217.64	224.64	224.64	217.64
Hours Worked per Day[18]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,797	1,797	1,741	1,797	1,797	1,741
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	511	653	709	603	769	834

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

LOS ANGELES[1]

FIREFIGHTER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$17,268	$22,070	$23,970	$20,254	$25,891	$28,313
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	988	988	988	1,362	1,362	1,362
Life Insurance[6]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	423	423	423	423	423	423
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	4,742	6,067	6,714	5,833	10,641	11,637
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Health Benefits[10]	48	48	48	89	89	89
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	274	351	381	322	412	450
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	80	80	80	130	130	130
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	15	15	22.5	15	15	22.5
Holidays[14]	11.8	11.8	11.8	12.86	12.86	12.86
Sick Leave[15]	4.3	4.3	4.3	4.3	4.3	4.3
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	9	9	9	9	9	9
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	220.9	220.9	213.4	219.8	219.8	212.3
Hours Worked per Day[18]	11.2	11.2	11.2	11.2	11.2	11.2
Total Number of Hours Annually	2,474	2,474	2,390	2,462	2,462	2,378
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	3,626	4,635	5,034	4,253	5,437	5,946

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

LOS ANGELES[1]

TYPIST[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$8,968	$10,837	$10,837	$11,286	$12,695	$12,695
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	846	846	846	1,434	1,434	1,434
Life Insurance[6]	0	0	0	187	187	187
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	60	60	60	60	60	60
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	652	777	838	1,557	1,752	1,752
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	53	53	53	53	53	53
*Health Benefits[10]	7	7	7	29	29	29
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	14	34	69	18	40	80
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	15	20	10	15	20
Holidays[14]	11.5	11.5	11.5	11.5	11.5	11.5
Sick Leave[15]	10.4	10.4	10.4	10.4	10.4	10.4
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	227.6	222.6	217.6	227.6	222.6	217.6
Hours Worked per Day[18]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,821	1,781	1,741	1,821	1,781	1,741
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

LOS ANGELES[1]

STENOGRAPHER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$9,720	$11,755	$11,755	$12,152	$13,718	$13,718
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	846	846	846	1,434	1,434	1,434
Life Insurance[6]	0	0	0	187	187	187
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	60	60	60	60	60	60
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	706	843	909	1,677	1,893	1,893
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	53	53	53	53	53	53
*Health Benefits[10]	7	7	7	29	29	29
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	15	37	74	19	43	87
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	15	20	10	15	20
Holidays[14]	11.5	11.5	11.5	11.5	11.5	11.5
Sick Leave[15]	10.4	10.4	10.4	10.4	10.4	10.4
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	227.6	222.6	217.6	227.6	222.6	217.6
Hours Worked per Day[18]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,821	1,781	1,741	1,821	1,781	1,741
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

LOS ANGELES[1]

REFUSE COLLECTOR[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$11,693	$14,136	$14,136	$13,604	$16,433	$16,433
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	846	846	846	1,434	1,434	1,434
Life Insurance[6]	0	0	0	187	187	187
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	247	247	247	247	247	247
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	1,268	1,520	1,589	1,877	2,268	2,268
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	151	151	151	151	151	151
*Health Benefits[10]	7	7	7	29	29	29
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	8	20	40	10	24	47
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	15	20	10	15	20
Holidays[14]	11.5	11.5	11.5	11.5	11.5	11.5
Sick Leave[15]	14.5	14.5	14.5	14.5	14.5	14.5
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	5.4	5.4	5.4	5.4	5.4	5.4
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	219.6	214.6	209.6	219.6	214.6	209.6
Hours Worked per Day[18]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,757	1,717	1,677	1,757	1,717	1,677
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	2,666	3,223	3,223	3,102	3,747	3,747

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

LOS ANGELES[1]

JANITOR[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$8,676	$10,503	$10,503	$10,398	$12,319	$12,319
Differential Pay[4]	334	404	404	400	474	474
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	846	846	846	1,434	1,434	1,434
Life Insurance[6]	0	0	0	187	187	187
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	60	60	60	60	60	60
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	902	1,084	1,133	1,490	1,765	1,765
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	53	53	53	53	53	53
*Health Benefits[10]	7	7	7	29	29	29
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	10	24	48	12	29	59
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	15	20	10	15	20
Holidays[14]	11.5	11.5	11.5	11.5	11.5	11.5
Sick Leave[15]	11.7	11.7	11.7	11.7	11.7	11.7
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	226.3	221.3	216.3	226.3	221.3	216.3
Hours Worked per Day[18]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,810	1,770	1,730	1,810	1,770	1,730
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	100	100	100	100	100	100

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

LOS ANGELES[1]

PARK WORKER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$11,422	$13,802	$13,802	$13,322	$16,057	$16,057
Differential Pay[4]	5	6	6	5	6	6
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	846	846	846	1,434	1,434	1,434
Life Insurance[6]	0	0	0	187	187	187
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	60	60	60	60	60	60
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	1,145	1,371	1,434	1,839	2,217	2,217
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	53	53	53	53	53	53
*Health Benefits[10]	7	7	7	29	29	29
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	26	62	124	30	72	145
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	15	20	10	15	20
Holidays[14]	11.5	11.5	11.5	11.5	11.5	11.5
Sick Leave[15]	8.3	8.3	8.3	8.3	8.3	8.3
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	229.7	224.7	219.7	229.7	224.7	219.7
Hours Worked per Day[18]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,838	1,798	1,758	1,838	1,798	1,758
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	23	28	28	27	32	32

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

TRENDS IN ENTRY LEVEL SALARY[20]
LOS ANGELES
1973–1982

Job Title	1973	1974	1975	1976	1977	1978	1979	1980	1981	1982
Police Officer	$11,880	$12,552	$13,656	$15,120	$16,104	$17,268	$18,708	$20,045	$22,091	NA
Firefighter	11,880	12,552	13,656	15,120	16,104	17,268	18,708	19,940	21,924	NA
Typist B	6,201	6,535	6,911	7,496	7,914	8,352	8,728	9,292	10,732	NA
General Stenographer	6,723	7,099	7,496	8,122	8,582	9,062	9,459	10,085	11,651	NA
Refuse Collector	8,122	8,582	9,312	9,834	10,398	10,858	11,380	12,110	13,238	$14,512
Janitors, Porters, & Cleaners	6,368	6,723	6,911	7,287	7,684	8,039	8,436	8,978	9,793	10,962
Park Worker	7,914	8,352	8,811	9,563	10,127	10,586	11,108	11,818	12,925	14,178

NOTES

Los Angeles

1. The fiscal year begins July 1 and ends June 30. The Los Angeles City Administrative Office decided not to cooperate in providing or verifying data for the updated 1981 report. As a result, data for 1981 were obtained from union or other sources.

2. Police officers and firefighters have a special job class for the first 18 months when they are being trained at the academy and later in the field. We are considering this as the beginning step to the II level, since police officers in other cities begin at the academy. The following Los Angeles job classifications are equivalent to our chosen titles:

Urban Institute Class	*Equivalent Los Angeles Classification*
Police Officer	Police Officer I and Police Officer II
Firefighter	Firefighter I and Firefighter II
Typist B	Clerk-Typist
General Stenographer	Clerk Stenographer
Refuse Collector	Maintenance Laborer-Refuse Collector
Janitors, Porters, Cleaners	Custodian
Park Worker	Gardener Caretaker

3. Salaries represent annual rates in effect as of January 1, 1979 and January 1, 1981. Because Los Angeles job classes have step increases after the first six months, we have taken the average of the first and second six months' salaries to reflect salary for the first year. Salaries include a special supplement for FY 1981 for custodians, typists, stenographers, and gardener caretakers. (These are not applicable for FY 1980 or for FY 1982).

Longevity pay is given for police and fire only for service over 10 years. For FY 1981, police officers with 20 or more years of experience receive $182.70 per month. Firefighters with 20 or more years of experience receive $201.84 per month. For 1979, uniformed employees with 20 or more years of service receive $157.47 per month.

4. Sworn personnel receive no shift differential. Civilian personnel receive shift differential for night work, or if they work in a "hazardous" situation.

- *Refuse Collectors.* Refuse collectors receive no night shift differential, but they do qualify for "obnoxious" pay. All refuse collectors receive 8.25 percent of salary for this, but the payment is included in base pay and is not counted separately for our purposes. (In addition, operators of one-man refuse trucks, who serve as both operators and loaders, receive $0.45 per hour on top of the obnoxious pay premium. This is not included for our purposes, since one-man truck employees are not included in our refuse collector job title.

- *Janitors.* For FY 1978, approximately 70 percent of custodial workers receive an additional 5½ percent of salary for night shift. This comes to an average of 3.85 percent per person. This is still a good approximation for FY 1981.
- *Park Workers.* Three out of a total of 441 gardener/caretakers in the Recreation and Parks Department received the 5½ percent night shift differential during FY 1978–79. This represents 0.04 percent of salary for the average worker and is still a good approximation for FY 1981.

5. For FY 1981, the city pays $109 per month for health insurance for civilian employees and $10.48 per month for dental insurance for civilian employees for a total of $119.48 per month as of January 1981. For police officers, the city pays $109 per month for health insurance and $10 per month for dental insurance for a total of $119 per month. For firefighters, the city pays $102 per month for health insurance and $11.54 per month for dental insurance for a total of $113.54 per month. All of the above costs are for family plan coverage.

6. For police officers as of FY 1981, the city pays $4 per month for a union sponsored life insurance plan. For refuse collectors, janitors, and park workers, the city allocates $187 per year per employee for union sponsored life, optical, and dental programs which supplement the health insurance. For clerk typist and stenographer the city is also allocating $187 for union sponsored benefits.

7. Figures represent average cost per active employee for medical payments for line-of-duty injury under Workmen's Compensation. 1978 data are used for both 1979 and 1981 since we could not obtain more recent information from the city.

8. Pension costs are the employer normal cost contributions for the Los Angeles City Employees' Retirement System, the Fire and Police Pension System (Article XVIII) for past hires, and the Fire and Police Pension System (Article XXXV) for current and future hires. For 1981, entry level police and fire employees fall under the new plan. Pension methodologies for 1979 and 1981 are not comparable. (See text of main report).

9. Workmen's Compensation for disability retirement is the cost for FY 1978 for permanent disability awards averaged per active employee for the Sanitation Department and other (nonuniformed) employees. Figures for both years are based upon 1978 expenditures since more recent data were not available from the city. Costs are counted as zero for sworn personnel since the Workmen's Compensation award is credited against any pension received.

10. Retired employees receive health insurance if they are over 60 and have at least 10 years of experience. Between age 60 and 65 the city pays a subsidy which provides a maximum of $87 per month for uniformed employees and $109 per month for civilian employees. After 65, employees are eligible for Medicare, and city contributions are reduced substantially.

Health costs for retired employees are calculated using an actuarial approximation which reflects costs per active employee broken down for police, fire, and

other employees using expenditures for 1981 (annualized) and 1979. Methodologies are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

11. If an employee retires, he or she receives a 50 percent reimbursement for all accumulated 100 percent sick days. (Any accumulation of these sick days above 100 days results in a payoff at the 50 percent rate of pay in the current year rather than at retirement.)

12. The city supplies the initial uniform and replaces safety equipment (guns, holsters) but does not replace clothing. Police receive $45 per year as of FY 1981. Firefighters receive $5 biweekly, or $130 per year. Since employees do not use this $130 for initial purchase, this counts in the entry year as well as other years. Firefighter allowance is $80 for FY 1979. (Police received no allowance for FY 1979.)

13. In the first year civilian employees accrue vacation days but cannot actually take them until the second year. Since they are accrued in the first year we are counting them in that period.

14. Holidays stand for the number of paid holidays assigned. If an employee is required to come in and work on an assigned holiday, payments for this work are classified as overtime.

15. Employees earn 12 sick days per year at 100 percent of pay, five days at 75 percent of pay, and five days at 50 percent of pay. Data on yearly sick days used for the average eligible employee are provided for calendar year 1978 for 100 percent of pay, 75 percent of pay, and 50 percent of pay. These figures should be good approximations for FY 1981 sick leave utilization, since more recent figures were not obtainable from the city. Data represent average experience for sworn police, sworn fire, the Sanitation Division of the Public Works Department (refuse collector), the Public Buildings Division of the Public Works Department (park worker), and the city-wide utilization rate for typist and stenographer.

16. Figures for both years are based upon data for FY 1978 since more recent data could not be obtained from the city.

17. Total number of days worked reflects a 261-day work year minus paid time and leave benefits.

18. Hours worked per day is a function of work schedule and lunch policy. Standard work week hours reflect the average work week for which employees receive regular, straight-time earnings.

Fire employees on platoon duty are on duty for 24 consecutive hours and off duty for 24 consecutive hours, averaging 56 hours per week over a year's time. Police officers work a 40-hour week.

There is no paid lunch for civilian job titles. Firefighters eat lunch on call, but police officers must work extra time to make up for any lunch period.

19. Overtime stands for all payments for time worked in addition to the scheduled work week. This includes any payment for working beyond the normal

day schedule or for coming in on holidays. Data for both years are based on 1978 experience since more recent information could not be obtained from the city. Figures are broken down for sworn police, sworn fire, the refuse collection function of the Sanitation Department, custodial workers in the Public Buildings Department, and the Recreation and Parks Department.

20. Salary trends are for entry employees in the first six months in each given year for all titles but police and fire. Police and fire salaries are for the Step II level which does not include the 18-month training period. Refuse collector salaries for trend purposes include the obnoxious pay differential. 1982 salaries have not yet been established for uniformed or clerical employees.

NEW YORK CITY[1]

POLICE OFFICER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$14,661	$19,447	$19,747	$16,619	$21,932	$22,232
Differential Pay[4]	792	1,050	1,066	897	1,184	1,201
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	684	684	684	723	723	723
Life Insurance	0	0	0	0	0	0
Medical, Line-of-Duty[6]	136	136	136	101	101	101
Union Welfare Funds[7]	400	400	400	425	425	425
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	2,905	3,709	5,572	4,157	5,486	6,112
Social Security	1,016	1,354	1,375	1,269	1,674	1,697
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Health Benefits[10]	469	469	469	547	547	547
Annuity Funds[11]	261	261	261	261	261	261
Sick Leave Reimbursement[12]	112	149	151	127	168	170
*Union Welfare Funds[13]	325	325	325	350	350	350
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[14]	0	265	265	0	365	365
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[15]	21.45	28.96	28.96	21.45	28.96	28.96
Holidays[16]	11	11	11	11	11	11
Sick Leave[17]	6.5	6.5	6.5	7.1	7.1	7.1
Line-of-Duty Leave[18]	7.6	7.6	7.6	5.5	5.5	5.5
Other[19]	1.07	1.07	1.07	1.07	1.07	1.07
Total Number of Days Worked[20]	213.4	205.9	205.9	214.88	207.37	207.37
Hours Worked per Day[21]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,707	1,647	1,647	1,719	1,659	1,659
Premium Pay[22] (not part of total compensation)	1,204	1,597	1,622	1,564	2,064	2,093

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

NEW YORK CITY[1]

FIREFIGHTER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$14,661	$19,447	$19,747	$16,619	$21,932	$22,232
Differential Pay[4]	836	1,108	1,126	947	1,250	1,267
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	684	684	684	723	723	723
Life Insurance	0	0	0	0	0	0
Medical, Line-of-Duty[6]	152	152	152	185	185	185
Union Welfare Funds[7]	400	400	400	425	425	425
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	2,434	3,111	4,134	4,906	6,475	7,272
Social Security	1,086	1,404	1,404	1,330	1,755	1,779
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Health Benefits[10]	506	506	506	479	479	479
Annuity Funds[11]	261	261	261	261	261	261
Sick Leave Reimbursement[12]	112	149	151	127	168	170
*Union Welfare Funds[13]	350	350	350	306	306	306
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[14]	0	265	265	0	365	365
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[15]	20	26	26	20	26	26
Holidays[16]	11	11	11	11	11	11
Sick Leave[17]	4.1	4.1	4.1	6.8	6.8	6.8
Line-of-Duty Leave[18]	3.2	3.2	3.2	3.6	3.6	3.6
Other[19]	1.12	1.12	1.12	1.12	1.12	1.12
Total Number of Days Worked[20]	221.6	215.6	215.6	218.48	212.48	212.48
Hours Worked per Day[21]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,773	1,725	1,725	1,748	1,700	1,700
Premium Pay[22] (not part of total compensation)	2,216	2,940	2,984	2,428	3,205	3,249

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

NEW YORK CITY[1]

TYPIST[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$7,841	$9,941	$11,366	$9,141	$11,241	$12,750
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	684	684	684	723	723	723
Life Insurance	0	0	0	0	0	0
Medical, Line-of-Duty[6]	30	30	30	41	41	41
Union Welfare Funds[7]	350	350	350	400	400	400
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	142	222	465	777	1,245	1,478
Social Security	481	609	697	808	748	848
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Health Benefits[10]	14	14	14	48	48	48
Annuity Funds[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[12]	8	16	24	25	45	68
*Union Welfare Funds[13]	20	20	20	45	45	45
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[14]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[15]	20	20	27	20	20	27
Holidays[16]	11	11	11	11	11	11
*Sick Leave[17]	10.9	10.9	10.9	9.2	9.2	9.2
*Line-of-Duty Leave[18]	1	1	1	—	—	—
Other[19]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[20]	218.1	218.1	211.1	220.8	220.8	213.8
Hours Worked per Day[21]	7	7	7	7	7	7
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,527	1,527	1,478	1,546	1,546	1,497
Premium Pay[22] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

NEW YORK CITY[1]

STENOGRAPHER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$8,266	$10,241	$11,981	$9,566	$11,241	$13,350
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	684	684	684	723	723	723
Life Insurance	0	0	0	0	0	0
Medical, Line-of-Duty[6]	30	30	30	41	41	41
Union Welfare Funds[7]	350	350	350	400	400	400
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	153	228	493	813	1,245	1,552
Social Security	507	628	734	636	748	888
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Health Benefits[10]	14	14	14	48	48	48
Annuity Funds[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[12]	9	16	25	26	45	72
*Union Welfare Funds[13]	20	20	20	45	45	45
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[14]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[15]	20	20	27	20	20	27
Holidays[16]	11	11	11	11	11	11
*Sick Leave[17]	10.9	10.9	10.9	9.2	9.2	9.2
*Line-of-Duty Leave[18]	1	1	1	—	—	—
Other[19]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[20]	218.1	218.1	211.1	220.8	220.8	213.8
Hours Worked per Day[21]	7	7	7	7	7	7
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,527	1,527	1,478	1,546	1,546	1,497
Premium Pay[22] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

NEW YORK CITY[1]

REFUSE COLLECTOR[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$12,971	$17,551	$17,551	$14,705	$19,796	$19,796
Differential Pay[4]	527	713	713	635	802	802
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	684	684	684	723	723	723
Life Insurance	0	0	0	0	0	0
Medical, Line-of-Duty[6]	225	225	225	225	225	225
Union Welfare Funds[7]	400	400	400	425	425	425
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	286	1,125	1,777	1,304	3,319	3,493
Social Security	898	1,215	1,215	1,133	1,521	1,521
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Health Benefits[10]	92	92	92	139	139	139
Annuity Funds[11]	261	261	261	261	261	261
Sick Leave Reimbursement[12]	25	67	134	28	76	152
*Union Welfare Funds[13]	147	147	147	139	139	139
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[14]	0	190	190	0	290	290
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[15]	25	25	25	25	25	25
Holidays[16]	11	11	11	11	11	11
Sick Leave[17]	12	12	12	12	12	12
Line-of-Duty Leave[18]	5.2	5.2	5.2	4.0	4.0	4.0
Other[19]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[20]	207.8	207.8	207.8	209	209	209
Hours Worked per Day[21]	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,559	1,559	1,559	1,568	1,568	1,568
Premium Pay[22] (not part of total compensation)	1,145	1,550	1,550	1,691	2,277	2,277

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

NEW YORK CITY[1]

JANITOR[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$8,871	$9,621	$11,934	$10,171	$10,921	$13,311
Differential Pay[4]	160	173	215	153	164	200
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	684	684	684	723	723	723
Life Insurance	0	0	0	0	0	0
Medical, Line-of-Duty[6]	30	30	30	41	41	41
Union Welfare Funds[7]	350	350	350	400	400	400
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	231	299	590	878	1,227	1,572
Social Security	556	603	748	690	741	903
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Health Benefits[10]	14	14	14	48	48	48
Annuity Funds[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Union Welfare Funds[13]	20	20	20	45	45	45
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[14]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[15]	20	20	27	20	20	27
Holidays[16]	11	11	11	11	11	11
*Sick Leave[17]	13.8	13.8	13.8	12	12	12
*Line-of-Duty Leave[18]	1	1	1	—	—	—
Other[19]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[20]	215.2	215.2	208.2	218	218	211
Hours Worked per Day[21]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,722	1,722	1,666	1,744	1,744	1,688
Premium Pay[22] (not part of total compensation)	44	48	59	53	56	69

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

NEW YORK CITY[1]

PARK WORKER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$9,736	$10,561	$12,750	$11,141	$11,891	$14,346
Differential Pay[4]	28	28	28	170	170	170
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	684	684	684	723	723	723
Life Insurance	0	0	0	0	0	0
Medical, Line-of-Duty[6]	30	30	30	41	41	41
Union Welfare Funds[7]	350	350	350	400	400	400
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	272	322	702	972	1,357	1,711
Social Security	606	656	791	760	810	973
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Health Benefits[10]	14	14	14	48	48	48
Annuity Funds[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[12]	39	63	102	34	55	88
*Union Welfare Funds[13]	20	20	20	45	45	45
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[14]	0	65	65	0	65	65
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[15]	20	20	27	20	20	27
Holidays[16]	11	11	11	11	11	11
*Sick Leave[17]	7.8	7.8	7.8	8.8	8.8	8.8
*Line-of-Duty Leave[18]	1	1	1	—	—	—
Other[19]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[20]	221.2	221.2	214.2	221.2	221.2	214.2
Hours Worked per Day[21]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,770	1,770	1,714	1,770	1,770	1,714
Premium Pay[22] (not part of total compensation)	120	120	120	122	122	122

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

TRENDS IN ENTRY LEVEL SALARY[23]
NEW YORK CITY
1973–1982

Job Title	1973	1974	1975	1976	1977	1978	1979	1980	1981	1982
Police Officer	$11,200	$11,944	$12,900	$13,673	$13,341 ($13,673)	$14,114	$14,661	$15,247	$16,619	$17,949
Fire-fighter	11,200	11,944	12,900	12,900 (13,673)	14,114	14,114	14,661	15,247	16,619	17,949
Typist B	5,200	5,500	6,100	6,555 (6,825)	6,741	6,741	7,841	8,241	9,141	10,041
General Stenographer	5,900	6,100	6,700	7,255 (7,425)	7,124	7,124	8,266	8,666	9,566	10,466
Refuse Collector & Truck Driver	9,870	10,525	11,367	11,367 (12,049)	12,490	12,490	12,971	13,491	14,705	15,881
Janitors, Porters, & Cleaners	6,500	6,700	7,300	7,859 (8,030)	7,663	7,668	8,871	9,271	10,171	11,071
Park Worker	6,500	7,800	8,200	8,535 (8,750)	8,211	7,563	9,736	10,241	11,141	12,041

NOTES

New York City

1. The fiscal year begins July 1 and ends June 30.

2. The following New York City job classifications are comparable to our selected titles. Refuse Collectors are not a strictly comparable match since the New York City sanitationman also drives a truck. (This is also the case in San Diego.)

The broadbanding of some New York City job titles complicates job matching and salary assignments for entry, five, and 20 year level employees. Because the broadbanded Office Aid, Stenographer/Secretary, and Park Service Worker titles were put into effect prior to January 1, 1981, entry level employees in these three positions have been assigned the starting salary under the new broadbanded titles.

Urban Institute Class	*Equivalent New York City Classification*
Police Officer	Patrolman and Policewoman, 70210, 70211
Firefighter	Fireman, 70310
Typist B	Office Aid (Typist 10305 prior to broadbanding). Office Aid, Level III after 5 years
General Stenographer	Stenographer/Secretary (Stenographer 10205 prior to broadbanding). Stenographer/Secretary Level III after 5 years
Janitors, Porters & Cleaners	Custodial Assistant, 82015
Refuse Collector	Sanitationman, 70112
Park Worker	Park Service Workers, 81105 (Broadbanded June 1977) (Assistant park maintainer prior to broadbanding)

3. Salaries represent annual rates in effect as of January 1, 1979 and January 1, 1981. Base salary figures for police and fire do not include holiday pay, even though holiday pay is considered part of base salary for most purposes in New York City. For our purposes, holiday pay is shown under the holiday pay/overtime column. (For FY 1981, holiday pay comes to $700 for the entry level police officer and firefighter, $924 for the five year level, and $937 for the 20 year level. Holiday pay for FY 1979 for police officers and firefighters is $618 at the entry level, $820 for five years of experience, and $832 for 20 years of experience.)

For police, fire, and refuse collectors, all employees progress up steps according to time served. The other job classes do not have regular step increases. There used to be step increases for these classes (based upon merit) but in 1966 the city eliminated the steps, with no provision for advancement except through promotion.

For 1981, janitors and park workers with five years of experience have been assigned the same minimum salary as entry level employees, to reflect the no-

step policy. (Sometimes incumbents have received higher level increases than the minimum, but this has not occurred over the past five years for our civilian job titles.) Janitors and park workers with 20 years of experience have been assigned the maximum salaries under the old titles, since they were hired before the no-step policy was introduced. (The park worker with 20 years of experience is at the maximum of the assistant park maintainer title, to reflect the experience prior to broadbanding.)

For FY 1981, typists and stenographers with five years of experience are automatically promoted to Level III. This is treated as a step increase, since it is automatic and employees are performing the same functions. The five year salary is the minimum under Level III. The 20 year salaries for typist and stenographer are more than the minimum under Level III because they receive a minimum promotional guarantee.

For 1979, salaries for clerical employees, janitors, and park workers with five years of experience were determined by tracing the group hired in FY 1974 with regard to past salary schedules and rates of promotion. The 1979 figures for 20 year employees reflect the maximums under the old titles.

Salaries for 1979 and 1981 include a nonpensionable cash payment (NPCP) of $750 for five and 20 year employees. As of July 1, 1982, this payment will be incorporated in base salary rates. (This payment is actually pensionable only for uniformed employees.) 1979 salaries also include old COLA payments for entry, five, and 20 year employees.

4. Police officers and firefighters receive shift differential at flat rates of 5.4 percent and 5.7 percent respectively. Calculations include salary, longevity pay, and NPCP. Shift differential for janitors and park workers represents the average experience for these job classes for FY 1978 and FY 1980.

For FY 1980, sanitationmen receive $2,542,055 for night shift and $1,886,187 for Saturday shift, totaling 3.28 percent of base salary. (1979 figure of 4.06 percent is based upon experience for FY 1979.) In audition, the 1981 shift differential figure includes an allowance for sanitationmen who work on two-man trucks. Sanitationmen who work on two-man trucks (as opposed to three-man trucks) receive an extra differential payment of $11 for each day worked. At this rate, an employee would earn an additional $2,288 per year. As of January 1981, approximately 200 of the 3,000 sanitationmen in collections were receiving this differential. For the average employee, this comes to $153 per year. (The portion of sanitationmen working on two-man trucks and receiving this special differential is expected to increase beyond the January level.)

5. Health insurance payments represent the average city premium paid for family plans for all city employees as of January 1, 1981. This is determined by taking the weighted average of the different coverage plans for HIP, GHI, and GHI-E. (GHI comes to $596 per person for 23,168 employees. GHI-E comes to $707 per person for 42,287 employees. HIP comes to $810 for 41,198 employees.) The weighted average cost for the city comes to $723 per person per year.

6. Medical expenses for work related injury or illness are covered for civilian employees through Workmen's Compensation. Figures for these employees reflect average payments across the group of eligible workers for FY 1978 and FY 1980.

The city makes direct payments for medical expenses due to line-of-duty injury for police officers, firefighters, and sanitationmen. Figures for police and fire are average costs (outside medical costs plus in-house office costs) for sworn officers for FY 1978 and 1980. FY 1979 data are the most recent available for refuse collectors and will have to approximate the 1981 experience. Data reflect the average expenditures made by the Sanitation Department for outside medical expenses plus in-house medical personnel.

7. Welfare funds represent city contributions for each active employee in a given job class.

8. Pension costs are employer normal costs for the Police Pension Fund (Old and New), the Fire Pension Fund (Old and New), the City Employees' Retirement System (Old, Middle, and New), and the Sanitation Workers' Plan (Old and Middle). The old plans are effective for employees enrolled prior to July 1, 1973 and cover the 20 year employees in each job class for 1981 and 1979. Police and fire employees at the entry and five year level are under the new police and fire pension system for both 1981 and 1979. The "middle" system of the City Employees' Retirement System and special Sanitation Workers' Plan covers employees enrolled between July 1, 1973 and July 1, 1976. Thus, the five year level nonuniformed titles are covered by the "middle" systems for both 1981 and 1979. Entry level nonuniformed members and refuse collectors fall under the new City Employees' Retirement System for both 1981 and 1979.

Pension methcdologies for 1979 and 1981 are not comparable. (See text of main report.) In addition, new rates of disability retirement have been incorporated in the 1981 calculations for the Fire Pension System. This explains why fire pension costs are higher than police pension costs in 1981, while the opposite is true for 1979. Withdrawal rates for sanitation workers have also been reduced in the 1981 calculations.

9. Permanent disability awards are provided through the pension systems.

10. Health costs for retired employees are calculated using an actuarial approximation approach which reflects costs per active employee broken down for police, fire, refuse collectors, and other employees using expenditures for 1979 and 1981. Methodologies are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

11. Annuity fund contributions are made for employees at the rate of one dollar per working day.

12. For police, fire, and sanitationmen, "terminal leave with pay is granted upon retirement at the rate of 1 month for every 10 years of service, prorated for a fractional part." The cost of terminal leave for these workers for FY 1980 is the value of two days' pay at current rates.

For other classes, "terminal leave with pay is granted prior to final separation to employees with at least 10 years of service at the rate of 1 day's terminal leave

for each 2 days of unused sick leave up to a maximum of 120 work days of terminal leave." Expected terminal pay for each longevity group is calculated by taking the probability of remaining on the job for at least 10 years times half the current value of the average unused sick days for the given class.

13. The city makes the same contribution to the welfare fund for retired employees as for active employees. Costs for retired employees are calculated using an actuarial approximation approach which reflects costs per active employee broken down for police, fire, refuse collectors, and other employees. Methodologies are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

14. The uniform allowance in the first year goes toward the initial uniform purchase and is counted as zero in order to maintain comparability across cities.

15. Vacation days for firefighters represent eight-hour days. (For less than three years of experience they receive 20 work days of eight nine-hour tours and six 15-hour tours. For three years of experience and over they receive 26 work days of 10 nine-hour tours and eight 15-hour tours.) Vacation days for police represent eight-hour 35-minute days.

16. It is important to emphasize that New York City police officers and firefighters work on holidays and do not receive time off. In order to standardize comparisons for the purposes of this study, all salary comparisons are reported on the assumption that holidays are not worked. Extra pay for working holidays is included in this study as premium pay.

17. Data on sick leave taken are provided in "The Mayor's Management Report" for FY 1980 and FY 1979. Sick leave utilization for uniformed employees is provided for the Fire Department and Sanitation Department. For FY 1981, sick leave utilization for the Police Department is taken directly from the department rather than "The Mayor's Management Report," and represents the average annualized sick leave taken for FY 1981. Sick leave utilization for janitors is represented by the Department of General Services and sick leave utilization for park workers is represented by the Parks Department. (Absence rates provided in "The Mayor's Management Report" are multiplied by 250 days, representing the scheduled work period minus holidays.)

Since employees earn 12 sick leave days per year, refuse collectors and janitors are assumed to be at the maximum even though the average utilization was somewhat higher. (This occurs when employees use accumulated leave from prior years.) Sick days reported here for 1981 include Workmen's Compensation line-of-duty absence days for typist, stenographer, janitor, and park worker. (See Footnote 18.) Police officer, firefighter, and refuse collector sick days do not include line-of-duty absence days. Sick leave utilization data for typists and general stenographers are obtained by averaging sick leave taken for a sample of large civilian agencies.

18. Absence resulting from line-of-duty injury for police officers, firefighters, and sanitationmen is provided for FY 1980 and FY 1979 in "The Mayor's Management Report," representing full paid days lost due to line-of-duty injury. The

remaining four job titles are covered under Workmen's Compensation. The data for 1981 for these job titles include line-of-duty injury days lost in the sick leave figures. 1979 data are not comparable for these titles, since line-of-duty days are available separately for 1979.

19. Police officers and firefighters earn one personal leave day for each year of service, which excuses them from one regular day tour. One personal leave day counts as nine hours for firefighters and 8.58 hours for police officers.

20. Total number of days worked reflects a 261-day work year minus paid time and leave benefits.

21. Hours worked per day is a function of work schedules and lunch policy. Standard work week hours represents the average work week for which employees receive regular, straight-time earnings.

- *Police Officers.* The major group, comprised of most police officers, works five duty shifts of five consecutive days and then is off for varying periods of time. Their work schedules call for rotating shifts. In addition to working each eight-hour shift, they work and are paid for an additional 35 minutes per shift. This results in an average work week of 40 hours.
- *Firefighters.* "Firefighters and superior officers work a 25-day cycle. The tours of duty are as follows: work nine hours, off 15 hours; work nine hours, off 48 hours; work 15 hours, off nine hours; work 15 hours, off 72 hours. However, within each 25-day cycle workers cannot work more than three complete rotations, and workers are excused from one 15-hour tour each calendar year. This results in an average work week of 40 hours."
- *Others.* Typists and stenographers work a seven-hour day with no paid lunch time. The other job classes studied work eight-hour days.

Police officers and firefighters eat lunch on call and are not assigned paid lunch. Refuse collectors do receive one-half hour of paid lunch time as part of the eight-hour work day.

22. Premium pay stands for all payments for time worked in addition to the scheduled work week. This includes payments for working beyond the normal day schedule and/or for coming in on holidays.

- *Police Officers and Firefighters.* Premium pay reflects average overtime expenditures for the Fire Department and for sworn personnel in the Police Department for FY 1978 and FY 1980. (Actual FY 1981 overtime is expected to be higher than FY 1980 overtime for the Fire Department as a result of management economic decisions. This is also true for sworn police, due to management service decisions.) In addition, police officers and firefighters receive 11 days' pay to compensate for working on scheduled holidays. See Footnote 3.
- *Other.* Premium pay for refuse collectors reflects average costs for sanitationmen for FY 1980 and FY 1979. Premium pay for janitors is approximated based upon experience for full-time custodial assistants for FY 1978

and FY 1980. Premium pay for park workers is all holiday pay (since overtime is minimal) and reflects average costs for FY 1978 and FY 1980.

23. Trends are presented for entry level wages for January 1st of each year. The 1977 and 1978 figures include the 10 percent reduction where applicable. (Between 10/1/76 and 6/30/78, most nonuniformed employees—with the exception of hard to fill titles such as keypunch operators—were hired at 90 percent of the minimum salary.)

As of January 1, 1976 and 1977 some of the salaries were subject to deferments, with the understanding that the deferred sums would eventually be refunded. (They have not yet been refunded.) The table shows salaries after deferments, with the full salary bracketed below.

The park worker title has recently been broadbanded to merge several once separate titles. For salary trend purposes we have used the Assistant Park Maintainer title to apply to the years before broadbanding occurred. We have used the Typist 10305 title for Office Aids prior to broadbanding and the Stenographer 10205 title for Stenographer/Secretary prior to broadbanding.

PHILADELPHIA[1]

POLICE OFFICER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$15,115	$17,315	$17,698	$17,499	$20,048	$20,490
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,588	1,588	1,588	1,768	1,768	1,768
Life Insurance[6]	133	133	133	136	136	136
*Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	203	203	203	73	73	73
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	3,004	3,442	3,519	3,500	4,010	4,098
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	Out	Out	Out	Out	Out	Out
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	87	99	102	34	38	39
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	17	175	0	175	175
Time and Leave Benefits	10	10	20	10	10	20
Vacation Days[13]	14	14	14	14	14	14
Holidays[14]	15.73	15.73	15.73	19.12	19.12	19.12
Sick Leave[15]	3.63	3.63	3.63	2.3	2.3	2.3
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	3	3	3	3	3	3
Other[17]						
Total Number of Days Worked[18]	214.64	214.64	204.64	212.58	212.58	202.58
Hours Worked per Day[19]	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,610	1,610	1,535	1,594	1,594	1,519
Premium Pay[20] (not part of total compensation)	1,693	1,934	1,982	1,400	1,592	1,592

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

PHILADELPHIA[1]

FIREFIGHTER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$15,475	$17,724	$18,107	$17,064	$19,546	$19,967
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,588	1,588	1,588	1,860	1,860	1,860
Life Insurance[6]	133	133	133	230	230	230
*Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	253	253	253	49	49	49
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	3,177	3,640	3,718	3,037	3,479	3,554
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	Out	Out	Out	Out	Out	Out
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	178	204	208	221	253	258
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	175	175	0	100	100
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	10	20	11.4	11.4	22.9
Holidays[14]	14.76	14.76	14.76	14.76	14.76	14.76
Sick Leave[15]	5.86	5.86	5.86	6.63	6.63	6.63
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	1.52	1.52	1.52	1.52	1.52	1.52
Other[17]	3.3	3.3	3.3	3.3	3.3	3.3
Total Number of Days Worked[18]	225.56	225.56	215.56	223.39	223.39	211.89
Hours Worked per Day[19]	8.4	8.4	8.4	8.4	8.4	8.4
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,895	1,895	1,811	1,876	1,876	1,780
Premium Pay[20] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

PHILADELPHIA[1]

TYPIST[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$10,037	$10,855	$11,265	$11,067	$11,966	$12,417
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,018	1,018	1,018	1,327	1,327	1,327
Life Insurance[6]	86	86	86	105	105	105
*Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	61	61	61	38	38	38
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	227	245	255	1,361	1,472	1,527
Social Security	615	665	691	736	796	826
Workmen's Compensation[9]	Out	Out	Out	Out	Out	Out
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	26	55	115	19	41	86
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	10	20	10	15	25
Holidays[14]	14	14	14	14	14	14
Sick Leave[15]	12	12	12	14.27	14.27	14.27
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	1.43	1.43	1.43	.87	.87	.87
Other[17]	3	3	3	3	3	3
Total Number of Days Worked[18]	220.57	220.57	210.57	218.86	213.86	203.86
Hours Worked per Day[19]	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,654	1,654	1,579	1,641	1,604	1,529
Premium Pay[20] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

PHILADELPHIA[1]

STENOGRAPHER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$10,514	$11,419	$11,828	$11,593	$12,591	$13,042
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,018	1,018	1,018	1,327	1,327	1,327
Life Insurance[6]	86	86	86	105	105	105
*Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	61	61	61	38	38	38
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	237	258	267	1,426	1,549	1,604
Social Security	645	700	725	771	837	867
Workmen's Compensation[9]	Out	Out	Out	Out	Out	Out
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	27	58	121	20	43	90
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	10	20	10	15	25
Holidays[14]	14	14	14	14	14	14
Sick Leave[15]	12	12	12	14.27	14.27	14.27
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	1.43	1.43	1.43	.87	.87	.87
Other[17]	3	3	3	3	3	3
Total Number of Days Worked[18]	220.57	220.57	210.57	218.86	213.86	203.86
Hours Worked per Day[19]	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,654	1,654	1,579	1,641	1,604	1,529
Premium Pay[20] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

PHILADELPHIA[1]

REFUSE COLLECTOR[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$10,921	$11,944	$12,353	$12,042	$13,170	$13,621
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,018	1,018	1,018	1,327	1,327	1,327
Life Insurance[6]	86	86	86	105	105	105
*Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	175	175	175	62	62	62
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	516	564	585	1,481	1,620	1,675
Social Security	870	952	984	859	940	972
Workmen's Compensation[9]	Out	Out	Out	Out	Out	Out
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	21	47	96	17	38	78
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	10	20	10	15	25
Holidays[14]	14	14	14	14	14	14
Sick Leave[15]	13.9	13.9	13.9	15.08	15.08	15.08
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	2.1	2.1	2.1	1.0	1.0	1.0
Other[17]	3	3	3	3	3	3
Total Number of Days Worked[18]	218	218	208	217.92	212.92	202.92
Hours Worked per Day[19]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,744	1,744	1,664	1,743	1,703	1,623
Premium Pay[20] (not part of total compensation)	3,276	3,583	3,706	879	961	994

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

PHILADELPHIA[1]

JANITOR[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$10,432	$11,385	$11,828	$11,482	$12,460	$12,911
Differential Pay[4]	418	418	418	416	416	416
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,018	1,018	1,018	1,327	1,327	1,327
Life Insurance[6]	86	86	86	105	105	105
*Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	60	60	60	42	42	42
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	420	458	474	1,412	1,533	1,588
Social Security	713	776	805	823	893	926
Workmen's Compensation[9]	Out	Out	Out	Out	Out	Out
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	22	48	100	17	36	74
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	10	20	10	15	25
Holidays[14]	14	14	14	14	14	14
Sick Leave[15]	13.4	13.4	13.4	15.14	15.14	15.14
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	1.43	1.43	1.43	1.2	1.2	1.2
Other[17]	3	3	3	3	3	3
Total Number of Days Worked[18]	219.17	219.17	209.17	217.66	212.66	202.66
Hours Worked per Day[19]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,753	1,753	1,673	1,741	1,701	1,621
Premium Pay[20] (not part of total compensation)	782	854	887	896	972	1,007

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

PHILADELPHIA[1]

PARK WORKER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$10,921	$11,944	$12,353	$12,042	$13,170	$13,621
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,018	1,018	1,018	1,327	1,327	1,327
Life Insurance[6]	86	86	86	105	105	105
*Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	86	86	86	73	73	73
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	421	462	476	1,481	1,620	1,675
Social Security	708	775	801	891	974	1,007
Workmen's Compensation[9]	Out	Out	Out	Out	Out	Out
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	31	67	138	18	40	84
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	10	20	10	15	25
Holidays[14]	14	14	14	14	14	14
Sick Leave[15]	11.25	11.25	11.25	14.43	14.43	14.43
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	2	2	2	1.3	1.3	1.3
Other[17]	3	3	3	3	3	3
Total Number of Days Worked[18]	220.75	220.75	210.75	218.27	213.27	203.27
Hours Worked per Day[19]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,766	1,766	1,686	1,746	1,706	1,626
Premium Pay[20] (not part of total compensation)	633	693	716	1,349	1,475	1,526

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

TRENDS IN ENTRY LEVEL SALARY[21]
PHILADELPHIA
1973–1982

Job Title	1973	1974	1975	1976	1977	1978	1979	1980	1981	1982
Police Officer	$10,896	$11,441	$12,441	$13,441	$14,259	$15,115	$15,115	$16,666	$17,499	$18,374
Firefighter	10,896	11,441	12,441	13,441	14,259	15,475	15,475	17,064	17,064	18,770
Typist B	7,060	7,357	7,666	8,766	8,766	9,380	10,037	11,067	11,067	12,174
General Stenographer	7,444	7,757	8,083	9,183	9,183	9,826	10,514	11,593	11,593	12,752
Refuse Collector	7,773	8,099	8,439	9,539	9,539	10,207	10,921	12,042	12,042	13,246
Janitors, Porters, and Cleaners	7,773	8,099	8,439	9,539	9,539	10,207	10,921	11,482	11,482	12,630
Park Worker	7,444	7,757	8,083	9,183	9,183	9,826	10,432	12,042	12,042	13,246

NOTES

Philadelphia

1. The fiscal year begins July 1 and ends June 30 for Philadelphia.

2. The following Philadelphia job classifications were verified by the Personnel Department as matching our selected classifications:

Urban Institute Class	*Equivalent Philadelphia Classification*
Police Officer	Police Officer 6A02, Grade 203
Firefighter	Firefighter 6B01, Grade 303
Typist, Class B	Clerk-Typist I, All Grade 4
General Stenographer	General Stenographer, Grade 5
Refuse Collector	Laborer 7A01, Grade 6
Janitors, Porters, Cleaners	Janitors, Porters, Cleaners, Grades 4-5
Park Worker	Laborer 7A01, Grade 6

3. Salaries represent annual rates in effect as of January 1, 1979 and January 1, 1981. For FY 1981, police salaries were scheduled to remain at the FY 1980 level for the first six months and then increase to a higher rate for six months, beginning January 1, 1981. This also applies to longevity. Firefighter salaries represent payments for the 42-hour work week period.

Salaries for janitors represent weighted averages of two job grades, custodial workers at Grade 5 and domestic workers at Grade 4. The following calculations were used for 1979 and 1981:

- *1979.* In 1979, there were 278 custodial workers at Grade 5 and 58 domestic workers at Grade 4. We have taken the weighted average as the salary for janitors. At the entry level, custodians receive $10,514 and domestic workers receive $10,037. After five years, custodians receive $11,282 and domestic workers receive $10,718. After 20 years, the base salaries are the same because the highest steps have been reached.
- *1981.* In 1981, there were 263 custodial workers at Grade 5 and 70 domestic workers at Grade 4. We have taken the weighted average as the salary for janitors. At the entry level, custodians receive $11,593 and domestic workers receive $11,067. After five years, custodians receive $12,440 and domestic workers receive $11,818. After 20 years, the base salaries are the same because the highest steps have been reached.

Payment schedules for the entry, five year, and 20 year employees include step and longevity increases. Since an unsatisfactory performer would probably not continue, it is assumed that individuals with five and 20 years of experience are at the scheduled fifth and twentieth step level. Longevity for 1979 and 1981 is scheduled as follows:

- *1979.* In 1979, police officers and firefighters received longevity payments of $127.50 for each five years of service and civilians received $136.55 for each five years.

- *1981.* In 1981, for each five years of service, police received longevity payments of $148, firefighters received $140.59, and civilians received $150.56.

4. Police officers and firefighters receive no additional compensation for shift differentials. Shift payments are minimal for refuse collectors and park workers.

In FY 1979, approximately 90 percent of the janitors in the Department of Public Property worked night shift and received an additional 25 cents per hour. This came to approximately $416 per year. (Shift policy has not changed between FY 1979 and FY 1981.)

5. Health insurance payments for active employees represent the average premium paid by the city for family plans for all city employees. The city pays the amount equivalent to 100 percent of the cost of the city's group family plan to the respective union Health and Welfare fund for each member or to the health plan of the employee's choice. The policy for FY 1981 is to maintain previous benefit levels at cost. Because costs haven't been established for FY 1981, FY 1980 costs are used.

6. Life insurance costs to the city represent a combination of regular group life insurance and group legal fees paid to the respective unions which administer the plans. In FY 1979, group legal costs were $48 for police and fire and $18 for other employees. For FY 1981, group legal costs were $72 for police and fire and $42 for other employees.

7. For FY 1979, medical payments for line-of-duty injury were considered confidential. Numbers recorded in FY 1979 represent the average costs of the other 11 cities in the study.

For FY 1981, Philadelphia did provide information on actual costs, using FY 1980 expenditure data. FY 1980 medical expenses include city costs for clinics as well as all outside medical costs provided by the city.

8. Pension costs are the employer normal cost contribution for the police plan (New Plan D), the fire plan (New Plan X), and the Municipal Civilian Retirement Plan (Revised New Plan J). Pension methodologies for 1979 and 1981 are not comparable. (See text of main report.)

9. These payments are counted as zero for our purposes, since service-connected disability pension payments are reduced by the amount of Workmen's Compensation received.

10. Philadelphia pays for retiree health benefits at the rate of $84.85 per month for *three years only*. In most cases the three years are up by the time they reach 65 and are eligible for Medicare. In the case that they retire after 65, city contributions are less than $100. We have assumed that medical payments for retired employees are minimal (less than $10, even if retired in 20 years).

11. Police officers receive payment for 50 percent of unused sick leave upon retirement only, with payments not to exceed 60 days' full pay. Civilians receive payment for 30 percent of unused sick leave upon retirement only, not to exceed

60 days' full pay. Firefighters aslo receive payment for 30 percent of unused sick leave upon retirement only, not to exceed 71 full paid days (eight-hour days).

12. The initial issue of uniforms for police officers and firefighters is provided by the respective departments. A $175 annual replacement allowance is provided for police officers. (This allowance is not in cash, but the police officers are allowed to order up to that amount. They generally spend it all.) No allowance is made for cleaning or maintenance. A $100 allowance is provided for firefighters. (This was reduced from the 1979 level of $175.)

13. Vacations have changed between FY 1979 and FY 1981. For firefighters, vacations are now in 48-hour periods vs. 42-hour periods. Firefighter vacations for entry and five year employees increased from two 42-hour periods in 1979 to two 48-hour periods in 1981. Firefighter vacations for 20 year employees increased from four 42-hour periods in 1979 to four 48-hour periods in 1981.

14. Nonuniformed employees receive time off with full pay for 14 designated holidays. When required to work these days, civilians receive their regular pay plus a premium of 1½ times their regular pay. Pay for holiday work is considered part of premium pay for our purposes.

In lieu of holidays, police receive 14 days' compensatory time which can be used upon request with departmental approval (when manpower considerations permit its use). Firefighters receive 124 hours off per year in lieu of holidays.

15. Sick leave taken does not include injury-on-duty leave. It represents eight-hour days in all classes (including firefighters) and is reported by department: uniformed police, uniformed fire, Streets Department for refuse collector, Public Property Department for janitor, and Fairmount Park Department for park worker. Sick leave taken for typist and general stenographer represents the average taken for District Council 33 employees for FY 1981 and the average taken for the Health Department for FY 1979. 1981 figures reflect experience for 1980 and 1979 figures reflect experience for 1978.

- *Police and Civilians* are assigned 20 days of sick leave with a maximum accumulation of 200 days for civilians and 225 days for police.
- *Firefighters* are assigned 21 eight-hour periods of sick leave with a maximum accumulation of 236¼ days.

16. Line-of-duty absence is more or less unlimited subject to the department's jurisdiction. Data for police and fire are for uniformed employees and data for typist and general stenographers represent the city-wide average excluding the Police and Fire Departments and Sanitation Division of the Streets Department. Refuse collector information is for the Sanitation Division of the Streets Department. Park worker information is for the Grounds Maintenance Division of the Fairmount Park Department. Janitor data represent line-of-duty days used in the Building Services Division of the Public Property Department. 1981 figures reflect experience for 1980 and 1979 figures reflect experience for 1978.

17. Employees in Philadelphia receive and generally use three personal leave days since they can not be accumulated. (For firefighters, this amounts to 28 hours.)

18. Total number of days worked reflects a 261-day work year minus paid time and leave benefits.

19. Hours worked per day is a function of work schedule and lunch policy. Standard work week hours reflect the average work week for which employees receive regular, straight-time earnings.

- *Police.* Work six eight-hour tours followed by two days off. In every four-week cycle they receive an extra day off to maintain the 40-hour week.
- *Firefighters.* Work schedules are a combination of two 10-hour shifts and two 14-hour shifts, followed by four days off. This comes to 42 hours per week.

The only job class to receive a paid lunch period within the standard work week hours is police officers. A 30-minute lunch is specified by contract for police officers, and they are not on call during this time. (Firefighters are assumed to be on call and are not assigned paid lunch.)

20. Premium pay stands for all payments for time worked in addition to the scheduled work week. This includes payments for working beyond the normal day schedule, or coming in on weekends or an assigned holiday. Figures represent the average overtime usages (relative to base salary) for uniformed police, firefighters, the Sanitation Department, the Building Services Division of the Public Property Department, and the Grounds Maintenance Division of the Fairmount Park Department.

21. Salary trends reflect base salary of entry level employees as of January 1 of each calendar year. FY 1982 salaries have been established as part of prior multiple year contracts. As of July 1, 1981, police officers will receive a 5 percent increase in salary. The other job titles will receive 10 percent salary increases.

PITTSBURGH[1]

POLICE OFFICER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$13,197	$16,432	$16,882	$15,969	$20,157	$20,750
Differential Pay[4]	149	149	149	149	149	149
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,432	1,432	1,432	1,535	1,535	1,535
Life Insurance[6]	169	208	208	184	232	240
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	279	279	279	217	217	217
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	1,282	1,599	1,776	2,322	2,873	2,873
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	437	437	437	600	600	600
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	204	252	260	257	324	334
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	200	200	0	430	430
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days	10	15	25	10	15	25
Holidays[13]	13	13	13	13	13	13
Sick Leave[14]	10	10	10	9.8	9.8	9.8
Line-of-Duty Leave[15]	13.7	13.7	13.7	9.8	9.8	9.8
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[16]	214.3	209.3	199.3	218.4	213.4	203.4
Hours Worked per Day[17]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,714	1,674	1,594	1,747	1,707	1,627
Premium Pay[18] (not part of total compensation)	1,095	1,364	1,401	1,325	1,673	1,722

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

PITTSBURGH[1]

FIREFIGHTER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$12,163	$16,432	$16,832	$12,163	$19,110	$19,510
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,323	1,323	1,323	1,343	1,343	1,343
Life Insurance[6]	156	208	208	140	220	225
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	305	305	305	220	220	220
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	1,187	1,599	1,775	1,817	2,841	2,846
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	527	527	527	668	668	668
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	263	353	355	261	410	419
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	300	300	0	300	300
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days	10	15	25	10	15	25
Holidays[13]	17	17	17	17	17	17
Sick Leave[14]	7.2	7.2	7.2	11.4	11.4	11.4
Line-of-Duty Leave[15]	9.6	9.6	9.6	8.1	8.1	8.1
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[16]	217.2	212.2	202.2	214.5	209.5	199.5
Hours Worked per Day[17]	8.4	8.4	8.4	8.4	8.4	8.4
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,824	1,782	1,698	1,802	1,760	1,676
Premium Pay[18] (not part of total compensation)	985	1,331	1,363	985	1,548	1,580

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

PITTSBURGH[1]

TYPIST[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$9,491	$9,491	$9,491	$11,153	$11,591	$11,591
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,265	1,265	1,265	1,334	1,334	1,334
Life Insurance[6]	117	117	117	128	134	134
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	88	88	88	65	65	65
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	−76	26	179	617	641	961
Social Security	582	582	582	742	771	771
Workmen's Compensation[9]	68	68	68	81	81	81
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	45	90	180	60	124	249
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days	10	15	25	10	15	25
Holidays[13]	13	13	13	13	13	13
Sick Leave[14]	9	9	9	8.3	8.3	8.3
Line-of-Duty Leave[15]	1.7	1.7	1.7	1.8	1.8	1.8
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[16]	227.3	222.3	212.3	227.9	222.9	212.9
Hours Worked per Day[17]	7.75	7.75	7.75	7.75	7.75	7.75
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,762	1,723	1,645	1,766	1,727	1,650
Premium Pay[18] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

PITTSBURGH[1]

STENOGRAPHER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$10,186	$10,186	$10,186	$11,770	$12,286	$12,286
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,265	1,265	1,265	1,334	1,334	1,334
Life Insurance[6]	130	130	130	136	142	142
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	88	88	88	65	65	65
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	−76	22	176	651	679	1,019
Social Security	624	624	624	783	817	817
Workmen's Compensation[9]	68	68	68	81	81	81
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	49	98	196	63	132	264
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days	10	15	25	10	15	25
Holidays[13]	13	13	13	13	13	13
Sick Leave[14]	9	9	9	8.3	8.3	8.3
Line-of-Duty Leave[15]	1.7	1.7	1.7	1.8	1.8	1.8
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[16]	227.3	222.3	212.3	227.9	222.9	212.9
Hours Worked per Day[17]	7.75	7.75	7.75	7.75	7.75	7.75
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,762	1,723	1,645	1,766	1,727	1,650
Premium Pay[18] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

PITTSBURGH[1]

REFUSE COLLECTOR[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$15,305	$15,931	$15,931	$18,275	$19,319	$19,319
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,265	1,265	1,265	1,334	1,334	1,334
Life Insurance[6]	195	195	195	211	223	223
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	192	192	192	263	263	263
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	−119	−58	88	1,011	1,068	1,602
Social Security	979	1,020	1,020	1,269	1,341	1,341
Workmen's Compensation[9]	499	499	499	603	603	603
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	51	107	214	91	192	385
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days	10	15	25	10	15	25
Holidays[13]	13	13	13	13	13	13
*Sick Leave[14]	10.5	10.5	10.5	8.8	8.8	8.8
Line-of-Duty Leave[15]	12.8	12.8	12.8	11.9	11.9	11.9
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[16]	214.7	209.7	199.7	217.3	212.3	202.3
Hours Worked per Day[17]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,718	1,678	1,598	1,738	1,698	1,618
Premium Pay[18] (not part of total compensation)	673	701	701	804	850	850

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

PITTSBURGH[1]

JANITOR[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$10,271	$10,271	$10,271	$12,744	$12,744	$12,744
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,265	1,265	1,265	1,334	1,334	1,334
Life Insurance[6]	130	130	130	147	147	147
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	88	88	88	65	65	65
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	−104	−10	128	705	705	1,056
Social Security	630	630	630	847	847	847
Workmen's Compensation[9]	68	68	68	81	81	81
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	51	102	204	49	98	195
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days	10	15	25	10	15	25
Holidays[13]	13	13	13	13	13	13
*Sick Leave[14]	8.8	8.8	8.8	10	10	10
Line-of-Duty Leave[15]	1.7	1.7	1.7	1.8	1.8	1.8
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[16]	227.5	222.5	212.5	226.2	221.2	211.2
Hours Worked per Day[17]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,820	1,780	1,700	1,810	1,770	1,690
Premium Pay[18] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

PITTSBURGH[1]

PARK WORKER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$11,532	$11,532	$11,532	$13,929	$13,929	$13,929
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	1,265	1,265	1,265	1,334	1,334	1,334
Life Insurance[6]	143	143	143	160	160	160
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	88	88	88	65	65	65
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	−108	−20	120	770	770	1,155
Social Security	730	730	730	956	956	956
Workmen's Compensation[9]	68	68	68	81	81	81
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	54	108	216	53	107	213
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days	10	15	25	10	15	25
Holidays[13]	13	13	13	13	13	13
*Sick Leave[14]	9.1	9.1	9.1	10	10	10
Line-of-Duty Leave[15]	1.7	1.7	1.7	1.8	1.8	1.8
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[16]	227.2	222.2	212.2	226.2	221.2	211.2
Hours Worked per Day[17]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,818	1,778	1,698	1,810	1,770	1,690
Premium Pay[18] (not part of total compensation)	369	369	369	446	446	446

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

TRENDS IN ENTRY LEVEL SALARY[19]
PITTSBURGH
1973–1981

Job Title	1973	1974	1975	1976	1977	1978	1979	1980	1981	1982
Police Officer	$9,563	$9,963	$11,334	$12,334	$12,334	$12,334	$13,197	$14,517	$15,969	NA
Firefighter	9,713	10,113	10,613	12,163	12,163	12,163	12,163	12,163	12,163	NA
Typist B	6,509	6,834	7,381	7,750	8,293	8,791	9,491	9,753	11,153	NA
General Stenographer	7,025	7,376	7,966	8,364	8,949	9,486	10,186	10,370	11,770	NA
Refuse Collector	11,712	11,998	12,311	13,713	14,221	15,053	15,931	17,805	19,319	NA
Janitors, Porters, & Cleaners	5,848	6,168	6,568	7,594	8,337	9,237	10,073	11,314	12,670	NA
Park Worker	7,280	7,623	8,025	9,058	9,790	10,691	11,532	12,779	13,929	NA

NOTES

Pittsburgh

1. The fiscal year begins January 1 and ends December 31.

2. The following Pittsburgh job titles are comparable to our chosen job classifications. In the case of janitors, there are two titles (custodian light and custodian heavy) representing our one title. The police officer title includes the academy training period.

Urban Institute Class	*Equivalent Pittsburgh Classification*
Police Officer	Police Officer 1300
Firefighter	Firefighter 784
Typist B	Clerk Typist I, 5-E
General Stenographer	Stenographer I
Refuse Collector	Extra Helper (1st 9 months); Regular Helper 299
Janitors, Porters, Cleaners	Custodian Light, Custodian Heavy
Park Worker	Park Laborer

3. Salaries represent annual rates in effect as of January 1, 1979 and January 1, 1981. For FY 1981, salary for janitors, porters and cleaners is calculated by taking the weighted average of $12,470 for custodian light (14 employees) and $13,129 for custodian heavy (10 employees). For FY 1979, the weighted average is taken of $10,073 for custodian light (14 employees) and $10,732 for custodian heavy (six employees).

The structure of salary increases for the typist and stenographer positions has changed between 1979 and 1981. As of FY 1981, the two clerical titles are subject to step increases and a July 1 across the board increase. The latter increase is not counted for our purposes since it is not part of the definition of yearly salary as of January 1, 1981. Typists in the first year receive $10,733 in the first three months, $11,002 in the second three months, $11,286 in the third three months, and $11,591 in the last three months. Stenographers in the first year receive $11,286 in the first three months, $11,591 in the second three months, $11,919 in the third three months, and $12,286 in the last three months. The weighted average is taken to arrive at the entry level wage.

Refuse collector salaries for FY 1981 represent the weighted average of $17,231 for the first three months, $18,275 for the next six months, and $19,319 for the final three months. Refuse collector salaries for FY 1979 and FY 1981 both include the incentive bonus. This amounts to $75 per week for 1979 and $100 per week for 1981.

Longevity payments are added to base salary for police officers and firefighters. Firefighter longevity payments for FY 1979 and FY 1981 are $100 after five years of experience and $500 after 20 years of experience. Longevity pay policy was changed for police officers between FY 1979 and FY 1981. As of FY 1981, police officers receive longevity payments of 2 percent of salary after five years of experience and 5 percent of salary after 20 years of experience ($395 for the five

year employee and $988 for the 20 year employee). Police longevity payments in FY 1979 were the same as those for firefighters.

4. Police officers are the only group of our selected job titles to receive shift differential payments. They receive an additional 10 cents per hour for afternoon shift and 15 cents per hour for night shift. Total shift differential payments for the Police Department come to $210,000 for FY 1978. With 1,409 uniformed employees, this averages $149 per person. Since the rates and shift usage have not changed since 1978, $149 also applies for FY 1981.

5. Health insurance payments represent city cost for family plan coverage for police, fire, and other employees. This includes Blue Cross/Blue Shield, major medical, dental, and vision insurance for all employees as of FY 1981.

6. For FY 1981, the city pays $.96 per month per thousand dollars earned for life insurance for all active employees, or approximately $11.52 per year per thousand dollars earned. In FY 1979 the city pays $1.10 per month per thousand dollars earned, or approximately $13 per year per thousand dollars earned.

7. Medical payments for line-of-duty injury are average expenditures per person for the Police Department, Fire Department, Sanitation Department, and all other employees. FY 1981 figures reflect FY 1979 expenditures, since no more recent data are available. FY 1979 figures reflect FY 1977 expenditures.

8. Pension costs are the employer normal cost contributions for the Police Relief and Pension Fund, the Fire Relief and Pension Fund, the Municipal Pension Fund, New Plan, and the Municipal Pension Fund, Old Plan. For FY 1979, only entry level nonuniformed employees are under the new plan. For FY 1981, entry and five year employees are under the new plan. Pension methodologies for 1979 and 1981 are not comparable. (See text of main report.) Negative pension costs for 1979 are the result of using a hypothetical employee of entry age 21.

9. Permanent Workmen's Compensation disability awards represent expenditures averaged per active employee in the Police Department, Fire Department, General Services Department, and all other employees. FY 1981 figures reflect FY 1979 expenditures, since no more recent data are available. FY 1979 figures reflect FY 1977 expenditures.

10. There are no special city payments for health benefits for retired employees.

11. When an employee retires, the city makes reimbursements equal to the number of accumulated sick days up to and including 112 days at the rate of pay in effect on the date of retirement. Firefighter sick days accumulate on a 12-hour basis, but are reimbursed at a lower rate. Each accumulated day is reimbursed at the rate determined by dividing salary by 261.

12. As of January 1, 1981, police receive $200 per year for uniform maintenance. In addition, the city replaces police uniforms at a cost of $320,000 (FY 1981) per 1,387 employees, or an average cost of $230 per employee. Total police

uniform allowance is $430. Firefighters receive $300 per year for replacement and maintenance costs. (1979 was different. Police officers had to cover their own replacement costs in FY 1979.)

13. Employees are all entitled to 13 paid holidays. If police and fire employees work on a holiday, they receive a premium rate *or* they take another day off. Any payments for holiday work are classified as overtime.

14. Sick leave utilization reflects experience in FY 1980 and FY 1978. Typists and stenographers have been assigned the city-wide average sick leave utilization. Police, fire, and refuse collector utilization is for the Police Department, Fire Department, and General Services Department. For FY 1981, janitor and park worker utilization represents the average taken for blue collar employees. For FY 1979, janitor and park worker utilization is for the Parks and Recreation Department and the Land and Buildings Department.

15. Police and fire receive full salary for unlimited absence due to line-of-duty injury. All other employees receive Workmen's Compensation at the rate of two-thirds of monthly earnings up to a designated maximum. Days lost due to line-of-duty injury are based upon experience from 1977 and 1979, the most recent data available. Averate expenditures for line-of-duty absence are broken down by Police Department, Fire Department, General Services Department, and all other employees. They are then converted to average full paid days lost.

16. Total number of days worked reflects a 261-day work year minus paid time and leave benefits.

17. Hours worked per day is a function of work schedule and lunch policy. Police officers work eight-hour days, while firefighters have four days on (10-hour tours), four days off, four nights on (12-hour tours), and four nights off. This averages 42 hours per week. Typists and stenographers have a 7¾-hour working day.

Police and fire take lunch on call. Refuse collectors are actually paid on a task basis, although it is assumed that the job takes eight hours. No lunch time is included. (However, if they have time to eat within the eight hours and still finish the job, they can.)

18. Premium pay for FY 1981 and FY 1979 is based upon experience in FY 1978, since overtime utilization has not changed significantly over this period. Premium pay reflects average expenditures (as a percent of salary) for overtime and holiday pay per employee by department.

19. Salary trends for refuse collectors are for the journeyman level since the entry level is not readily available for past years. Trends for janitors are for custodian light only (not the weighted average of custodian light and custodian heavy). Salaries for FY 1982 have not yet been determined for the seven job classifications. Firefighters have negotiated FY 1982 salaries as part of a four-year contract, yet this is based upon a formula which requires a yet unknown cost-of-living factor.

SAN DIEGO[1]

POLICE OFFICER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$13,894	$18,013	$18,013	$14,998	$21,564	$21,564
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	396	396	396	496	496	496
Life Insurance[6]	12	12	12	11	11	11
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	245	245	245	245	245	245
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	1,484	1,922	1,907	2,607	3,748	3,748
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	315	315	0	315	315
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	155	155	0	0	227
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	250	250
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days	10	15	20	10	15	20
Holidays[13]	9	9	9	9	9	9
Sick Leave[14]	8.5	8.5	8.5	7.5	7.5	7.5
Line-of-Duty Leave[15]	2.8	2.8	2.8	2.8	2.8	2.8
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[16]	230.7	225.7	220.7	231.7	226.7	221.7
Hours Worked per Day[17]	8.33	8.33	8.33	8.33	8.33	8.33
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,922	1,880	1,838	1,930	1,888	1,847
Premium Pay[18] (not part of total compensation)	1,210	1,569	1,569	1,305	1,876	1,876

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

SAN DIEGO[1]

FIREFIGHTER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$14,602	$17,618	$17,618	$17,418	$20,532	$20,532
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	396	396	396	496	496	496
Life Insurance[6]	12	12	12	11	11	11
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	309	309	309	309	309	309
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	1,560	1,879	1,864	2,649	3,123	3,123
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	318	318	0	318	318
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	236	236	0	0	253
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days	10	15	20	10	15	20
Holidays[13]	9	9	9	9	9	9
Sick Leave[14]	6	6	6	6.57	6.57	6.57
Line-of-Duty Leave[15]	2.6	2.6	2.6	2.6	2.6	2.6
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[16]	233.4	228.4	223.4	232.83	227.83	222.83
Hours Worked per Day[17]	11.2	11.2	11.2	11.2	11.2	11.2
Total Number of Hours Annually	2,614	2,558	2,502	2,608	2,552	2,496
Premium Pay[18] (not part of total compensation)	840	1,013	1,013	1,010	1,191	1,191

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

SAN DIEGO[1]

TYPIST[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$7,540	$10,650	$10,650	$8,658	$12,228	$12,228
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	396	396	396	496	496	496
Life Insurance[6]	12	12	12	11	11	11
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	71	71	71	71	71	71
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	299	371	341	911	1,286	1,286
Social Security	462	653	653	576	813	813
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	51	51	0	51	51
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	51	102	0	0	112
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days	10	15	20	10	15	20
Holidays[13]	9	9	9	9	9	9
Sick Leave[14]	8	8	8	8.2	8.2	8.2
Line-of-Duty Leave[15]	.7	.7	.7	.7	.7	.7
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[16]	223.3	228.3	223.3	233.1	228.1	223.1
Hours Worked per Day[17]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,866	1,826	1,786	1,865	1,825	1,785
Premium Pay[18] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

SAN DIEGO[1]

STENOGRAPHER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$8,070	$11,419	$11,419	$9,276	$13,104	$13,104
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	396	396	396	496	496	496
Life Insurance[6]	12	12	12	11	11	11
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	71	71	71	71	71	71
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	313	390	360	976	1,379	1,379
Social Security	495	700	700	617	871	871
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	51	51	0	51	51
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	55	109	0	0	120
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days	10	15	20	10	15	20
Holidays[13]	9	9	9	9	9	9
Sick Leave[14]	8	8	8	8.2	8.2	8.2
Line-of-Duty Leave[15]	.7	.7	.7	.7	.7	.7
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[16]	233.3	228.3	223.3	233.1	228.1	223.1
Hours Worked per Day[17]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,866	1,826	1,786	1,865	1,825	1,785
Premium Pay[18] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

SAN DIEGO[1]

REFUSE COLLECTOR[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$12,438	$14,539	$14,539	$14,286	$16,692	$16,692
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	396	396	396	496	496	496
Life Insurance[6]	12	12	12	11	11	11
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	288	288	288	288	288	288
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	732	831	795	1,503	1,756	1,756
Social Security	807	943	943	1,005	1,174	1,174
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	142	142	0	142	142
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	29	56	0	0	93
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days	10	15	20	10	15	20
Holidays[13]	9	9	9	9	9	9
Sick Leave[14]	11	11	11	10.1	10.1	10.1
Line-of-Duty Leave[15]	7	7	7	7	7	7
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[16]	224	219	214	224.9	219.9	214.9
Hours Worked per Day[17]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,792	1,752	1,712	1,799	1,759	1,719
Premium Pay[18] (not part of total compensation)	721	843	843	829	968	968

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

SAN DIEGO[1]

JANITOR[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$8,122	$10,275	$10,275	$9,330	$11,808	$11,808
Differential Pay[4]	337	426	426	386	427	427
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	396	396	396	496	496	496
Life Insurance[6]	12	12	12	11	11	11
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	54	54	54	54	54	54
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	532	638	602	1,017	1,287	1,287
Social Security	519	656	656	643	814	814
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	33	33	0	33	33
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	57	114	0	0	109
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days	10	15	20	10	15	20
Holidays[13]	9	9	9	9	9	9
Sick Leave[14]	7.2	7.2	7.2	8.2	8.2	8.2
Line-of-Duty Leave[15]	.9	.9	.9	.9	.9	.9
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[16]	233.9	228.9	223.9	232.9	227.9	222.9
Hours Worked per Day[17]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,871	1,831	1,791	1,863	1,823	1,783
Premium Pay[18] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

SAN DIEGO[1]

PARK WORKER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$9,305	$10,795	$10,795	$10,686	$12,396	$12,396
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	396	396	396	496	496	496
Life Insurance[6]	12	12	12	11	11	11
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	280	280	280	280	280	280
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	575	643	608	1,124	1,304	1,304
Social Security	575	667	667	716	831	831
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	179	179	0	179	179
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	73	147	0	0	123
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days	10	15	20	10	15	20
Holidays[13]	9	9	9	9	9	9
Sick Leave[14]	5.9	5.9	5.9	7.8	7.8	7.8
Line-of-Duty Leave[15]	2.7	2.7	2.7	2.7	2.7	2.7
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[16]	233.4	228.4	223.4	231.5	226.5	221.5
Hours Worked per Day[17]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,867	1,827	1,787	1,852	1,812	1,772
Premium Pay[18] (not part of total compensation)	71	82	82	81	94	94

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

ENTRY LEVEL SALARY TRENDS[19]
SAN DIEGO
1973–1981

Job Title	1973	1974	1975	1976	1977	1978	1979	1980	1981	1982
Police Officer	$10,644	$11,124	$12,060	$12,648	$12,372	$12,876	$13,562	$14,628	$15,648	NA
Firefighter	10,392	10,980	11,772	12,348	13,296	13,968	14,602	15,612	17,016	NA
Typist B	4,884	5,436	5,952	6,228	6,696	7,032	7,363	7,764	8,448	NA
General Stenographer	5,256	5,820	6,372	6,660	7,164	7,512	7,862	8,280	9,036	NA
Refuse Collector	8,556	9,120	9,768	10,296	11,064	11,628	12,168	12,816	13,968	NA
Janitors, Porters, and Cleaners	5,388	5,784	6,192	6,720	7,248	7,596	7,956	8,364	9,120	NA
Park Worker	6,384	6,780	7,272	7,800	8,208	8,616	9,110	9,600	10,452	NA

NOTES

San Diego

1. The fiscal year begins July 1 and ends June 30. The San Diego Personnel Department has decided not to participate in this round of updates and has not verified our results.

2. The following San Diego job titles are comparable to our chosen job classifications. (The exception is that Sanitation Driver I drives a truck as well as collecting and disposing of refuse.)

Urban Institute Class	*Equivalent San Diego Classification*
Police Officer	Police Recruit (four months), Police Officer I, 69.2 (two years), and Police Officer II, 69.3
Firefighter	Firefighter, 46.2
Typist B	Jr. Typist, 56.9 (one year), and Intermediate Typist, 53.5
General Stenographer	Jr. Stenographer, 56.7 (one year), and Intermediate Stenographer, 53.2
Refuse Collector	Sanitation Driver I, 83.4
Janitors, Porters, Cleaners	Custodian I, 38.7 (one year), and Custodian II, 38.9
Park Worker	Groundskeeper, 49.2

3. Salaries represent annual rates in effect as of January 1, 1979 and January 1, 1981. Typist B, General Stenographer, and Janitors all have a junior training classification prior to regular classification. According to the San Diego Personnel Department, these three job titles have an automatic promotion after one year of training at the junior level. These junior classifications will be treated as steps in advancement to the regular classification level. (The Junior Training Classification is for employees with no previous experience. Although the majority of employees for typists, stenographers, and janitors are hired at the Intermediate level, we have defined the entry level employee as the worker with no experience, so the Junior position is appropriate for our purposes.)

Police officers begin as police recruits for four months, and then move to Police Officer I. After two years of training at the Police Officer I level, they automatically move to Police Officer II.

All job classes receive a step increase after the first six months. Since the intent of this study is to reflect *yearly* salary for entry workers, salary is designated as the average of that received for the first six months and the second six months. There are no longevity payments for any San Diego employees.

4. Janitors are the only group (of our job classes) to receive shift differential. Of the janitors in the Buildings Division of the General Services Department, only eight out of 29 workers do not receive the 5 percent shift differential. (This differential is assigned for working at night or "unusual shifts.") This means that

for FY 1981 the average worker receives an additional 3.62 percent of salary for shift differential.

For FY 1979, only nine of 52 workers do not receive the 5 percent shift differential. This means that the average worker receives an additional 4.15 percent of salary for shift differential.

5. As of FY 1981, there are three health insurance plan options, but each costs the city $496 for FY 1981 for a family plan. FY 1979 costs represent those of the Kaiser Plan as of January 1979.

6. Life insurance costs the city $11 per year per employee for FY 1981. This is a slight reduction from the FY 1979 level.

7. Medical payments for line-of-duty injury are covered under Workmen's Compensation. Costs are determined as the average expenditure per active employee in the relevant departments, separated for janitor, refuse collector, park worker, police, fire, and other. The data for 1979 and 1981 reflect experience in 1978, since records have not been kept in this form for the past several years. (San Diego has been in the process of transferring to a computerized system and expects to have FY 1981 data at the end of August 1981.)

8. Pension costs are the employer normal cost contributions for the City Employees' Retirement System of San Diego, General Members, and the City Employees' Retirement System of San Diego, Safety Members. For FY 1981, costs have been increased slightly for police and general members to reflect the fact that the city is picking up a portion of the employee contribution (2.17 percent for police and 1.85 percent for general members). Pension methodologies for 1979 and 1981 are not comparable. (See text of main report.)

9. Permanent disability awards represent expenditures per relevant department divided by the number of active employees for FY 1978. (See Footnote 7.) In addition, all employees hired after October 1, 1978 will have pensions reduced or offset by the amount of Workmen's Compensation disability awards. For this reason, Workmen's Compensation is counted as zero for entry level employees in 1979 and 1981.

10. San Diego does not pay separate health benefits for retired employees.

11. For employees hired before 1975, an employee who leaves after five years receives one-fourth pay for unused sick leave, and an employee who retires receives one-half pay for unused sick leave. For employees hired after 1975 there is no terminal leave pay. Thus, there is no sick leave reimbursement for the entry and five year level employees for 1981 and the entry level employee for 1979.

12. For FY 1981, police officers receive a uniform allowance of $250 per year once they have completed one year as Police Officer I. (Thus, they receive no allowance at the entry level.) There were no uniform allowance payments for police in FY 1979. For firefighters, the city issues and replaces boots and pants as of FY 1980. Because initial issues were made in FY 1980, replacement costs for FY 1981 are minimal.

13. Holidays stand for the number of paid holidays assigned. If an employee is required to come in and work on an assigned holiday, payments for this would be classified as overtime.

14. All city employees are assigned 13 days per year of sick leave, with unlimited accumulation. (This comes to 145.6 hours yearly for firefighters.)

Sick leave taken for 1981 reflects experience in FY 1980 and was obtained from the San Diego City Civil Service Commission "Personnel Statistics" in which sick leave utilization is provided by the department. Figures for police and fire are for the departments as a whole and do not include absence due to line-of-duty injury (since Workmen's Compensation covers police and fire in San Diego). Typist B and General Stenopgrapher represent city-wide averages. Sick leave for park workers is for the entire Park and Recreation Department. Sick leave utilization for refuse collectors is for the Solid Waste (Refuse Collection) Division of the General Services Department, while utilization for the janitors is for the Buildings Division of the General Services Department. The 1979 data reflect these same breakdowns using the 1978 experience.

15. San Diego provides for full compensation for absence for line-of-duty injury under the industrial and injury leave programs for one year. In addition, after one year employees may still be eligible for Workmen's Compensation at less than full pay for absence due to line-of-duty injury. Line-of-duty days lost are based on 1978 experience in the relevant departments. (More recent data are not available.) Total days lost represent the sum of Workmen's Compensation, injury leave days, and industrial leave days.

16. Total number of days worked reflects a 261-day work year minus paid time and leave benefits.

17. Hours worked per day is a function of work schedule and lunch policy. Standard work week hours represent the average work week for which employees receive regular, straight-time earnings.

- *Police Officers.* Police work a 40-hour week and are eligible for shift changes at six-month intervals. In addition, police must report 20 minutes early for line-up and assignment of duty. This is in addition to the 40-hour week and is not made up at the end of the day. The total work week for police is 41.67 hours.
- *Firefighters.* Firefighters work 24-hour shifts and average 56 hours in a calendar week.

None of the employees in the job titles covered receive a paid lunch. Fire and police employees are on call during lunch.

18. Premium pay stands for all payments for time worked in addition to the scheduled work week. This includes payments for working beyond the normal day schedule, or for coming in on holidays when holidays have been assigned to the job class as a whole. Since overtime payments are a function of a given worker's hourly salary rate, overtime is expressed as a percent of salary and then applied

to the salaries of workers at the different longevity levels. 1981 and 1979 overtime usage is estimated using the FY 1978 experience for the relevant departments.

19. Salary trends reflect base salary of entry level workers as of January 1 of each year. This is the starting salary and does not average Step 1 and Step 2 for the first year. Salary trends for police officer represent the first step for the Police Officer I level. (The special recruit position was not started until 1979.) Firefighter salaries for FY 1981 reflect an additional 1.5 percent increase not received by other employees. The Fire Department was the only group that chose not to accept a reduction in employee pension contributions. FY 1982 salaries have not yet been determined for any San Diego job titles.

SAN FRANCISCO[1]

POLICE OFFICER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$17,976	$20,820	$20,820	$20,424	$23,640	$23,640
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	444	444	444	535	535	535
Life Insurance[6]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	424	424	424	652	652	652
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	3,224	7,011	7,018	3,476	12,503	12,503
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	205	205	205	217	217	217
*Health Benefits[10]	180	180	180	314	314	314
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	43	43	0	32	32
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	15	20	10	15	20
Holidays[14]	12	12	12	13	13	13
*Sick Leave[15]	7.4	7.4	7.4	7.9	7.9	7.9
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	21.6	21.6	21.6	9.7	9.7	9.7
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	210	205	200	220.4	215.4	210.4
Hours Worked per Day[18]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,680	1,640	1,600	1,763	1,723	1,683
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	816	945	945	939	1,087	1,087

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

SAN FRANCISCO[1]

FIREFIGHTER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$17,976	$20,820	$20,820	$20,424	$23,640	$23,640
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	444	444	444	535	535	535
Life Insurance[6]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	436	436	436	647	647	647
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	3,233	6,924	6,930	3,476	12,503	12,503
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	125	125	125	225	225	225
*Health Benefits[10]	228	228	228	367	367	367
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	45	45	0	42	42
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	12.32	18.48	24.64	12.32	18.48	24.64
Holidays[14]	14.78	14.78	14.78	16.02	16.02	16.02
Sick Leave[15]	9.36	9.36	9.36	9.12	9.12	9.12
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	21.5	21.5	21.5	15.28	15.28	15.28
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	203.04	196.88	190.72	208.26	202.1	195.94
Hours Worked per Day[18]	9.74	9.74	9.74	9.74	9.74	9.74
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,978	1,918	1,858	2,028	1,968	1,908
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	1,798	2,082	2,082	1,818	2,104	2,104

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

SAN FRANCISCO[1]

TYPIST[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$8,671	$11,908	$11,908	$9,670	$13,011	$13,311
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	444	444	444	535	535	535
Life Insurance[6]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	80	80	80	217	217	217
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	−32	150	150	373	347	355
Social Security	532	730	730	643	865	885
Workmen's Compensation[9]	18	18	18	28	28	28
*Health Benefits[10]	12	12	12	15	15	15
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	15	20	10	15	20
Holidays[14]	12	12	12	13	13	13
*Sick Leave[15]	9.9	9.9	9.9	7	7	7
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	1.53	1.53	1.53	2.5	2.5	2.5
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	227.57	222.57	217.57	228.5	223.5	218.5
Hours Worked per Day[18]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,821	1,781	1,741	1,828	1,788	1,748
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

SAN FRANCISCO[1]

STENOGRAPHER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$9,685	$12,402	$12,402	$10,779	$13,559	$13,859
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	444	444	444	535	535	535
Life Insurance[6]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	80	80	80	217	217	217
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	−35	156	185	416	362	370
Social Security	594	760	896	717	902	922
Workmen's Compensation[9]	18	18	18	28	28	28
*Health Benefits[10]	12	12	12	15	15	15
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	15	20	10	15	20
Holidays[14]	12	12	12	13	13	13
*Sick Leave[15]	9.9	9.9	9.9	7	7	7
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	1.53	1.53	1.53	2.5	2.5	2.5
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	227.57	222.57	217.57	228.5	223.5	218.5
Hours Worked per Day[18]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,821	1,781	1,741	1,828	1,788	1,748
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

SAN FRANCISCO[1]

JANITOR[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$10,530	$12,350	$12,350	$12,750	$15,007	$15,007
Differential Pay[4]	441	517	517	497	585	585
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	444	444	444	535	535	535
Life Insurance[6]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	80	80	80	217	217	217
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	79	516	517	492	416	416
Social Security	673	789	789	881	1,037	1,037
Workmen's Compensation[9]	18	18	18	28	28	28
*Health Benefits[10]	12	12	12	15	15	15
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	15	20	10	15	20
Holidays[14]	12	12	12	13	13	13
Sick Leave[15]	14	14	14	12	12	12
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	1.53	1.53	1.53	2.5	2.5	2.5
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	223.47	218.47	213.47	223.5	218.5	213.5
Hours Worked per Day[18]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,788	1,748	1,708	1,788	1,748	1,708
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

SAN FRANCISCO[1]

PARK WORKER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$13,377	$15,730	$15,730	$15,503	$19,627	$20,071
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	444	444	444	535	535	535
Life Insurance[6]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	80	80	80	217	217	217
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	101	632	632	598	524	536
Social Security	820	964	964	1,031	1,305	1,335
Workmen's Compensation[9]	18	18	18	28	28	28
*Health Benefits[10]	12	12	12	15	15	15
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days[13]	10	15	20	10	15	20
Holidays[14]	12	12	12	13	13	13
Sick Leave[15]	6	6	6	6	6	6
Line-of-Duty Leave[16]	1.53	1.53	1.53	2.5	2.5	2.5
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[17]	231.47	226.47	221.47	229.5	224.5	219.5
Hours Worked per Day[18]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,852	1,812	1,772	1,836	1,796	1,756
Premium Pay[19] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

ENTRY LEVEL SALARY TRENDS[20]
SAN FRANCISCO
1973–1982

Job Title	1973	1974	1975	1976	1977	1978	1979	1980	1981	1982
Police Officer	$13,440	$14,448	$16,044	$16,044	$15,948	$16,452	$17,976	$18,960	$20,424	NA
Firefighter	13,440	14,448	16,044	16,044	15,948	16,452	17,976	18,960	20,424	NA
Typist B	6,732	6,996	7,548	8,064	8,400	8,508	8,476	8,744	9,448	10,336
General Stenographer	7,044	7,308	7,884	8,460	8,064	9,372	9,464	9,761	10,544	11,536
Janitors, Porters and Cleaners	7,044	7,308	7,884	10,260	9,888	10,080	10,296	10,675	12,450	13,050
Park Worker	11,348	11,557	11,557	15,733	13,128	13,128	13,078	13,729	15,138	17,096

NOTES

San Francisco

1. The fiscal year begins July 1 and ends June 30.

2. The following San Francisco job titles are comparable to our chosen job classifications. Since San Francisco has a junior position for typists and stenographers with no experience, this is counted as the beginning step before becoming clerk typists and clerk stenographers. San Francisco contracts out for refuse collection services.

Urban Institute Class	*Equivalent San Francisco Classification*
Police Officer	Police Officer Q-2
Firefighter	Firefighter H-2
Typist B	Jr. Clerk Typist, 1422 and Clerk Typist, 1424
General Stenographer	Junior Clerk Stenographer, 1442 (2 years) and Clerk Stenographer, 1444
Janitors, Porters, Cleaners	Custodian, 2708
Park Worker	Assistant Gardener, 3410

3. Salaries represent annual rates in effect as of January 1, 1979 and January 1, 1981. In San Francisco it takes six months for a civilian employee to advance to the next step. (Takes a full year for police and fire.) Since the intent of this study is to reflect *yearly* salary for entry workers, salary is designated as the average of that received for the first six months and the second six months for civilian employees.

For typists and stenographers, the regular clerk position requires two years of experience. Since we are assuming our employee has no experience, we are allowing two years in the junior positions and the remaining time in the clerk position. For 1981, the clerk typist and stenographer do not reach their maximum salary step until after 5½ years of service. For these positions, the salary for the employee with five years of experience is the average of the top two steps. The 20 year clerk typist and stenographer are at the top step.

For assistant gardeners, an additional two steps were added effective FY 1981. The assistant gardener's annual salary after five years of experience represents the average of the top two steps (Steps 6 and 7). The 20 year assistant gardener is at the top step. The janitor with five years of experience is already at the top step.

4. There are no shift differential payments for police and fire, and park worker payments are minimal.

- *Janitor.* In 1980, 28 out of 45 janitors in the Public Works Department are on night shift and receive an additional 6¼ percent of base rate for an eight-hour day. The average shift differential per employee is 3.9 percent of salary. As of 1979, 53 out of 79 janitors in the Public Works Department are on night shift at the same rate, averaging 4.19 percent of salary.

5. City health insurance costs are identical for the single and family rate. There are several health plans and employees can select which one they want. The city pays the same amount for each plan, but the amount paid by the employee varies by plan and number of people covered.

6. There is no city cost for life insurance.

7. Workmen's Compensation covers medical payments for line-of-duty injuries for all city employees. Figures represent average cost per employee for 1980 and 1978, broken out by Police Department, Fire Department, and all others.

8. Pension costs are the employer normal cost contributions for the Employees' Retirement System, Police and Fire, old and new systems and the City and County of San Francisco Employees' Retirement System, Miscellaneous Members, old and new systems. For both 1981 and 1979, the entry level employee is under the new system while the five and 20 year employees are under the old system.

Pension methodologies for 1979 and 1981 are not comparable. (See text of main report.) For 1981, the new miscellaneous system pension costs for entry level employees are somewhat higher than the old system costs, even though the old system provides more generous benefits. This is because employee contribution rates end up being higher under the old system using our set of economic assumptions. Negative pension costs for 1979 reflect the use of a hypothetical employee of entry age 21.

9. Workmen's Compensation covers permanent disability awards for uniformed and civilian employees. Average expenditures per active employee are provided for the Police Department, Fire Department, and all other employees for 1980 and 1978.

Civilian employees can receive both pension and Workmen's Compensation payments. Uniformed employees receiving *disability* pensions do not receive Workmen's Compensation, unless Workmen's Compensation is for a different injury. Most of the Workmen's Compensation permanent awards payments for police and fire reported here are for sworn employees who receive regular service pensions in addition to Workmen's Compensation. Thus, Workmen's Compensation should not be offset against pension costs.

10. Health costs for retired employees reported for 1981 are calculated using an actuarial approximation which reflects costs per active employee, broken down for police, fire, and other employees using 1980 experience. Costs are not comparable between 1979 and 1981 since different entry age assumptions are used for hypothetical employees in the two periods.

For both 1981 and 1979, retiree health costs are based upon weighted costs for employees receiving no Medicare, Part B of Medicare only, and full Medicare.

11. Any sick leave earned after December 5, 1978 is not reimbursable upon retirement, so sick leave reimbursement is counted as zero for 1979 and 1981. For sick leave earned prior to December 5, 1978, *retired* employees receive a reimbursement for unused sick leave up to the 130 day maximum accumulation at the rate of 100 percent of current salary if they had been with the city for 15 or more

years, and at 50 percent of current salary if they had been with the city for 6–15 years. Up to and including five years of service, they receive a reimbursement of 33.3 percent for unused sick leave.

12. Initial uniforms are issued by the Police and Fire Departments, and then replacement clothing is supplied as necessary. Replacement costs apply to five and 20 year experienced employees only.

- *Police.* For FY 1980, $54,000 was spent for uniform replacement covering 1,700 uniformed officers (excluding new recruits). This averages $32 per person. For FY 1978, $47,800 was spent on uniform replacement for 1,000 officers, averaging $43 per person.
- *Fire.* The Fire Department spent $63,284 on uniform replacement for FY 1980. With 1,506 uniformed employees, this averages $42 per person. For FY 1978 the Fire Department spent $86,121 on uniform replacement. With 1,525 uniformed employees, this averages $56 per person.

13. There have been no changes in vacation days between 1979 and 1981.

14. Employees receive 13 paid holidays. (One floating holiday was added for FY 1981.) If required to work on a holiday, the employee receives additional payments at straight time for police and fire and time-and-a-half for other employees. This is classified as overtime for our purposes.

15. Employees receive 13 paid sick days per year, with a maximum accumulation of 130 days. Utilization data reflect rates for sworn police employees, sworn fire employees, and the Public Works Department (janitors). Utilization for park workers was estimated by the Parks and Recreation Department. Sick leave for typist and stenographer for 1981 was taken from a city-wide sick leave utilization study based upon 1978 experience. This information was not available at the time that the 1979 data were published. Instead, 1979 sick leave utilization for typists and stenographers represents the average of that reported by the other departments interviewed.

16. Police and fire employees receive up to one year's full pay from the city for absence due to line-of-duty injury. After one year, police officers and firefighters may receive temporary disability payments through Workmen's Compensation. Line-of-duty days lost for police and fire are based upon data provided by the departments. Police data for 1981 reflect the annualized FY 1981 experience (to date). This is considerably lower than the 1979 figures, yet there is no apparent reason for the discrepancy.

Other employees receive Workmen's Compensation for temporary absence due to line-of-duty injuries, at the rate of 66⅔ percent of pay up to a maximum amount. Figures reflect 1980 and 1978 experience for civilian employees (excluding teachers), translated to full paid days lost.

17. Total number of days worked reflects a 261-day work year minus paid time and leave benefits.

18. Hours worked per day is a function of work schedule and lunch policy. Standard work week hours reflect the average work week for which employees receive regular, straight-time earnings.

Police work a standard 40-hour week with roll call included in the work week period. Firefighters' work schedule consists of nine 24-hour shifts during a 31-day cycle, yielding a 48.7-hour work week. Police and fire employees eat lunch on call and are not credited with a paid lunch period.

19. Premium pay stands for all payments for time worked in addition to the scheduled work week. This includes payments for working beyond the normal day schedule, or for coming in on holidays when holidays have been assigned to the job class as a whole. Figures represent average payments (as a percent of salary) for uniformed Police Department employees and sworn Fire Department employees for 1978 and 1980.

Police officers may choose between reimbursement at the straight time rate or compensatory time off for holidays. There is also lower manning on holidays, so some officers do get the day off. Fire employees almost always take the extra compensation in lieu of holiday time off. The city budgets holiday pay as 5.19 percent of salary. (This is not considered part of base salary for our purposes.)

20. Salary trends reflect base salary of entry level employees as of January 1 of each calendar year. Salaries for entry level police officers and firefighters went down between 1976 and 1977. Salaries for entry level park workers and janitors also dropped during this period. (In FY 1979, salaries were lower than in FY 1978 for typists and park workers.) Trend data represent salaries in the first six months for all job titles but police and fire. Salaries for FY 1982 are not determined in advance for police and fire.

WASHINGTON, D.C.[1]

POLICE OFFICER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$14,558	$17,614	$22,420	$16,356	$19,789	$25,189
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	707	707	707	796	796	796
Life Insurance[6]	78	92	115	88	101	129
*Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	265	265	265	264	264	264
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	5,343	6,454	7,720	7,538	10,896	12,968
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	39	39	0	45	45
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days	13	20	26	13	20	26
Holidays[13]	10	10	10	10	10	10
*Sick Leave[14]	10.1	10.1	10.1	10.1	10.1	10.1
*Line-of-Duty Leave[15]	7.4	7.4	7.4	7.4	7.4	7.4
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[16]	220.5	213.5	207.5	220.5	213.5	207.5
Hours Worked per Day[17]	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,654	1,601	1,556	1,654	1,601	1,556
Premium Pay[18] (not part of total compensation)	466	564	717	638	772	982

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

WASHINGTON, D.C.[1]

FIREFIGHTER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$14,558	$17,614	$22,420	$16,356	$19,789	$25,189
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	707	707	707	796	796	796
Life Insurance[6]	78	92	115	88	101	129
Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	334	334	334	365	365	365
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	6,495	7,853	9,382	7,538	10,896	12,968
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
Workmen's Compensation[9]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	40	40	0	59	59
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days	13	20	26	13	20	26
Holidays[13]	12.5	12.5	12.5	12.5	12.5	12.5
*Sick Leave[14]	15.52	15.52	15.52	2.7	2.7	2.7
Line-of-Duty Leave[15]	(in sick leave)			7.2	7.2	7.2
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[16]	219.98	212.98	206.98	225.6	218.6	212.6
Hours Worked per Day[17]	9.6	9.6	9.6	9.6	9.6	9.6
Total Number of Hours Annually	2,112	2,045	1,987	2,166	2,099	2,041
Premium Pay[18] (not part of total compensation)	1,940	2,348	2,986	2,028	2,454	2,921

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

WASHINGTON, D.C.[1]

TYPIST[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$7,422	$8,410	$9,645	$8,615	$9,452	$10,842
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	707	707	707	796	796	796
Life Insurance[6]	46	51	55	51	55	60
*Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	26	26	26	54	54	54
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	539	613	707	2,006	2,200	2,524
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Workmen's Compensation[9]	75	75	75	158	158	158
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days	13	20	26	13	20	26
Holidays[13]	10	10	10	10	10	10
Sick Leave[14]	11.7	11.7	11.7	12	12	12
*Line-of-Duty Leave[15]	1	1	1	1.3	1.3	1.3
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[16]	225.3	218.3	212.3	224.7	217.7	211.7
Hours Worked per Day[17]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,802	1,746	1,698	1,798	1,742	1,694
Premium Pay[18] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

WASHINGTON, D.C.[1]

STENOGRAPHER[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$8,366	$9,482	$10,877	$9,399	$10,651	$12,216
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	707	707	707	796	796	796
Life Insurance[6]	51	55	60	55	60	69
*Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	26	26	26	54	54	54
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	607	691	796	2,188	2,480	2,844
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Workmen's Compensation[9]	75	75	75	158	158	158
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days	13	20	26	13	20	26
Holidays[13]	10	10	10	10	10	10
Sick Leave[14]	11.7	11.7	11.7	12	12	12
*Line-of-Duty Leave[15]	1	1	1	1.3	1.3	1.3
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[16]	225.3	218.3	212.3	224.7	217.7	211.7
Hours Worked per Day[17]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,802	1,746	1,698	1,798	1,742	1,694
Premium Pay[18] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

WASHINGTON, D.C.[1]

REFUSE COLLECTOR[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$11,845	$13,041	$13,540	$13,697	$15,100	$15,622
Differential Pay[4]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	707	707	707	796	796	796
Life Insurance[6]	65	69	74	74	83	83
*Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	73	73	73	125	125	125
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	1,397	1,542	1,613	3,189	3,515	3,637
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Workmen's Compensation[9]	192	192	192	338	338	338
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days	13	20	26	13	20	26
Holidays[13]	10	10	10	10	10	10
Sick Leave[14]	12	12	12	13	13	13
*Line-of-Duty Leave[15]	2	2	2	2.8	2.8	2.8
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[16]	224	217	211	222.2	215.2	209.2
Hours Worked per Day[17]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,792	1,736	1,688	1,778	1,722	1,674
Premium Pay[18] (not part of total compensation)	128	141	146	148	163	168

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

WASHINGTON, D.C.[1]

JANITOR[2]

COMPONENTS OF TOTAL COMPENSATION

	1979 Annual Compensation			1981 Annual Compensation		
	Entry	5 Year	20 Year	Entry	5 Year	20 Year
Payroll						
Wages[3]	$9,360	$10,316	$10,691	$10,421	$11,482	$11,898
Differential Pay[4]	702	774	802	782	861	892
Insurance Benefits						
Health Insurance[5]	707	707	707	796	796	796
Life Insurance[6]	55	60	60	60	65	65
*Medical, Line-of-Duty[7]	26	26	26	54	54	54
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Retirement Benefits						
*Pension Cost[8]	1,105	1,222	1,281	2,426	2,673	2,770
Social Security	0	0	0	0	0	0
*Workmen's Compensation[9]	75	75	75	158	158	158
Health Benefits[10]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Annuity Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sick Leave Reimbursement[11]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Union Welfare Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Benefits						
Uniform Allowance[12]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Time and Leave Benefits						
Vacation Days	13	20	26	13	20	26
Holidays[13]	10	10	10	10	10	10
Sick Leave[14]	13	13	13	13	13	13
*Line-of-Duty Leave[15]	1	1	1	1.3	1.3	1.3
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Number of Days Worked[16]	224	217	211	223.7	216.7	210.7
Hours Worked per Day[17]	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total Number of Hours Annually	1,792	1,736	1,688	1,790	1,734	1,686
Premium Pay[18] (not part of total compensation)	0	0	0	0	0	0

*These figures are not comparable for 1979 and 1981.

TRENDS IN ENTRY LEVEL SALARY[19]
WASHINGTON, D.C.
1973–1981

Job Title	1973	1974	1975	1976	1977	1978	1979	1980	1981	1982
Police Officer	$10,000	$10,000	$11,600	$12,296	$12,890	$13,799	$14,558	$15,577	$16,356	NA
Firefighter	10,000	10,000	11,600	12,296	12,890	13,799	14,558	15,577	16,356	NA
Typist B	5,166	5,432	5,996	6,296	6,572	7,035	7,422	8,128	8,615	NA
General Stenographer	5,828	6,128	6,764	7,102	7,408	7,930	8,366	8,952	9,399	NA
Refuse Collector	7,342	7,696	8,923	9,506	10,504	11,398	11,606	12,771	13,416	NA
Janitor	6,032	7,155	7,405	7,550	8,299	8,694	9,172	9,739	10,212	NA

NOTES

Washington, D.C.

1. The fiscal year begins October 1 and ends September 30.

2. There is no park worker category because parks in the District are mostly controlled by the federal government. The following Washington, D.C., job classifications are comparable to our selected titles. (Part-time cleaners actually work only 20 rather than 40 hours per week, but salaries, leave time, etc. ave been put on a 40-hour basis for comparability purposes.)

Urban Institute Class	*Equivalent D.C. Classification*
Police Officer	Police Private, CL-1 (includes academy)
Firefighter	Fire Private, CL-1
Typist, Class B	GS-2
General Stenographer	GS-3
Refuse Collector	Refuse Collector, TG-4 (3502 series)
Janitors, Porters, Cleaners	WG-1, Part-time Cleaners

3. Wages represent annual rates in effect as of January 1, 1979 and January 1, 1981. Most jobs have step increases after the first year, but for janitors and refuse collectors it takes only six months to reach Step 2. For these jobs, yearly salary for entry workers is designated as the average of that received in the first six months and the second six months.

Employees progress from one step to another according to time served, but only if "their performance has been satisfactory." The Police Department, Fire Department, and Sanitation Department were contacted to determine how many workers in the past five years failed to obtain their scheduled step increases. Since the few individuals in each case were either fired or later received the step increase, it is assumed that all individuals with five years and 20 years of experience in the following job classes are at the scheduled fifth year and twentieth year step level.

4. Janitors are the only group to receive shift differentials. One-third of the janitors receive a 7.5 percent shift differential for night work and another one-half receive a 10 percent differential for night work. This averages to 7.5 percent shift differential per person. This has not changed between FY 1979 and FY 1981.

5. Health insurance payments represent the average premium paid for family plans for the three plan options with the highest enrollments as of January 1981. This is determined by taking the current premium costs for the family plan options offered under Blue Cross/Blue Shield, Aetna, and Group Health.

6. Life insurance costs are determined by rounding base salary to the next higher $1,000 and adding $2,000. Employer contribution is $4.608 for each $1,000 of the above sum and applies to both FY 1981 and FY 1979.

7. In addition to health insurance coverage, the city provides coverage for medical and hospital expenses for work-related illness or injury for police officers and firefighters. (Work-related injury or illness for other job classes is covered by Workmen's Compensation.)

- *Police Officers.* In FY 1980, $1,053,263 was spent on the medical clinic and outside medical payments for the Police Department $522,181 for outside medical bills and prescriptions and $532,082 for clinic salary and other expenses. With 3,994 uniformed officers in FY 1980 this averages $264 per person. In FY 1978, $1,098,757 was spent on the medical clinic and outside medical payments for the Police Department $589,055 for outside medical bills and prescriptions and $509,702 for clinic salary and other expenses. With 4,141 uniformed officers in FY 1978 this averages $265 per person.
- *Firefighters.* In FY 1980, the Fire Department reports spending a total of $220,441 for outside medical costs and prescriptions. In addition, $211,997 was spent on clinic salaries and other clinic expenses. The total cost comes to $432,438. With 1,185 uniformed employees in the Fire Department in FY 1980, this averages $365 per person. In FY 1978, the Fire Department reports spending a total of $288,861 for outside medical costs and prescriptions. In addition, $143,132 was spent on clinic salaries and other clinic expenses. The total cost comes to $431,993. With 1,292 uniformed employees in the Fire Department in FY 1978, this averages $334 per person.
- *Other Employees.* For other employees, work-related injury medical costs are covered under Workmen's Compensation. Expenditures represent average cost per person in the Environmental Services Department (refuse collectors) and all other departments. Data for FY 1979 are based upon FY 1978 experience. Data for FY 1981 are based upon total Workmen's Compensation expenditures for FY 1980. Because breakdowns are not available for FY 1980 for temporary, permanent, and medical payments under Workmen's Compensation, we have assumed that the distribution of 1980 payments is the same as it was for FY 1978. Total FY 1980 expenditures were prorated using the FY 1978 distributions.

8. Pension costs are the employer normal cost contributions for the Civil Service Retirement System and the District of Columbia Policemen and Firemen's Retirement System. For FY 1981, entry level police and fire employees fall under the new District of Columbia Policemen and Firemen's Retirement System. Pension methodologies for 1979 and 1981 are not comparable. (See text of main report.)

9. Workmen's Compensation for permanent disability awards is provided for our five civilian titles. See Footnote 7 for a description of Workmen's Compensation average expenditure data.

10. The city makes no payments for health insurance for retired employees.

11. There is no reimbursement for unused sick leave.

12. Costs for uniforms are as follows:

- *Police Officers.* In FY 1980 a total of $180,000 was spent to replace uniforms for 3,994 uniformed police officers, at an average cost of $45 per person. For FY 1978 a total of $161,000 was spent to replace uniforms for 4,141 uniformed officers, at an average cost of $39.
- *Firefighters.* In FY 1980 a total of $70,493 was spent to replace uniforms for 1,185 uniformed Fire Department employees, at an average cost of $59 per person. In FY 1978 a total of $52,306 was spent to replace uniforms for 1,292 uniformed fire employees, at an average cost of $40 per person.

13. Holidays stand for the number of paid holidays assigned. If an employee is required to come in and work on an assigned holiday, payments for this work would be classified as premium pay.

14. Firefighters receive a maximum of 10.4 12-hour sick days per year. All other titles receive 13 assigned days. Accumulation is unlimited, but there is no sick leave reimbursement for any job class.

Sick leave utilization is approximated for refuse collectors and janitors. (Assumed they use all or almost all of their available sick leave.) Sick leave for typist and stenographer is estimated by taking the average utilization for police, refuse collector, and janitor.

Sick leave utilization for police officers is not available for FY 1980, so FY 1978 figures are used for 1979 and 1981. These represent average paid regular sick days per man year for uniformed Police Department employees. Sick leave for firefighters is the average for uniformed Fire Department employees for FY 1978 and FY 1980. FY 1978 figures include both sick and line-of-duty injury leave days, since these could not be separated.

15. Uniformed employees receive unlimited line-of-duty absence days paid at full salary. Figures for police are the average days lost for uniformed employees in the Police Department for FY 1978. (More recent data are not available.) For firefighters, average line-of-duty days lost is reported for uniformed Fire Department employees for FY 1980 and is included as part of the sick leave figure for FY 1978.

When nonuniformed employees are temporarily absent due to a work-related injury, the city pays Workmen's Compensation instead of salary at the rate of two-thirds of regular salary for single employees and 75 percent of salary for dependents. (There is no ceiling for payments.) See Footnote 7 for a description of Workmen's Compensation expenditure data.

16. Total number of days worked reflects a 261-day work year minus paid time and leave benefits.

17. Hours worked per day is a function of work schedule and lunch policy. Standard work week hours reflect the average work week for which employees receive regular, straight-time earnings.

- *Police Officers.* Police work a 40-hour week and rotate shifts monthly. This is counted as an eight-hour day, 261 days per year.

- *Firefighters.* "The work schedule for firefighters is based on a cycle of 10- and 14-hour shifts (8:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. and 6:00 p.m. to 8:00 a.m.). The cycle begins with three 10-hour days, followed by three 14-hour nights, followed by 72 hours off duty. An additional 24 hours off duty is provided periodically to keep the average at 48 hours per week."
- *Janitors, Porters, and Cleaners.* Part-time cleaners work in three shifts, 8:00 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., 4:00 p.m. to 12:00 p.m., and 12:00 a.m. to 8:00 a.m. Each employee works only half a shift, or a 20-hour week. Compensation is expressed on a 40-hour week basis, however.

Police officers are assigned a 30-minute paid lunch period since they do not have to respond to calls. Other titles do not receive paid lunch. (Firefighters are on call.)

18. Premium pay stands for all payments for time worked in addition to the scheduled work week. This includes payments for working beyond the normal day schedule, or for coming in on holidays when holidays have been assigned to the job class as a whole. Figures for police officers and firefighters are for FY 1980 and FY 1978 and reflect the average expenditures (as a percent) for uniformed employees in the respective departments. Premium pay for refuse collectors reflects FY 1978 experience.

19. Salary trends reflect base salary of entry level employees as of January 1 of each calendar year. For janitors and refuse collectors these figures represent salary for the first six months rather than for the entire first year. FY 1982 salaries have not yet been determined for the seven job classifications.